

LEARNING FROM HER STORY:
QUALITATIVE RESEARCH ON FEMALE PASTORS' LIFE STORIES AS TEACHING
RESOURCES FOR THEOLOGICAL EDUCATION IN TAIWAN

A Dissertation
presented to
the Faculty of
Claremont School of Theology

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Philosophy

by
Yu-Hui Chang
May 2016

This dissertation completed by

Yu-Hui Chang

has been presented to and accepted by the
faculty of Claremont School of Theology in
partial fulfillment of the requirements of the

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Faculty Committee

Frank Rogers, Jr. Chairperson

Sheryl A. Kujawa-Holbrook Committee Member

Rosemary Radford Ruether Committee Member

Dean of the Faculty

Sheryl A. Kujawa-Holbrook

May 2016

ABSTRACT

LEARNING FROM HER STORY: QUALITATIVE RESEARCH ON FEMALE PASTORS' LIFE STORIES AS TEACHING RESOURCES FOR THEOLOGICAL EDUCATION IN TAIWAN

by

Yu-Hui Chang

This is a qualitative research study about the life stories of female ministers in Taiwan. The purpose of this research is to learn about female pastors' experiences of pastoring in Taiwan and to submit these accounts to theological educators as teaching resources to teach and apply in seminaries. This is also pioneering research since no one has done qualitative research about this topic before and suggested how it might inform future theological education in Taiwan, particularly of women. Nor has anyone related actual theological education of women in Taiwan and women's theories and female pedagogy in theological education.

This dissertation includes a research plan and discusses methods applied in this research. It presents a literature review of women's theories and theological education, interview data, and educational applications and suggestions for theological education in Taiwan. The research methods applied in this qualitative research are mainly based on the tradition of biography and phenomenological study since the data includes both Taiwanese female clergies' life stories and their experiences which contain the data of some phenomena. The literature reviews include the theories of women's psychology and neuroscience studies and the research of women's pedagogy and spiritual formation in theological education. Because my background is in the Presbyterian

Church in Taiwan (PCT), I collected the data of female Taiwanese PCT clergy members' life stories. The educational applications and suggestions for theological education in Taiwan follow the representation and analysis of the data. The educational applications and suggestions I suggest connect the life stories and experiences of female pastors to the women's theories relating to theological education for female learners.

This qualitative research also contextualizes the US literature in the Taiwanese context. The findings show that Taiwanese female ministers' experiences, both positive and negative ones, include very helpful practical information that theological educators can usefully integrate into their teaching to better prepare female seminarians for ministry.

CONTENTS

List of Tables and Figures	x
Chapter	
1. Introduction	1
2. Research Plan and Methods Applied in this Study	5
Research Plan of this Study.....	5
Research Methods Chosen for this Study.....	8
Research Methods Applied in this Study.....	9
The Tradition of Biography.....	9
Research Forms and Theories Applied in the Tradition of Biography	
The Procedures of the Research in the Tradition of Biography	
Analysis and Presentation of the Research Data in the Tradition of Biography	
The Tradition of Phenomenological Study.....	17
Approaches in the Tradition of Phenomenological Study	
Research Procedures of in the Tradition of Phenomenological Study	
Analyzing and Presenting the Research Data in the Tradition of	
Phenomenological Study	
3. Literature Review on Women's Theories: Psychology and Neuroscience.....	29
The Theories of Psychological Development of Women.....	29
Literature Review of Women's Psychological Development.....	29
Carol Gilligan's Research	
Robert Kegan's Theory	
Other Psychologists' Contributions	
The Relationship with Others and Self.....	35
The Relationship with Others.....	36
Realizing the Differences among Others	
Accepting the Varieties of Others	
Building the Alternative Views for Others' Differences	
The Relationship with Self.....	44
Recognizing the True Self	
Accepting the True Self	
Revealing the True Self	
Neuroscience Studies about Women.....	52

The Development, Organization, and Working System of the Brain.....	52
Bottom-to-Top Organization	
Back-to-Front Organization of the Cortex	
Right-to-Left Organization of the Cortex	
Neuroscientists' Perspectives on Gender Differences.....	59
Structural and Organization Differences	
Behavior and Cognitive Differences	
Other Views on Gender Differences of Neuroscience	
4. Literature Review on the Theories of Women's Pedagogy and Spiritual Formation in Theological Education.....	70
Literatures of Women's Pedagogy and Spiritual Formation.....	70
The Pioneer Educator and Following Women Pedagogy Researchers	
Other Feminist Educators and Theologians and Their Assertions	
The Contribution of Female Spiritual Development Theory	
Teaching Women in Theological Education.....	77
Dialogue Process – A Way for Women to Voice Their Inner Thoughts	
A Supporting Group – Strength for Women to Transform	
Alternative Space – An Opening for Women to Learn More	
Aesthetic Teaching – An Artist Manner for Women to be Authentic	
Women's Spiritual Growth within Theological Education.....	96
Being a Listener – For the Voice Needs to Be Heard	
Being a Supporter – For the Relationships Need to Be Connected	
Being an Authentic Woman – For Authentic Self Needs to Be Revealed	
Being an Artist – For Creativity Needs to Be Empowered	
5. The Life Stories and Experiences of Female Ministers in Taiwan.....	108
Introduction to the Taiwanese Context	
Taiwanese General Context: Population Analysis and Religious Context	
The Taiwanese Women's Context: The Influences of Traditional Views and the Rise of Women's Movements	
The PCT Context of Theological Education and Female Pastors	
Her Stories.....	118
The Stories of Married Han Tribe Female Ministers.....	119

Story 1: Bonnie – A Lady Finding Balance between Family and Ministry	
Story 2: Tiffany – A Young Mother Trying to Fulfill Multiple Roles in the Ministry	
Story 3: Jenny – Finding her Identity in the Ministry	
Story 4: Wendy – Facing Gender Inequality in her Ministry	
The Stories of Married Indigenous Tribe Female Ministers.....	136
Story 5: Lynn – A Pastor with a Mother’s Heart	
Story 6: Isabella – A Dedicated and Brilliant Minister in the Village	
Story 7: Kirsten – A Young Female Pastor Earning Credits from the Male Elders	
Story 8: Holly – A Tough Woman Who Conquered Difficulties in her Ministry	
The Stories of Single Han Tribe Female Ministers.....	160
Story 9: Yolanda – Her Sufferings in Life Became the Blessings in her Ministry	
Story 10: Yvonne – A City Girl Adjusting to Country Life	
Story 11: Faith – From Ministering Alone to Team Work	
Story 12: Lily – Facing the Patriarchal Culture in the Church	
What We Learned from their Stories	189
The Analysis of Interviewees’ Background.....	189
The Advantages and Disadvantages/ Challenges in their Ministries.....	191
The Advantages that the Female Pastors Find in their Ministries	
The Disadvantages/ Challenges that the Female Pastors Find in their Ministries	
Their Expectations for Theological Education.....	209
6. Educational Applications of this Research and Suggestions for	
Theological Education in Taiwan.....	221
A Summary of Teaching Concepts from Women’s Theories.....	221
Educational Applications for Theological Educators.....	224
Be a Listener before Being a Speaker	
Be a Supporter before Being a Teacher	
Be Liberated before Liberating Others	
Educational Suggestions for Theological Schools/ Seminaries.....	229
For Seminarians: Improve/ Increase the Courses about Practical Theology	
For Ministers: Enhance Continuing Education	
With Churches: Build up Good Relationships/ Partnerships	
7. Conclusion.....	236
The Challenges of this Research	
Research Limitations	

Further Research Directions/ Plans	
Appendix.....	243
A. Informed Consent Form	
B. English Translation of Interviewees' Primary Data	
Bibliography.....	286

LIST OF TABLES AND FIGURES

Table

1. Data analysis and representation in the tradition of biography.....	16-17
2. Moustakas' model of representing research data.....	26
3. Data analysis and representation in Phenomenological Study.....	27-28
4. The gender ratio of the students enrolled at Taiwan Theological College and Seminary.....	116
5. The interviewees' information.....	190-191
6. The advantages and disadvantages/challenges for female pastors in the ministry.....	192-193
7. Interviewees' expectation of theological education.....	209-211

ABBREVIATIONS

B. A. – Bachelor of Art

M. A. – Master of Art

M. Div. – Master of Divinity

PCT – Presbyterian Church in Taiwan

PK – Pastor's kid

TTCS – Taiwan Theological College and Seminary

WWK – Women's Ways of Knowing

Chapter 1

Introduction

This dissertation is a qualitative research study of theological education for teaching female seminarians in Taiwan. Certainly there are already books that recount the life stories of faithful Christian women or female ministers in Taiwan. However, none of them relates these women's experiences to any feminist theories or theories of theological education for female seminarians. In addition there are no qualitative studies either in English or in Chinese that relate the theories of women's psychology, pedagogy, and spiritual formation to theological education in Taiwan. This is because the context and theological learning environment in Taiwan does not encourage or inspire people, especially women, to do so. The Taiwanese context is influenced by patriarchal culture and Christians are a minority in Taiwan. Though there are several people who have earned a master's degree in Christian Education and are teaching in other non-Presbyterian seminaries in Taiwan, none of them is focused on feminist issues. Anyone who is interested in learning more about feminist spirituality and women's theories encounters a slew of difficulties. First of all, they are limited by the learning environment because they cannot find professors to study with in

Taiwan who are competent in these fields. Those who wish to pursue studies from a feminist perspective overseas, in addition to considering their mastery of a foreign language, also need to bear in mind the financial costs. Given these obstacles, it is small wonder there are so few scholars of women's learning theories and female spirituality in the field of theology in Taiwan.

Currently, of the eighteen otherwise excellent faculty members at my home seminary, Taiwan Theological College and Seminary (TTCS), one of the seminaries of the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (PCT), there is no professor whose specialty is in Christian/Religious Education.¹ Of the faculty members, only one third (six) are female.² Female seminarians studying at TTCS therefore are not receiving a theological education that focuses on religious education and female spiritual development. In their training to become church leaders, they also lack female pastors as role models. Those women who have already graduated from seminary and are full-time pastors in local churches do not have opportunities to go back to seminary and share their experiences with current female seminarians, because neither the seminary professors nor the female local pastors make the

¹ "Faculty," 台灣神學院[Taiwan Theological College and Seminary], accessed May 9, 2016, https://web.archive.org/web/20160509172506/http://www.taitheo.org/about_us/faculty.html.

² "Faculty," 台灣神學院[Taiwan Theological College and Seminary], accessed May 9, 2016, https://web.archive.org/web/20160509172506/http://www.taitheo.org/about_us/faculty.html.

effort to connect female pastors' experiences to theological education. Therefore, some of the female seminarians are taking the initiative and finding opportunities themselves to meet female pastors and learn from their grassroots experience what they are not being taught at seminary.

In light of such lacunae, this dissertation therefore focuses specifically on relating different female theories to the life stories and experiences of female ministers and finding the educational applications to theological education for female seminarians in Taiwan. The purpose of this research is to provide a helpful reference to theological education for female seminarians in Taiwan. This dissertation includes a research plan and methods applied in this research, reviews of literature on women's theories and theological education, interview data from Taiwanese women clergy, and suggestions on how to apply theories of theological education and the findings of this dissertation's research in Taiwan.

Following a description of the research plan, chapter 2 outlines the research methods applied in this qualitative research. The studies of qualitative research methods are based on the five traditions of qualitative research outlined by John W. Creswell, a Professor of Educational Psychology at the University of Nebraska-Lincoln.³ Chapter 3

³ John W. Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Traditions*, 1st ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 1998), 27-45.

reviews literature on women's theories, including women's psychology and neuroscience. The literature reviews on the research pertaining to women's pedagogy and spiritual formation in theological education are in chapter 4.

Preceding the presentation of the interview data, in chapter 5 I introduce the reader to the Taiwanese context. The interview data itself includes the life stories of twelve female pastors who are sorted into three groups: the married ministers of the Han tribe, married ministers from indigenous tribes, and single ministers of the Han tribe. The third section of the chapter then follows with data analysis.

In chapter 6, I connect the interview data with the two literature reviews in chapters 3 and 4 to suggest some educational applications of my findings to theological education for women in Taiwan. The conclusion in chapter 7 notes the limitations of my research and makes suggestions of possible directions for future research that could build on mine. The informed consent form for interviewees and the English translations of interviews are in the Appendix. It is my hope that Taiwanese theological education, especially for female seminarians, will benefit from the contributions of these female ministers' life stories and ministry experiences, as well as from North American literature that focuses on women's needs in and contributions to theological education.

Chapter 2

Research Plan and Methods Applied in this Study

The first part of this chapter describes the research plan of this qualitative research on the life stories and experiences of Taiwanese female pastors. The second part explains the choice of research methods for this qualitative study. The last part contains assessments of the research methods applied in this study and illustrations of how the research methods were applied.

Research Plan of this Study

In this dissertation, because my background is in the PCT, I collected the data of life stories from female Taiwanese PCT clergy. The female Taiwanese PCT clergy I interviewed for this research project included female evangelists (the position women hold before receiving ordination, according to the orders and rules of the PCT), associate pastors, and senior pastors aged between 30 and 65 in Taiwan.

According to Lyn Richards, the director of Research Services at QSR International, Melbourne, to collect data for qualitative researches could be “wordy, unstructured, amorphous, and full of possibly significant issues that link in apparently different ways to

a lot of other issues in different interviews.”⁴ One of the methods of collective data that is “not intrusive” and “has expanded rapidly” is “direct email correspondence.”⁵ The purpose of the qualitative research in this dissertation is to allow the interviewees to talk about their life stories, experiences, and their difficulties, if any. It takes some time for the women interviewed to organize their thoughts and share their experiences clearly and completely. In addition, because the schedules of Taiwanese women who serve as full-time ministers tend to have to be very flexible in order to respond to the different needs of their parishioners, data collection through email allowed me the flexibility necessary to undertake this research. Therefore, I used email to communicate with and collect data from interviewees.

The interviewees I chose included evangelists, associate pastors, and senior pastors, all of whom have completed their theological education and are actively involved in ministry. These qualifications enabled them to describe whether their theological education adequately equipped them for what they subsequently encountered in ministry. If so, they were able to articulate which aspects of that education best equipped them, and also what aspects were lacking or need to be improved in light of their ministry experiences.

⁴ Lyn Richards, *Handling Qualitative Data: A Practical Guide* (London: Sage Publications, 2006), 37.

⁵ Richards, *Handling Qualitative Data*, 37.

The questions I posed in the interviews were as follows:

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?
2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and as a female clergy in your church settings? (What have been the benefits, difficulties, advantages, and disadvantages of being a woman in these contexts?)
3. How has your theological education had an impact for you as regards your spirituality, ministry, or theology? Which part of your education has most benefitted you?
4. Given your experiences in ministry, what assistance do you expect from theological schools/ seminaries in your current position?
5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education better respond to the needs of female clergy involved in the ministry?

With the interviewees' approval of my English translations of their Mandarin responses, I analyzed and presented the data. Together with my literature reviews of previous similar studies, I present this research plan along with the interview data, the educational applications, and suggestions to theological education in Taiwan as the contribution of this research.

Research Methods Chosen for this Study

The work of Creswell is helpful in articulating a clear method for the qualitative research I use in this project. According to Creswell, there are five qualitative traditions of inquiry: biography, phenomenological study, a grounded theory study, ethnography, and case study.⁶ Of these, biography and phenomenological study best fit the goals of this project. Biography is a helpful way to capture the personal experiences and stories of individuals, such as those of my subjects, Taiwanese female clergy, who I invited to recount and assess their life stories and their experience of how their theological education in Taiwan was or was not appropriate for the ministry in which they later engaged.⁷ Phenomenological study offers a way to articulate the meanings and denotations of these interviewees' common experiences in their lives.⁸ Since the data collected in this research project includes the interviewees' experiences, presumably it contains data of some phenomena that represent real ministry situations.

As regards the tradition of biography, besides that of Creswell the work of Norman K. Denzin, a research professor of Communications, Sociology, and Humanities at the University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign is particularly helpful. As regards the tradition

⁶ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 47-72.

⁷ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 47-51.

⁸ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 52.

of a phenomenological study, the work of Alan Swingewood is useful. Swingewood is a lecturer in Sociology at the London School of Economics, and Clark Moustakas was an American psychologist and President Emeritus and Co-Founder of the Center for Humanistic Studies (CHS) known as the Michigan School of Professional Psychology (MiSPP). The next section examines in more depth the work of both these scholars.

Research Methods Applied in this Study

This section outlines the aforementioned two research traditions. I focus on their practical aspects, like the steps of each research procedure and the way to analyze and represent the data of each tradition in order to be able to apply it in my research.

The Tradition of Biography

Through exploring a person's biography, her life stories, and experiences offered either in interview form or from archival documents and other materials, the researcher learns from the individual's life.⁹ Denzin notes that a biographical research method encompasses the "studied use and collection of life documents that describe turning point moments in an individual's life."¹⁰ From Creswell's perspective, there are two approaches

⁹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 47.

¹⁰ Norman K. Denzin, *Interpretive Biography* (Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, 1989), 69.

in the tradition of biography: a classical biography and an interpretive biography.¹¹ In classical biography, the researchers include “statements about the theory, concerns with validity and criticism of documents and material, and the formulation of distinct hypotheses.”¹² In interpretive biography, says Creswell, “biographies become gendered class productions reflecting the lives of the writers,” making it impossible to avoid the biographers’ “bias[es] and values.”¹³ Therefore, the difference of approach between a classical biography and an interpretive biography is that the latter relies more on the researcher discovering the meanings of the life stories told, a discovery that best happens by asking the story tellers themselves to explain their meanings.¹⁴ Since the interpretation of individuals’ stories plays an important role in such interpretive biographical research, Creswell recommends that the researcher “have a clear understanding of historical, contextual material to position the subject within the larger trends in society or in the culture.”¹⁵

Both approaches –classical biography and interpretive biography– offer qualitative research objectively but from different perspectives. The purpose of this research project

¹¹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 50.

¹² Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 50.

¹³ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 50.

¹⁴ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 51; and Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, 56-58.

¹⁵ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 51.

is to collect the life stories of female ministers in Taiwan and to see how these women apply what they learned in their theological education in their ministry experiences. The approach of a classical biography allows me to connect these female ministers' experiences with women's theories, whereas the interpretive biography approach provides a way for me to represent these female pastors' life stories with a contextualized and neutral attitude.

Research Forms and Theories Applied in the Tradition of Biography

Creswell asserts that four biographic forms can be used to represent the history of a life: a form of individual biographical study, autobiography, the life history, and the oral history.¹⁶ An individual biographical study relates an individual's life story by using archival documents and records; this form of biography is popular among graduate students and social and human science writers.¹⁷ Autobiography denotes a person writing down his or her own life story.¹⁸ Life history is a form of biography typically employed by investigators who collect primary data by doing interviews and having conversations with people.¹⁹ Oral history denotes collecting life stories "through tape recordings or through written works of individuals who have died or who are still living."²⁰

¹⁶ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 48-50.

¹⁷ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 49.

¹⁸ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 49.

¹⁹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 49.

²⁰ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 49.

There are several claims about the theories that are typically applied to this tradition of biography, theories that include feminist theory, cultural theory, social science theories, and so on.²¹ However, Creswell also finds that some researchers focus on “the meaning of experiences by the persons who experience them” rather on other social science theories.²² Therefore, he believes that the study might not be best guided by theories.²³

In this research project, the female Taiwanese pastors are asked to recall their memories and write down the good and bad experiences they have had in their ministries by answering the interview questions. Based on the definition of the four research forms in this tradition that Creswell defines above, this research project presents oral histories. By later connecting these female ministers’ writings with women’s theory — that is, after coding and analyzing the interview data — this research project can suggest educational applications and suggestions for theological education in Taiwan.

The Procedures of the Research in the Tradition of Biography

Different researchers in this tradition have proposed different research procedures. Among the proponents of such procedures, Denzin focuses on classical biography and

²¹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 85.

²² Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 85.

²³ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 85.

interpretative biography, while others are focused on one or the other approach.²⁴ Based on Denzin's assumptions, Creswell asserts five procedural steps in doing qualitative research on the concepts of interpretive biography approach, steps that are useful for my research on Taiwanese women clergy.²⁵

The first step is that the researchers start by asking about people's experiences at different stages in their lives, asking them to respond in writing in the form of "a chronology, [writing about] experiences such as education, marriage and employment."²⁶ The second step for the researcher is to collect "concrete contextual biographical materials" from interviews.²⁷ Therefore, getting data involves gathering stories. The third step is for the researcher to organize these stories according to different themes and to discover the key events that are epiphanies in these people's lives.²⁸ The next step for the researcher is to rely on people's explanations and discover the meanings in their stories.²⁹ The last step for the researcher is to interpret what they find in the prior step through the lens of "social interactions in groups, cultural issues, ideologies, and historical context."³⁰

²⁴ According to my studies, Denzin offers a procedure based on the assumptions of the approach of a classical biography in his early writings in *The Research Act* published in 1970. Later on, he provides another procedure based on the concepts of both approaches in this tradition.

²⁵ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 50-51.

²⁶ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 50.

²⁷ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 50.

²⁸ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 51.

²⁹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 51.

³⁰ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 51.

To apply these five steps in this research project, the first step is to ask the interviewees to share their stories about why they went to seminary, how theological education influenced them, and to ask about their good and bad experiences in ministry. The second step is to gather these female ministers' stories through emails. The third step is to discover from the answers they provide as the data of their life stories the epiphanies inside of these data. The final two steps are to find and explain the meanings of these stories and to provide interpretations for the life experiences of the individual interviewee or a cross-interpretation based on similar experiences of several interviewees.

Analysis and Presentation of the Research Data in the Tradition of Biography

Regarding the analysis of the qualitative research data, Denzin's suggestion offers a clear way for researchers to analyze the primary data. He proposes that researchers begin their data analysis by identifying "an objective set of experiences in the subject's life" which "are often connected to life-course stages (childhood, adolescence, early adulthood, old age) and to life-course experiences (i.e. education, marriage, employment)."³¹ Based on the information gathered from interviews, the researcher can develop "a chronology of the individual's life" and look "in the database (typically interviews or documents) for

³¹ Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, 56; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 146.

concrete, contextual biographical materials” that might illumine the events of that life.³²

The researcher “then subjects these narratives to careful readings and interpretations” and by gathering together as many of these narratives as possible, identifies the features that have shaped the individual’s life.³³ By doing this, the individual’s biography has been “reconstructed and the structural-objective factors that have shaped his or her life are identified” by the researcher.³⁴ Therefore, the researcher is able to offer data analysis of a particular woman’s life with three foci: (a) “the structural processes” in the individual’s life, (b) “the different kinds of theories that relate to these life experiences,” and (c) “the unique and general features of the life.”³⁵

There are many ways to represent the primary data without necessarily presenting it in a chronological way. According to Leon Edel, a North American literary critic and biographer, and the winner of a National Book Award and a Pulitzer Prize, “a biography need no longer be strictly chronological” because “every life takes its own form and a biographer must find the ideal and unique literary form to express it.”³⁶ Creswell suggests that one way to represent the primary data is to follow Denzin’s suggestion that the

³² Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 146; and Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, 56-57.

³³ Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, 56; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 146.

³⁴ Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, 56.

³⁵ Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, 56 and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 147.

³⁶ Leon Edel, *Writing Lives: Principia Biographica* (New York: Norton, 1984), 30.

researcher start with a “key event” or an “epiphany” in the subject’s life and then work forward and backward from that event.³⁷ The key event or the epiphany refers to “interactional moments and experiences that mark people’s lives.” It includes four types: “the major event that touches the fabric of the individual’s life; the cumulative or representative events, experiences that continue for some time; the minor epiphany, which represents a moment in an individual’s life; and episodes or relived epiphanies, which involve reliving the experience.”³⁸ Therefore, the representation of the primary data could vary according to its content. Creswell offers a table to clearly illustrate the different approach to data analysis and representation. A short form of Creswell’s table appears in

Table 1.

Data Analysis and Representation	Biography
Data Managing	Create and organize files for data
Reading, memoing	Read through text, make marginal notes, form initial codes
Describing	Describe objective set of experiences – chronology of life

³⁷ Norman K. Denzin, *Interpretive Interactionism*, 2nd ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2001), 41; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 174.

³⁸ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 174; and Denzin, *Interpretive Interactionism*, 41.

Classifying	*Identify stories *Locate epiphanies *Identify contextual materials for life
Interpreting	Theorize toward developing patterns and meanings
Representing, visualizing	Present narration focusing on process, theories, and unique and general features of the life

Table 1. Data analysis and representation in the tradition of biography³⁹

The Tradition of Phenomenological Study

The tradition of phenomenological study is another tradition applied in this research project. A phenomenological study represents the meaning of concepts and/or phenomena in people's life experiences.⁴⁰ In Creswell's research, he finds that a phenomenological study is used in sociology, psychology, nursing, and the health sciences and education.⁴¹ Creswell asserts that the researcher of a phenomenological study focuses on people's experiences, and portrays their discoveries from these experiences without prejudgments.⁴² In this research project, when a female pastor talks about her experiences in ministerial encounters, it is important for the researcher to have a neutral attitude. This is true also as regards analyzing and presenting the primary data provided by interviewees.

³⁹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 148-149.

⁴⁰ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 51.

⁴¹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 52.

⁴² Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 52.

Approaches in the Tradition of Phenomenological Study

According to Creswell, there are two dominant approaches in the tradition of phenomenological study: the ethnomethodological approach and the psychological approach.⁴³ Ethnomethodology, Swingewood explains, was originally developed by Harold Garfinkel, a Professor Emeritus at the University of California, Los Angeles.⁴⁴ Swingewood clarifies the word “ethnomethodology” as “ethno- referring to the observational study of the stock of commonsense knowledge available to individuals; method- referring to the strategies whereby the individual makes sense of the social world and communicates meaning.”⁴⁵ The approach of ethnomethodology, in Creswell’s words, is therefore “a way in which to examine how individuals in society make meanings of their everyday lives,” a way that “relies on methods of analyzing everyday talk.”⁴⁶

Similar to ethnomethodology, the psychological approach also pays attention to the experiences’ meanings but its emphasis is on individual experiences, not group ones.⁴⁷ Creswell often refers to Moustakas.⁴⁸ Moustakas explains the term transcendental

⁴³ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 53.

⁴⁴ Alan Swingewood, *A Short History of Sociological Thought*, 3rd ed. (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 2000), 177.

⁴⁵ Swingewood, *Short History of Sociological Thought*, 177.

⁴⁶ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 53; and Swingewood, *Short History of Sociological Thought*, 176-182.

⁴⁷ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 53.

⁴⁸ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 53-54.

phenomenology as “a scientific study of the appearance of things, of phenomena just as we see them and as they appear to us in consciousness” and he believes that “any phenomenon represents a suitable starting point for phenomenological reflection.”⁴⁹ Creswell cites Moustakas’ words to explain the central tenet of the psychological approach, which is “to determine what an experience means for the persons who have had the experience and are able to provide a comprehensive description of it” and derive “the essences or structures of the experience” from “the individual descriptions’ general or universal meanings.”⁵⁰

Both approaches, the approach of ethnomethodology and the psychological approach, are focused on understanding the meaning of experiences and learning from them. The main difference between these two approaches is that the ethnomethodological approach pays attention to the individual’s experiences in society from a social studies perspective while the psychological approach focuses on the personal experiences and reflects on them phenomenologically. Since the female ministers share their personal experiences in the interviews and since the work of the researcher is to reflect phenomenologically on the data provided by the interviewees, this research project is

⁴⁹ Clark Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 1994), 49.

⁵⁰ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 13; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 53-54.

geared more toward to the psychological approach in the tradition of phenomenological study.

Research Procedures in the Tradition of Phenomenological Study

Based on Creswell's research of psychological phenomenologists, principally Donald E. Polkinghorne and Moustakas, there are five major steps to doing a phenomenological study. The first step, according to Creswell, is for the researcher "to understand the philosophical perspectives behind the approach."⁵¹ Creswell also emphasizes that the investigator needs especially to focus on "the concept of studying how people experience a phenomenon."⁵² The next step is that the researchers find the meaning of these people's daily life experiences by having people describe these experiences and by asking people research questions.⁵³ Based on the studies of Polkinghorne's words, Creswell maintains that the third step of a phenomenological study is for the investigator to gather the primary data from people who experience the phenomenon in the study; Creswell notes that the optimum number of informants is between five and twenty-five.⁵⁴ The fourth step is to analyze the data that the investigators have collected. Creswell asserts

⁵¹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 54.

⁵² Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 54.

⁵³ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 54.

⁵⁴ Donald E. Polkinghorne, "Phenomenological Research Methods," in *Existential-phenomenological Perspectives in Psychology*, ed. Ronald S. Valle and Steen Halling (New York: Plenum, 1989), 45-46; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 54.

that all psychological phenomenologists apply similar steps to analyze the data,⁵⁵ but that no matter the number of steps, the phenomenologist's "report ends with the reader understanding better the essential, invariant structure (or essence) of the experience."⁵⁶ According to Polkinghorne, a research report should result in the reader being able to say, "I understand better what it is like for someone to experience that."⁵⁷ Regarding the format of the report, Creswell recommends Moustakas' outline of the phenomenological model or chapters in a phenomenological study.

As regards the five major steps in doing a phenomenological study, in this research project the first two steps include understanding how female clergy experience the benefits, difficulties, advantages, and disadvantages of their ministries and asking these interviewees questions about those particular issues. The next two steps are to collect and analyze the data provided by the interviewees. The last step is to present the experiences of the interviewees through life stories as a way of making readers better understand the phenomena these interviewees experienced in their ministries.

⁵⁵ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 54-55; Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 120-153; and Polkinghorne, "Phenomenological Research Methods," 51-55.

⁵⁶ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 55.

⁵⁷ Polkinghorne, "Phenomenological Research Methods," 46.

Analyzing and Presenting the Research Data in the Tradition of Phenomenological Study

Among the ways of analyzing the data asserted by different phenomenological researchers, Creswell's clear suggestion applies well to my research goals:

The original protocols are divided into statements or horizontalization. Then, the units are transformed into clusters of meanings expressed in psychological and phenomenological concepts. Finally, these transformations are tied together to make a general description of the experience, the textural description of what was experienced, and the structural description of how it was experienced.⁵⁸

Based on his studies of the methods of analysis of the data in phenomenological research suggested by phenomenologists, Moustakas asserts two modification methods: the modification of van Kamm's method and the modification of the Stevick-Colaizzi-Keen method.⁵⁹ Moustakas suggests a seven-step modification of van Kamm's method.

The first step of analyzing the data in this method is to "list every expression relevant to the experience," a practice called Horizontalization.⁶⁰ The second step is called "Reduction and Elimination," which refers to determining "the Invariant Constituents,"⁶¹

⁵⁸ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 54-55.

⁵⁹ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 120-121.

⁶⁰ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 120.

⁶¹ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 120.

and involves examining each expression with two criteria: First, “Does it contain a moment of the experience that is a necessary and sufficient constituent for understanding it?” And second, “Is it possible to abstract and label it?”⁶² The next step is “Clustering and Thematizing the invariant Constituents,” that is, to “cluster the invariant constituents of the experience that are related into a thematic label” so that the researchers can learn the core themes of the experiences from the clustered and labeled constituents.⁶³ The fourth step in this outline is “Final Identification of the Invariant Constituents and Themes by Application: Validation.”⁶⁴ In this step, the researchers “check the invariant constituents and their accompanying theme against the complete record of the research participant” by asking two questions and making a response: “(1) Are they expressed explicitly in the complete transcription? (2) Are they compatible if not explicitly expressed? (3) If they are not explicit or compatible, they are not relevant to the co-researcher’s experience and should be deleted.”⁶⁵ The fifth step is to apply the “relevant, validated invariant constituents and themes” derived from the prior steps to construct “an *Individual Textural Description* of the experience.”⁶⁶ The sixth step of this method is “based on the Individual

⁶² Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 121.

⁶³ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 121.

⁶⁴ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 121.

⁶⁵ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 121.

⁶⁶ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 121.

Textual Description” of the experience to establish “an Individual Structural Description of the experience.”⁶⁷ The last step is to have “a Textural-Structural Description” for each individual and find “the meanings and essences of the experience, incorporating the invariant constituents and themes” from it.⁶⁸

Moustakas identifies four steps in the second method of analyzing the data in a phenomenological study, known as the Stevick-Colaizzi-Keen method.⁶⁹ According to Creswell, this method is also commonly employed in phenomenological studies.⁷⁰ The first step of this method asks the researchers to describe a person’s experience of the phenomenon using the perspectives and terminology of phenomenology.⁷¹ The second step is for the researcher to describe “how individuals are experiencing the topic”⁷² by listening for the meanings and essence which the individual ascribes to the experience. The researcher starts to read the verbatim transcripts with “respect to [their] significance for [the] description of the experience” and “lists out these significant statements (horizontalization of the data).”⁷³ Finally, the researcher develops a list of “nonrepetitive,

⁶⁷ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 121.

⁶⁸ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 121.

⁶⁹ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122.

⁷⁰ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 147.

⁷¹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 147; and Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122.

⁷² Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 147; and Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122.

⁷³ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and*

nonoverlapping statements” and “synthesize[s] the invariant meaning units and themes into a description of the textures of the experience”⁷⁴ Then the researcher “reflects on his or her own description and uses imaginative variation” to “construct a textural-structural description.”⁷⁵ In the third step, by constructing textural-structural descriptions, the researcher has to seek “all possible meanings and divergent perspectives,” vary “the frames of reference about the phenomenon,” and construct “a description of how the phenomenon was experienced.”⁷⁶ The last step is that the researcher describes the meanings and essences of the experiences with “a composite textural-structural description.”⁷⁷

These two methods apply two different approaches to the analysis of data. However, both methods have the same focus — namely, to analyze the data as objectively as possible. This is because the most important principle of a phenomenological study is to understand the meaning of an individual’s experiences of a phenomenon without making prejudgments.

To represent the research data in a phenomenological study, there are two models in the tradition of phenomenological study. In six chapters, Moustakas explores ways of

Research Design, 147.

⁷⁴ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122.

⁷⁵ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 150; and Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122.

⁷⁶ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 150; and Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122.

⁷⁷ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 122; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 150.

representing research data.⁷⁸ Creswell summarizes Moustakas' lengthy model and I apply

Creswell's summary and illustrate this model in Table 2.

Chapter	Content
1	Introduction and statement of topic and outline
2	Review of the relevant literature
3	Conceptual framework of model
4	Methodology
5	Presentation of data
6	Summary, implications, and outcomes

Table 2. Moustakas' model of representing research data⁷⁹

According to Creswell, Polkinghorne is one example of a researcher who uses this second model. Instead of providing a specific outline for representing the research data, Polkinghorne suggests that the researcher should write a report that includes “a description and documentation of the procedures” and “the steps applied to move from the raw interview data to a general description of the experience under investigation.”⁸⁰ Therefore,

⁷⁸ Moustakas, *Phenomenological Research Methods*, 156-157; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 176-177.

⁷⁹ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 176-177.

⁸⁰ Polkinghorne, “Phenomenological Research Methods,” 56-57.

the report is able to make readers “follow the researcher’s analytic process” and “understand how the transformed meanings and structural description have been arrived at.”⁸¹ In addition, Polkinghorne advises the researcher to include “a review of previous research, the theory pertaining to the topic,” and to conclude the report with “the implication of the phenomenological findings for psychological theory and application.”⁸²

Unlike Moustakas, who claims a clear outline for representing the data, Polkinghorne identifies the important elements that should be included in the report. He suggests that the main purpose of writing a report is to faithfully represent the way that the researcher transforms the raw data to a meaningful implication and conclusion so that the individuals’ experiences of a phenomenon can be given values.

Creswell also has a table that clearly illustrates how to do data analysis and representation in his study. Table 3 presents a summary of the tradition of biography.

Data Analysis and Representation	Phenomenology
Data Managing	Create and organize files for data
Reading, memoing	Read through text, make marginal notes, form initial codes
Describing	Describe the meaning of the experience for researcher

⁸¹ Polkinghorne, “Phenomenological Research Methods,” 56-57.

⁸² Polkinghorne, “Phenomenological Research Methods,” 57; and Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 177.

Classifying	Find and list statements of meaning for individuals Group statements into meaning units
Interpreting	*Develop a textual description of “what happened?” *Develop a structural description of “how” the phenomenon was experienced *Develop an overall description of the experience, the “essence”
Representing, visualizing	Present narration of the “essence” of the experience; use tables or figures of statements and meaning units

Table 3. Data analysis and representation in Phenomenological Study⁸³

⁸³ Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, 148-149.

Chapter 3

Literature Review of Women's Theories: Psychology and Neuroscience

This chapter includes a literature review on women's theories of psychology and neuroscience. In the section on female psychological development, the emphasis is on women's relationship with others and self. Regarding neuroscience, the focus is on the development of the human brain and the gender differences in humans' brains.

The Theories of Psychological Development of Women

Literature Review of Women's Psychological Development

Carol Gilligan's Research

Developmental psychological theories like Freud's developmental concepts, Erik Erikson's ideas of identity development, and Jean Piaget's and Lawrence Kohlberg's descriptions of moral development, have asserted human developmental stages in many ways and these theories have become classic and predominant. Carol Gilligan, who used to work with Erikson, a psychoanalyst working in the Freudian tradition, and Kohlberg, a cognitive-developmental psychologist working in the tradition of Piaget, has focused her

studies on women's psychological development.⁸⁴ Gilligan's research offers different views to recent female developmental psychology studies. She notes that Kohlberg's moral development theory, by emphasizing human's abstract thought and impersonal laws, favors thought over emotion.⁸⁵ Gilligan claims that women are different and emphasize emotions and interpersonal relationships more than men,⁸⁶ and that whereas for men gender identity is related to separation and individuation, for women gender identity is related to attachment and intimacy.⁸⁷

Arguing with the masculine bias of the major psychological theories, Gilligan boldly claims that women have a different way of thinking about self and morality and she therefore provides another view. Reflecting her assertion that women have a different voice from men, the first book of Gilligan's research about feminist psychology is entitled, *In a Different Voice*. With a focus on women's psychological theory and education, her second book is entitled, *Mapping the Moral Domain*. Gilligan's research interests include the psychological development of adolescent girls. *Making Connections, Meeting at the*

⁸⁴ Carol Gilligan, *Joining the Resistance* (Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 2011), 19.

⁸⁵ Lisa J. Cohen, *The Handy Psychology Answer Book* (Canton, MI: Visible Ink Press, 2011), 167.

⁸⁶ Cohen, *Handy Psychology Answer Book*, 167.

⁸⁷ William E. Herman, "Values Acquisition and Moral Development: An integration of Freudian, Eriksonian, Kohlbergian and Gilliganian Viewpoints," Education Resources Information Center, last modified July 24, 2005, accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509173243/http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED490607.pdf>.

Crossroads, and *Between Voice and Silence* are Gilligan's contribution of connecting adolescent girls' psychological development and women's psychology. Gilligan found that, as a result of growing up in a patriarchal culture, girls are "undergoing a kind of psychological foot-binding" and that they "suffer at adolescence."⁸⁸ Based on her research on psychological development in adolescent girls and women, she suggests that female developmental markers of separation and attachment, "allocated sequentially to adolescence and adulthood, seem in some sense to be fused."⁸⁹ Gilligan suggests that women's characters develop based on "the quality of [their] embeddedness in social interaction and personal relationships."⁹⁰ In her latest book, *Joining the Resistance*, based on twenty years of research on adolescent girls and women, Gilligan asserts that adolescent girls have an honest inner voice of resistance and that to speak out this disagreement is important in order for them to enter into womanhood.

Robert Kegan's Theory

Kegan's well-known theory of human development is represented in his first book, *The Evolving Self*. There, he integrates three different intellectual traditions that include

⁸⁸ Lyn Mikel Brown and Carol Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads: Women's Psychology and Girls' Development* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992), 218-219.

⁸⁹ Carol Gilligan, "In A Different Voice: Visions of Maturity," in *Women's Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development*, ed. Joann Wolski Conn, 1st ed. (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1986), 68.

⁹⁰ Carol Gilligan, *In A Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993), 8-9.

the neo-psychoanalytic tradition (represented by Anna Freud, Heinz Hartmann, Erik Erikson, Ernst Kris, Ronald Fairbairn, Edith Jacobsen, Donald Winnicott, Margaret Mahler, and Harry Guntrip), the humanistic and existential-phenomenological (represented by Prescott Lecky, Abraham Maslow, Rollo May, Ludwig Binswanger, Andras Angyal, and Carl Rogers), and the constructive-developmental tradition (represented by James Mark Baldwin, John Dewey, George Herbert Mead, and Jean Piaget). Kegan's human development theory is based on the concepts of meaning-making and subject-object balance. He states that human life is composed by the activities of making sense of the things that humans encounter in different contexts that become their feelings, experiences, thoughts, perceptions, and so on. Inspired by Piaget's theory, neo-Piagetian perspectives, and Kohlberg's stages of moral development, Kegan applies the idea of subject-object balance in his theory. Humans' self-concepts are referred to as subject consciousness, which means that human beings cannot have completely objective views. However, as human beings develop in different contexts, people are able to detach themselves from the phenomenon and have objective consciousness, which means they are able to look at themselves objectively and find balance between subjective and objective consciousness.

Using the foundations of the subject-object balance and the meaning-making concepts, Kegan suggests an order of six evolutionary balances: the incorporative, impulsive, imperial, interpersonal, institutional, and the interindividual. Kegan represents these six evolutionary balances with the figure of a spiral because he thinks that this shows better than a straight line that humans move back and forth in light of life struggles, and that balance is actually a little imbalanced.⁹¹ He asserts that each evolutionary balance has its underlying structure (a combination of the concepts of subject and object), culture of embeddedness, and functions, and that there are transitions between different balances. One of the reasons why Kegan wrote this book was to help professional counselors, psychotherapists, and coaches understand that every client has his/her own context and is trying to make sense of his or her problems; in short, Kegan was advocating that these professional helpers have nonjudgmental and clear sight in order to help their clients.

In his next book, *In Over Our Heads*, Kegan stretches his human development theory. He names the concepts of subject-object “orders of consciousness” instead of “evolutionary truces” as he had called them in *The Evolving Self*. He explores this more deeply in the sequence or transition a person makes from adolescence to adult. He describes

⁹¹ Robert Kegan, *The Evolving Self: Problem and Process in Human Development* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1982), 109-110.

what he found using terms common in psychological development, namely development (adolescence), families (parenting), couples (partnering), companies (work), psychotherapies (healing), and schools (learning). Kegan repeatedly mentions that suffering happens if there is no support to help people when they face challenging development tasks. Kegan deepens his psychological research of human development and relates it to the aspects of transformation, education, and self-development in his later books, such as *How the Way We Talk Can Change the Way We Work: Seven Languages for Transformation*; *Change Leadership: A Practical Guide to Transforming Our Schools*; and *Immunity to Change: How to Overcome it and Unlock Potential in Yourself and Your Organization*.

Other Psychologists' Contributions

In addition to Gilligan and Kegan, there are also other psychologists working on women's development. Judith V. Jordan (Director of Women's Studies at Harvard Medical School), Alexandra G. Kaplan (Director of The Stone Center at Wellesley College), Jean Baker Miller (a clinical professor at Boston University of Medicine), Irene P. Stiver (Director of the Psychology Department at McLean Hospital), and Janet L. Surrey (Director of Psychological Service, Adult Outpatient Department at McLean Hospital)

wrote a book together entitled, *Women's Growth in Connection* (1991), that details their research of women's development and offers new ways to view women's psychological development. These authors from different psychology backgrounds examine contemporary psychological theories and assert that women's development depends on the relationships around them. In 1997, more psychologists joined and wrote another book entitled, *Women's Growth in Diversity*, which reveals more aspects and issues of women's development, including emotions, race, and the relationships of lesbians, and presents advanced research on women's psychological development.

The Relationship with Others and Self

In the research on women's psychological development, many psychologists emphasize the word "relationship."⁹² It is obvious that relationships play important roles in women's psychological development. For instance, Kegan discusses the growth and loss of the interpersonal self in stage 4 of his human development theory.⁹³ The relationship with others reveals different influences in women's development of the self. However, this does not mean that relationship is not important in men's psychological development. Since my research project is related to women's psychological development, I highlight two of

⁹² For instance, both Carol Gilligan and Robert Kegan mention the influences of relationship for women in their theories.

⁹³ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 184-220.

these dimensions: the relationship with others and the relationship with self.

The Relationship with Others

Relationship with others, for women, is important for women's psychological development. Typically, it is not only the way women define others, but also the way women develop their concepts of self. To have a good and supportive relationship with others can help a woman develop the concepts of self and be more confident about presenting her true self. There are three steps for having a relationship with others: realizing the differences among others, accepting the varieties of others, and building the alternative views for others, steps I explain in the next section.

Realizing the Differences among Others

The first relationship that a human being encounters is usually the relationship with her mother. According to Gilligan's research, issues of femininity or feminine identity for girls and women, "do not depend on the achievement of separation from the mother or on the progress of individuation" but are "defined through attachment."⁹⁴ Her research therefore focuses on adolescent girls and their relationships with other adult women. In interviews with adolescent girls, Gilligan found that these adolescent girls are looking for

⁹⁴ Gilligan, *In A Different Voice*, 8.

female role models.⁹⁵ The work of Joann Wolski Conn, an associate professor of religious studies at Neumann College, and the author of *Spirituality and Personal Maturity* and the editor of *Women's Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development*, also details the importance of adult female role models for adolescent girls. Conn asserts that adolescent girls establish their identity with the help of adult females around them.⁹⁶

Gilligan also finds that “the othermother tradition in black communit[ies]” helps adolescent girls with the development of their identities.⁹⁷ According to Gilligan’s description, these girls mention that the othermother can be aunts, adult sisters, sister-in-law, older friends, or even neighbors as long as they listen to them and share their life stories with them. These women have provided supportive strength and make these girls think about things more deeply and became more mature. Gilligan’s studies reveal that, “for some girls, women other than their mothers were able to be dependable allies and important sources of support.”⁹⁸ These kinds of relationships, according to Gilligan, are “a source of great pleasure for the girls, a place for genuine connection and a safe escort into the adult world,” because these adult women act “as advocates,” serve “to validate the

⁹⁵ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 221.

⁹⁶ Joann Wolski Conn, *Spirituality and Personal Maturity* (New York: Paulist Press, 1989), 40.

⁹⁷ Jill McLean Taylor, Carol Gilligan and Amy M. Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence: Women and Girls, Race and Relationship* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), 117-118.

⁹⁸ Taylor, Gilligan and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 118.

girls and their experience,” and nurture “girls’ sense of self-respect and confidence.”⁹⁹

In Gilligan’s latest studies, she finds that the girls “may bury an honest voice inside themselves for safe-keeping.”¹⁰⁰ However, Gilligan also finds that the girls have an honest voice inside, which is a voice of resistance, a voice that not only “reflect[s] our ability to pick up” but also to “register the feeling of what happens and the desire of relationship or mutual understanding.”¹⁰¹ She asserts that it is important for these girls to be able to speak out their disagreements in front of people and the relationship between girls and women can help adolescent girls as they enter womanhood.¹⁰² If the adult women fail to recognize the true voice of these adolescent girls, the voice that can be different from the expectations of the society and culture, these adult women fail to offer, in Gilligan’s words, “a source of great pleasure for the girls” and also lose the opportunities to learn from girls.¹⁰³ Women seek to connect to others and build up pleasant relationships with others as they build up the concepts of self. Women also need to realize that there are differences among others, but that they can nonetheless connect to each other well and have good relationships with each other.

⁹⁹ Taylor, Gilligan and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 119.

¹⁰⁰ Gilligan, *Joining the Resistance*, 63.

¹⁰¹ Gilligan, *Joining the Resistance*, 63.

¹⁰² Gilligan, *Joining the Resistance*, 63, 151, and 153.

¹⁰³ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 119.

According to Kegan's studies of Piaget's work, he thinks that to be able to have subject-object balance means "distinguishing between how something appears and how something is, [which] one cannot do when one is subject to the perceptions."¹⁰⁴ To be able to recognize differences between oneself and others is an advanced subject-object balance and issue of development for women. Furthermore, Kegan mentions that, for older children and adolescences, a role-recognizing culture can "support and acknowledge the child's tests and exercises of self-sufficiency, competence, and role differentiation."¹⁰⁵ Kegan thinks that every stage of human development needs different support from different cultures, but that this support has three fundamental functions: "confirmation, contradiction and continuity."¹⁰⁶ In Kegan's views, people need supports in order to go on to the next stage of development. According to Gilligan and Kegan, women develop their identity through relationships with others and they need support, confidence, and strength to overcome the fear and be able to make the transition to the next developmental stage. To be able to recognize the differences among others would help women to be able to accept the varieties of others.

¹⁰⁴ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 29.

¹⁰⁵ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 258.

¹⁰⁶ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 258.

Accepting the Varieties of Others

In Gilligan's research on adolescent girls, she finds that rumors and gossip "creat[e] a serious threat to sustained and honest relationships" among the girls.¹⁰⁷ She finds that it is a risk for adolescent girls to say what they are feeling and thinking, for they fear losing their relationships and becoming powerless and alone.¹⁰⁸ For this reason, girls often stop speaking out with their true voices as a "strateg[y] of self-protection."¹⁰⁹ Gilligan's research proves how important it is for girls and women to be accepted in their relationships with others. Rumors and gossip can be signs of disagreement with others, for girls typically do not start rumors and gossip about girls they really like or accept. Girls stop articulating their true thoughts because they do not want to be unacceptable to other girls.

Yet Gilligan asserts that these strategies of self-protection can be dismantled when these girls have someone "who truly knows how to listen when girls speak about thoughts and feelings that fall outside the social bounds and cultural expectations of appropriate or acceptable behavior."¹¹⁰ Gilligan claims that it is important to have these girls experience "being listened to and feeling understood" and having opportunities to talk through the

¹⁰⁷ Taylor, Gilligan and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 118.

¹⁰⁸ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 217.

¹⁰⁹ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 118.

¹¹⁰ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 120.

“issues important to them without fear of judgment, betrayal, or misunderstanding and anger.”¹¹¹ Both adolescent girls and adult women need to have the experiences of “being listened to and feeling understood” especially when they are holding something that might not be acceptable according to normal social and cultural expectations.¹¹² This is because women develop their identity through relationships with others and need to feel accepted and get support to overcome their fears. The support is what Kegan focuses on in his studies.

Kegan claims that the process of transition from one developmental stage to another needs different kinds of support in different cultures.¹¹³ For instance, the culture of mutuality can acknowledge and support “the person’s capacity for collaborative, self-sacrificing, closely attuned, idealized interpersonal relationships.”¹¹⁴ Such support, says Kegan, is “more than a given culture of embeddedness” and “not alone an affective matter, but a matter of ‘knowing’; a matter of shape, as well as intensity.”¹¹⁵ To receive support from relationships gives women the confidence and strength to be able to make the transition to a new developmental stage, to keep growing and evolving their selves.

With this in mind, to accept the variety of others means to offer care and support to

¹¹¹ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 120-121.

¹¹² Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 120.

¹¹³ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 258.

¹¹⁴ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 259.

¹¹⁵ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 260-261.

others so that they can express themselves freely. Such “truths of relationship,” says Gilligan, help persons to “return in the rediscovery of connection, in the realization that self and other are interdependent” and learn that life “can only be sustained by care in relationships.”¹¹⁶ If women accept the varieties of others, they are able to care, support, and build the alternative views for others’ differences.

Building the Alternative Views for Others’ Differences

In her interviews of young adult women, Gilligan found that the identity of women is “defined in a context of relationship and judged by a standard of responsibility and care.”¹¹⁷ She found that adult women “provided [adolescents with] the models for silencing themselves and behaving like ‘good little girls.’”¹¹⁸ This is very serious for girls because they are establishing their identity by patterning themselves on adult females around them.¹¹⁹ After she does the interviews of the adolescent girls, Gilligan reveals her view with strong words:

Unless we, as grown women, were willing to give up all the “good little girl” things we continued to do and give up our expectation that the girls in our charge would be as good as we were, we could not successfully empower young women to act

¹¹⁶ Gilligan, *In A Different Voice*, 127.

¹¹⁷ Gilligan, *In A Different Voice*, 160.

¹¹⁸ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 221.

¹¹⁹ Conn, *Spirituality and Personal Maturity*, 40.

on their own knowledge and feelings. Unless we stopped hiding in expectations of goodness and control, our behavior would silence any words to girls about speaking in their own voice.¹²⁰

If the adult women view both themselves and others in the traditional way of the acquiescent female, they fail to model the alternative views both for themselves and others and are not able to grow or assist anyone else in doing so.

In her studies, Gilligan learned that the reason adolescent girls trust certain adult women is that these adult women “listen to these girls without needing to change them” and “make it possible for them to share their experiences and express their feelings in a climate of trust.”¹²¹ These adult women have no need to correct or advise the girls, and are content to listen and understand.

According to Kegan’s concepts, at every stage of their development, people need to be supported and find a balance in order to keep growing. Such balance “composes the self and the world.”¹²² Kegan reminds us of the need for support to facilitate development for “we live on a turning world and are turning ourselves.”¹²³ The act of building others’ alternative views is a kind of support because instead of suppressing women it offers them space to express countercultural thoughts without worrying about being despised, judged,

¹²⁰ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 221.

¹²¹ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 131.

¹²² Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 192.

¹²³ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 261.

or corrected by others. This support assists women in finding the balance between themselves and the world and to keep evolving themselves to the next development stage.

The Relationship with Self

Gilligan's research found that adolescent girls can sense when women are afraid of revealing themselves in relationship, and in those cases the adolescent girls often chose to withhold their feelings and thoughts.¹²⁴ In Kegan's theory, self-evolution happens through different evolutionary balances. People at stage 3, interpersonal balance, need to have self-coherence or a clear "identity."¹²⁵ While relationship with others is important for women's development, the relationship with self also plays a crucial role when women are evolving to a different developmental stage. This section explores three steps of having relationship with self: recognizing, accepting, and revealing the true self.

Recognizing the True Self

Directly or indirectly, women have been hurt in relationships in the process of growing up. Gilligan's studies note that adolescent girls speak of the conflicts they have, especially in high school.¹²⁶ Her description of the adolescent girls offers a vivid picture

¹²⁴ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 157-158.

¹²⁵ Robert Kegan, "The Evolving Self," in *Women's Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development*, ed. Joann Wolski Conn, 1st ed. (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1986), 89.

¹²⁶ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 118.

of girl's psychological situation: "For girls at adolescence to say what they are feeling and thinking often means to risk, in the words of many girls, losing their relationships and finding themselves powerless and all alone....Honesty in relationships began to seem 'stupid' – it was called 'selfish' or 'rude' or 'mean.'"¹²⁷

Because of this situation, adolescent girls develop "ongoing strategies of self-protection," which are signs of psychological wounds or scars that women got from others.¹²⁸ This self-protection makes women disconnect their true self and feeling from their bodies.¹²⁹ Many women have thus suffered from false relationships even with themselves, not only with others, and their authentic self needs once again to feel accepted. Gilligan encourages women to recognize the true desires or thoughts in their hearts and speak out with a different voice — not necessarily a nice voice "that other people want to hear."¹³⁰

It is crucial for women to recognize their true self and have their own voice when they are in transition between stages 2 and stage 3 of Kegan's development to maturity. For the women in stage 3, this means finding interpersonal balance, being able to "stand up for

¹²⁷ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 217.

¹²⁸ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 118.

¹²⁹ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 217.

¹³⁰ Gilligan, *Joining the Resistance*, 63.

myself, be more 'selfish,' less pliable."¹³¹ Conn thinks that, based on Kegan's theory, women in stage 3 have "the ability to talk about feeling now as feelings rather than as social negotiation."¹³² It is about learning how to recognize their true thoughts without being confused by ideas of fulfilling others' expectations. This is a starting point in the process of self-evolution for the woman who has not yet recognized her true self and developed her own voice.

Accepting the True Self

Once women are able to recognize the true self inside of them, the next step is to accept the true self. The voice of true self might not be always pleasant for the women themselves or the people around them, even though it is a voice from the true self. Gilligan notes, for example, that the honest voice of the adolescent girls she studied is a voice of resistance which "can make trouble in families, schools, and communities."¹³³ Recall that women's identity is closely tied to the relationships.¹³⁴ Making trouble can disrupt those relationships — unless the other is ready to hear the honest and true voice. Miller notes that "the threat of disruption of an affiliation," for women, is "perceived not as just a loss

¹³¹ Kegan, "Evolving Self," 89-90.

¹³² Conn, *Spirituality and Personal Maturity*, 53.

¹³³ Gilligan, *Joining the Resistance*, 63.

¹³⁴ Gilligan, "In A Different Voice," 72.

of a relationship but as something closer to a total loss of self.”¹³⁵ Women therefore typically carefully weigh what they say.

In order to help women be able to own their sense of self, in addition to building relationships, women have to recognize and accept the true self, even when it is a self that does not fulfill society’s or particular others’ expectations. Such a “separation of the self from relationships” is a “marker of progress toward maturity,” notes Gilligan, according to “the theories of Freud, Erikson, Piaget, Kohlberg, and their contemporary offshoots in psychoanalysis and cognitive psychology.”¹³⁶ To accept and affirm their inner thoughts, even and especially if they are not congruent with the thoughts of one’s family or community, is an important step for women as they build their self-confidence. When women learn to do this, they are able to describe the differences between the true self and the self that is trying to fit in with the criteria of the society or the expectations of others.

In Conn’s opinion, counselors and spiritual directors deal most often with persons in stages 3 to 5 in Kegan’s theory.¹³⁷ People working on stage 3 or interpersonal balance, need to have self-coherence or true “identity.”¹³⁸ People who have attained stage 4, or

¹³⁵ Jean Baker Miller, “Toward a New Psychology of Women,” in *Women’s Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development*, ed. Joann Wolski Conn, 1st ed. (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1986), 107.

¹³⁶ Gilligan, *Joining the Resistance*, 28.

¹³⁷ Conn, *Spirituality and Personal Maturity*, 53.

¹³⁸ Kegan, “Evolving Self,” 89.

institutional balance, have the “capacity for independence” and a balanced “self-system.”¹³⁹ Self-coherence means that women no longer define themselves by their relationships, such as by being someone’s daughter, someone’s wife, or someone’s mother, but as independent selves who recognize and accept themselves. Because they find the support from inside of themselves they are able to have the motivation to present their true selves, speak out their needs and, finally, to gain others’ support. For when women are not able to recognize and accept their true selves and present their own needs, it is hard for other people to understand and support them. Therefore, the last step in having relationship with self is to reveal the true self.

Revealing the True Self

Since women have been directly or indirectly hurt in the process of growing up, when women do not have a chance to recover from their wounds or reconnect with their bodies, they stay in this self-protection system and their authentic self remains disconnected and never revealed.¹⁴⁰ According to Gilligan, adolescent girls hide their true thoughts from their friends because they are afraid that others might reject them and start unnecessary rumors and gossip, which might in turn hurt them and their relationships with

¹³⁹ Conn, *Spirituality and Personal Maturity*, 56.

¹⁴⁰ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 217.

others.¹⁴¹ When the behaviors they observe and the attitudes they receive from the adult women around them fail to provide them with good role models, this also makes adolescent girls unwilling to speak with their true voices.¹⁴²

It is not enough for women only to recognize and accept the true self without revealing it. The previously mentioned othermother tradition provides a way to help girls and women reveal their true self freely and boldly. Gilligan notes that, “girls may feel most comfortable speaking to a woman they can trust, especially if they cannot trust their peers with certain information.”¹⁴³ Being listened to and feeling understood by an adult is a rare and powerful experience.¹⁴⁴ For adolescent girls to have such adult women to speak to gives them opportunities to talk and think through the important issues without fear of being judged, betrayed, misunderstood, or irritated.¹⁴⁵

Gilligan notes that the benefit these girls derive from the interviews is that talking about their feelings or answering questions helps them to understand themselves better.¹⁴⁶ In response to the interviewer’s attitude of respect and attention, girls are able to speak

¹⁴¹ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 118.

¹⁴² Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 221.

¹⁴³ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 124.

¹⁴⁴ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 120.

¹⁴⁵ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 121.

¹⁴⁶ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 128-130.

openly and share some information they have never shared with anyone else.¹⁴⁷ This same dynamic applies also to adult women who not only need to recognize and accept their true self but also need to have people that they can trust enough to have real conversations in which they reveal this true self by speaking out their inner thoughts or talking about their feelings and expressing their needs without fear of being judged, instructed, corrected, or losing the support of others.

According to Gilligan's studies, to be able to speak out in one's own voice and let others hear that voice can help both women themselves and others. The important thing is to let the voice out, no matter what the voice might be. In Gilligan's words, small voices can begin "to give way to stronger voices" and when "women began to speak in public and to act on the basis of what they knew through experience [then they begin] to trust their own experience and the experiences of girls and other women."¹⁴⁸ In Kegan's fourth stage of institutional balance people attain the "capacity of self-regulation" and "autonomy."¹⁴⁹ The transformation from stage 4, institutional balance, to stage 5, interindividual balance, is the move to human maturity.¹⁵⁰ In Kegan's words, the institutional balance evinces "a

¹⁴⁷ Taylor, Gilligan, and Sullivan, *Between Voice and Silence*, 128.

¹⁴⁸ Brown and Gilligan, *Meeting at the Crossroads*, 224.

¹⁴⁹ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 222.

¹⁵⁰ Conn, *Spirituality and Personal Maturity*, 56.

kind of self-sufficiency which is at a whole new level of complexity.”¹⁵¹ Kegan suggests that the self-naming and self-nourishing of the institutional balance converts the world “within its reach to operate on behalf of its personal enterprise.”¹⁵² Women at this stage are able to reveal their true self because they have developed the capacity of self-regulation and autonomy and, most important of all, a kind of self-sufficiency that allows women to speak out their own voice with confidence.

However, institutional balance tends to include “feelings of negative self-evaluation,” feelings that one’s personal organization is threatened or about to collapse, “fears about losing one’s control and one’s precious sense of being distinct.”¹⁵³ Kegan suggests that, “the child’s rage and shame and fear of her own impulses certainly find echoes in the institutional adult’s depressive self-anger, guilty self-shame, and fears about boundary loss.”¹⁵⁴ Thus the process of revealing the authentic self may take a long time and might go back and forth. Only when women develop their self in interindividual balance and recognize and accept this true self is the authentic self able to be well-developed and be revealed freely in a positive and sustained way.

¹⁵¹ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 223.

¹⁵² Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 223.

¹⁵³ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 223.

¹⁵⁴ Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 223.

Neuroscience Studies about Women

Whereas the first part of this chapter focused on how human brains develop and work in daily life, the second part focuses on gender differences in the human brain.

The Development, Organization, and Working System of the Brain

In terms of the human brain's physical development, the third to sixth month of gestation is the time when the greatest density of brain cell growth occurs.¹⁵⁵ Richard Restak explains the major brain development that occurs in this period: by the third week of development, neurons are forming at a rate of more than 250,000 per minute and the final number of neurons at birth will surpass one hundred billion.¹⁵⁶ General speaking, the early development of the brain focuses on survival skills, and later development focuses on pursuing a qualitative social life.¹⁵⁷ A human brain is “born with a basic, survival-level version of most brain systems” and over time extends its abilities to be able to deal with “more complex, culturally driven challenges.”¹⁵⁸

Robert Sylwester writes that human beings' brains are “anatomically organized and

¹⁵⁵ Barry Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential of the Teenage Brain: 10 Powerful Ideas* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press, 2008), 17.

¹⁵⁶ Richard M. Restak, *The Secret Life of the Brain* (Washington, DC: Co-publication of the Dana Press and Joseph Henry Press, 2001), 2.

¹⁵⁷ Robert Sylwester, *The Adolescent Brain: Reaching for Autonomy* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press, 2007), 21.

¹⁵⁸ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 21.

develop from the bottom to top, back to front, and right to left.”¹⁵⁹ Following his rubric, I therefore similarly follow the brain’s development from bottom to top, back to front, and left to right.

Bottom-to-Top Organization

The reason that neuroscientists say that the development of the brain is from the bottom to top is based on the developmental order of the parts in the brain. Human brains have three parts: (1) the subcortical system; (2) the cerebellum; and (3) the cerebral cortex/cortex.¹⁶⁰ The subcortical system, which includes the “finger-size brain stem,” maintains many bodily survival functions, among them respiration, circulation, and so on.¹⁶¹ This system also works to “synthesize and distribute many of the neurotransmitters that move chemical information within and among neural networks.”¹⁶² The cerebellum is located behind the brain stem and arranges the “movement sequences with sensory information and participates with the frontal lobes in complex planning activities.”¹⁶³ There are six large layers deeply folded into the cerebral cortex, which occupies about eighty percent of the mass of a human brain.¹⁶⁴

¹⁵⁹ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 22.

¹⁶⁰ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 24. The figure of the brain system on page 25 illustrates this.

¹⁶¹ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 24.

¹⁶² Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 24.

¹⁶³ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 24.

¹⁶⁴ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 24.

The cerebral cortex is composed of gray matter and white matter.¹⁶⁵ The gray matter is made up of neurons. Most neuron cells have three main parts: the body cell, dendrites, and the axon.¹⁶⁶ The body cell contains the nucleus, the dendrites are the thousands of tiny fingerlike projections, and the axon is a single arm or fiber.¹⁶⁷ Neuron cells are not able to regenerate but are able to transmit or communicate information through electrochemical signals.¹⁶⁸

The white matter is made up of myelin, a white fatty substance, which is like a sheath and covers the axon.¹⁶⁹ The function of myelin is to insulate the axon and make sure the axon can pass along the electrical impulses more quickly and without interruption.¹⁷⁰ This is how human neuron cells transmit or process information.

In general, the subcortical system controls the body system and maintains “a constant rhythmic pattern” of our body.¹⁷¹ If the subcortical system cannot function well, it causes a crisis of life. Therefore, the subcortical system is the center of life. The cerebellum mainly controls muscle movements and motor skills, like the coordination of

¹⁶⁵ Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

¹⁶⁶ Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

¹⁶⁷ Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

¹⁶⁸ Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

¹⁶⁹ Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

¹⁷⁰ Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

¹⁷¹ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 24.

balance and body posture.¹⁷² The cerebral cortex has to deal with many complicated and irregular challenges so it is involved in many neuronal processes.¹⁷³ In terms of the development of brain, the subconscious emotional system matures early and the conscious problem-solving system mainly develops in adolescence.¹⁷⁴

Back-to-Front Organization of the Cortex

The development sequence of the cortex in human brains is from back to front.¹⁷⁵ If we put an imaginary line across the skull from the left ear to the right ear, we can separate our brain into two parts, the front and the rear parts.¹⁷⁶ There are three sensory lobes in the rear part — the occipital (that processes vision), the parietal (that processes touch), and the temporal (that processes hearing) lobes.¹⁷⁷ The frontal lobe, which includes the prefrontal cortex and the motor cortex, is located in the front part.¹⁷⁸

External stimulation/information is dealt with primarily by the back of the sensory lobes, which are related to vision, touch, and hearing. The back-to-front organization of the cortex allows for a recognition/response system of integrating the stimulation/

¹⁷² Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 20.

¹⁷³ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 24.

¹⁷⁴ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 26.

¹⁷⁵ Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

¹⁷⁶ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 26.

¹⁷⁷ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 26.

¹⁷⁸ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 26. The figure on page 27 illustrates it.

information.¹⁷⁹ When the brain receives the external stimulus, the information goes to the sensory lobes in the rear part of the brain. The neurons transmit the information to the front part of the brain after the sensory lobes receive the information from the neurons. The motor cortex of the frontal lobe is located behind the prefrontal cortex and is the place where conscious responses are initiated.¹⁸⁰

The integration that happens in our frontal lobe allows us to “consider options, predict consequences, and properly pace the elements of our response.”¹⁸¹ This is different from the purely reactive behavior of animals. In the area of the frontal lobe, the prefrontal cortex area plays a crucial role in interconnecting every functional part of the brain and has a great effect when human beings are making decisions.¹⁸² Human beings’ reactions/decisions begin from the level of the general goal; when the process activities move from the motor cortex to the prefrontal cortex, these reactions/decisions become specific goals.

¹⁷⁹ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 26.

¹⁸⁰ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 28.

¹⁸¹ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 28.

¹⁸² Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 28.

Right-to-Left Organization of the Cortex

Besides the front and rear parts, the cortex can also be divided into right and left parts. The right hemisphere (in most humans) is “organized principally to process novel challenges and creative solutions,” and the left hemisphere processes “familiar challenges and established routines.”¹⁸³ Recent neuroscience research also shows that the functions of the left hemisphere are about “lexical and syntactic language,” “writing” and “speech” and that the right hemisphere deals with the tasks of “emotional coloring of language,” “spatial abilities,” and “rudimentary speech.”¹⁸⁴ Daniel Siegel, a clinical professor of psychiatry at the UCLA School of Medicine and Executive Director of the Mindsight Institute, explains that the task of the right hemisphere is to reveal “nonverbal, holistic, visuospatial, and then a whole host of noncorrelated specialties.”¹⁸⁵ The functions of the left hemisphere are the “four L’s” — that is, linguistics, linearity, logic, and literal thinking.¹⁸⁶

Although the right hemisphere deals with novel challenges and the left hemisphere deals with familiar events and routines, one more important idea we need to know is that

¹⁸³ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 29.

¹⁸⁴ Dale Purves et al., ed., *Neuroscience*, 5th ed. (Sunderland, MA: Sinauer Associates, 2012), 616.

¹⁸⁵ Daniel J. Siegel, *The Mindful Brain: Reflection and Attunement in the Cultivation of Well-being* (New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2007), 46.

¹⁸⁶ Siegel, *Mindful Brain*, 45.

“the relative level of involvement shifts from the right to the left hemisphere over time and with increased familiarity and competence.”¹⁸⁷ When human beings confront new stimuli/information, the right hemisphere tries to deal with it and shifts this process to the left hemisphere. The “left hemisphere routines are best developed through right hemisphere explorations focused initially on understanding the nature and importance of the challenge.”¹⁸⁸ Although the right and left hemispheres have different functions, “the brain can harness them into a state of connection to achieve more complex and adaptive functions.”¹⁸⁹ Both the right and left hemispheres are working together and accumulate the experiences. This is thought to be a kind of “neural integration.”¹⁹⁰ Therefore, neuroscientists think that learning actually “begins with right hemisphere exploration.”¹⁹¹

As humans gain experience through the things they have learned, the reactions of the brain shifts to the left hemisphere and this process becomes a circle. This is the reason why people say that practice makes perfect. This idea is really important for teachers in teaching students. If the teacher repeatedly gives students the answer, then the students will naturally memorize the answer rather than find the solution by themselves. Not expecting

¹⁸⁷ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 29.

¹⁸⁸ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 30.

¹⁸⁹ Siegel, *Mindful Brain*, 46.

¹⁹⁰ Siegel, *Mindful Brain*, 46.

¹⁹¹ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 30.

students to figure things out for themselves hinders the development of the right hemisphere of their brains. Also, since the human brain accumulates experiences all the time and tends to develop more efficient routines to deal with similar situations, as the human being ages, his brain can get used to dealing with similar situations and become set in its ways. This is why people sometimes lack the capacity to confront novel challenges.¹⁹²

Human beings are a social species. Therefore, when a brain confronts a new challenge/discussion with a group of brains, a different pathway is going to be created between neuron cells in each brain. Sylwester notes that people describe this situation as a “brainstorm.”¹⁹³ He suggests that the process of brainstorming is similar to the work of the “right hemisphere’s sensory/ frontal lobe processing systems.”¹⁹⁴ All kinds of answers are welcomed in brainstorming activities. They do not have to be the best options, just possibilities. In like fashion, when people are talking to each other, they are actually influencing each other’s brains.

Neuroscientists’ Perspectives on Gender Differences

The term “gender” in this section means biological sex, or “genotypic sex.”¹⁹⁵ The

¹⁹² Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 31.

¹⁹³ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 30.

¹⁹⁴ Sylwester, *Adolescent Brain*, 30.

¹⁹⁵ Purves et al., *Neuroscience*, 688.

studies in this section are focused on heterosexual individuals.

We know that there are differences between men's and women's "brain structure, lateralization, and behavior."¹⁹⁶ What those differences are differs according to the scientist you ask.

Structural and Organization Differences

According to the work of Vesna Mildner, Associate Dean of the Faculty of Humanities and Social Sciences, and Associate Professor in the Department of Phonetics, University of Zagreb, male and female brains are "organized differently from the first days of life" and the sex hormones control this differentiation.¹⁹⁷ A thicker cortex of the right hemisphere as compared to the left has been found in male, but not in female, fetuses.¹⁹⁸ The sex difference in the hypothalamus, a portion of the brain that contains a number of small nuclei with a variety of functions, occurs around the age of four.¹⁹⁹ The corpus callosum, a wide, flat bundle of neural fibers that connect the left and right hemispheres and facilitate interhemispheric communication, is larger in women than in men and reaches its maximal width by age 20 in men and between 41 and 50 years of

¹⁹⁶ Vesna Mildner, *The Cognitive Neuroscience of Human Communication* (New York: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2008), 39.

¹⁹⁷ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 40.

¹⁹⁸ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39.

¹⁹⁹ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39.

age in women.

Mildner's research also reveals that the average brain mass of men is approximately 10% greater than in women and the differences in mass between the two hemispheres (right hemisphere has greater mass, whereas the left hemisphere has greater density) are smaller in women than in men.²⁰⁰ The shape of the left lateral fissure corresponds to the right in more women than men.²⁰¹ "In women, the left planum temporale," a triangular region which forms the heart of Wernicke's area, one of the most important functional areas for language, "is not as frequently larger than the right as it has been found in men."²⁰² In addition, the research of Charles A. Nelson, a professor of pediatrics at Harvard Medical School, finds that women tend "to show more bilateral activation" in the front regions while men have "more right-lateralized activation in [the] parietal regions."²⁰³ Siegel also asserts that "female brain development appears to involve more integration, with a thicker corpus callosum that connects the left and right hemispheres."²⁰⁴

Mildner asserts that there is greater gray matter density in most neocortical regions

²⁰⁰ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39.

²⁰¹ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39.

²⁰² Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39.

²⁰³ Charles A. Nelson, Michelle de Haan, and Kathleen M. Thomas, *Neuroscience of Cognitive Development: The Role of Experience and the Developing Brain* (Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2006), 102.

²⁰⁴ Siegel, *Mindful Brain*, 45.

in women, and that the greatest sex differences are found in the left middle temporal gyrus, in the right parietal lobules, and in the left precuneus.²⁰⁵ Gray matter is made by neurons and relates to transmitting or communicating information through electrochemical signals.²⁰⁶ This concept supports Siegel's idea of the bilateral activation in women's brains.

Although the organization of male and female brains is different in the beginning, Mildner suggests that there is no evidence that neural connections or brain architecture is any different between men and women.²⁰⁷ The structural differences between men's and women's brains are mainly in the way the male and female brains organize and in the size or mass of different parts of the brain.

Behavior and Cognitive Differences

Mildner suggests that the differences in cognitive abilities between men and women are most frequently found in "the language and spatial domains."²⁰⁸ "On IQ tests," says Mildner, "girls score consistently better on verbal tasks and poorer on visuospatial tasks than boys, especially after puberty."²⁰⁹ She thinks that the spatial ability is also influenced by sex hormones.²¹⁰ Furthermore, this situation also extends to adult women who continue

²⁰⁵ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39.

²⁰⁶ See the section of Bottom to Top Organization; and Corbin, *Unleashing the Potential*, 17.

²⁰⁷ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39.

²⁰⁸ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 40.

²⁰⁹ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41.

²¹⁰ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 43.

to outperform men on verbal tasks.²¹¹ Mark F. Bear, professor of neuroscience at Harvard

Hughes Medical Institute, also finds “that women are better at verbal tasks than men.”²¹²

In addition, Mildner thinks that because they are encouraged to do so by parents and society, boys tend “to investigate more” and girls tend “to be more social.”²¹³

Mildner’s words below illustrate this idea more clearly:

During the thousands of years of human brain development people have lived in relatively small groups of hunters and gatherers, with probably clear division of labor between men and women. Men engaged in hunting, which frequently involved covering great distances and developing strategies for finding and overpowering animals. They were responsible for the defense of the group against predators and enemies as well as for the design, manufacture, and use of weapons. Women were most probably in charge of tending to the home, which involved child care, gathering food nearby, preparing meals, and making clothes. Such specialization assumed different pressures on men and women. Men had to develop skills of aiming and finding their way on the basis of terrain configuration, and women had to develop fine motor skills in a limited space and sensitivity to small differences in the environment as well as in the appearance and behavior of children.²¹⁴

Bear also suggests that, “sex hormones determine the sexual identity of the brain

²¹¹ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41.

²¹² Mark F. Bear, Barry W. Connors, and Michael A. Paradiso, *Neuroscience: Exploring the Brain*, 3rd ed. (Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins, 2007), 566-567.

²¹³ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41.

²¹⁴ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41. Similar ideas are also seen in: Bear, Connors, and Paradiso, *Neuroscience*, 566.

during early development.”²¹⁵ He presents an interesting story of John/Joan regarding the basis of gender identity.²¹⁶ John is a normal healthy baby when he is born but his life changed after a circumcision goes wrong, and an electrocautery device burns John’s entire penis. After thinking it through, John’s parents decide to let John have gender transformation surgery, turning him into a girl. John’s parents change his name to Joan and raise him as a female without him knowing that he is genetically a male. At the age of 14, John expresses that he struggles with his sexuality, and that he feels like a boy trapped in a girl’s body. John’s father finally tells him what has happened to him and John immediately requests sex-change hormonal therapy and surgery. John is now married and has adopted his wife’s children from a previous marriage. John/Joan’s story also indicates how brains influence the differences of male and female behaviors. The behavior and cognitive differences of brains between men and women relate not only to physical issues, but also to hereditary factors and environmental and cultural influences.

With Mildner’s research in mind, it makes more sense that women are much better in “verbal fluency, including the ability to find words that begin with a given letter or that satisfy some other criterion” since women have developed the ability of verbal

²¹⁵ Bear, Connors, and Paradiso, *Neuroscience*, 567.

²¹⁶ Bear, Connors, and Paradiso, *Neuroscience*, 572.

communication in order to take care of the family, especially the children.²¹⁷ Furthermore, Mildner also finds that “early maturing adolescents (typically women) achieve better results on verbal than on spatial tasks.”²¹⁸ Those “late maturers (boys) can develop language abilities in the left hemisphere without interference with the right-hemisphere functions” so “the right hemisphere is free to develop its visuospatial abilities.”²¹⁹ This concept explains why men typically outperform women on spatial tasks. Mildner’s research also echoes Sylwester’s brain development theory. Sylwester’s brain development theory indicates that the sequence of brain development follows the right-to-left organization of the cortex. Therefore, the late maturers have more chances to develop other abilities with their right hemisphere while the early maturers are using both hemispheres to develop their verbal abilities. Mildner indicated that this situation can also put men (or later maturers) “at risk with respect to language disorders, because they have no alternative support system in the nondominant hemisphere.”²²⁰

Mildner also asserts that, “women have greater perceptual speed” which means that women “are quicker to find objects that match some target object.”²²¹ Another thing in

²¹⁷ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41.

²¹⁸ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 42.

²¹⁹ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 42.

²²⁰ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 43.

²²¹ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41.

Mildner's researches relating to this idea is that women are better at "remembering landmarks."²²² Men tend to be better at "mathematical reasoning tests" while women are better on "mental arithmetic."²²³ Men and women tend to excel in different ways and this is likely because of the structural and processing differences of male and female brains.

Other Views on Gender Differences of Neuroscience

The perspectives of psychologists and philosophers present some alternative viewpoints to these neuroscientific findings. Ginger Hoffman, an assistant professor in the Department of Philosophy at Saint Joseph's University in Philadelphia,²²⁴ thinks that neuroscience research does indeed provide "evidence of a physical difference between genders."²²⁵ However, she suggests that the difference in the brain structures does not necessarily cause the mental differences between men and women.²²⁶ Hoffman asserts that "the mental states of interest may be multiply realized across genders."²²⁷ She continues: "the very same mental state could be instantiated by one brain area in women and by a

²²² Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41.

²²³ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41.

²²⁴ This is Ginger Hoffman's assertion. See Ginger Hoffman, "What, If Anything, Can Neuroscience Tell Us About Gender Differences?," in *Neurofeminism: Issues at the Intersection of Feminist Theory and Cognitive Science*, ed. Robyn Bluhm, Anne Jaap Jacobson, and Heidi Lene Maibom (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012), 30-55.

²²⁵ Hoffman, "What Can Neuroscience Tell Us," 51.

²²⁶ Hoffman, "What Can Neuroscience Tell Us," 51-52.

²²⁷ Hoffman, "What Can Neuroscience Tell Us," 52.

different brain area in men.”²²⁸ Cordelia Fine, a senior research associate at the Centre for Agency, Values and Ethics at Macquarrie University and an Honorary Research Fellow at the University of Melbourne’s Department of Psychology, claims that “the female brain [that] skews toward ‘long-range’ and ‘interhemispheric connectivity’ is better structured for empathizing.”²²⁹

Hoffman suggests that the factors that cause the innate gender differences also include genetic and environmental issues.²³⁰ Melissa Hines, a professor of Psychology and the Director of the Hormones and Behavior Research Lab at the University of Cambridge, likewise suggests that the causes of gender differences are “biological or social/cultural, when in many cases, they are both,”²³¹ and asserts that, “experience can influence hormone levels.”²³² Furthermore, Hines explains that “hormones can override information from the sex chromosomes in determining sex-related characteristics” and cause the different behaviors between men and women.²³³ In addition to hormones, Hines also claims that expectations and beliefs “can engender the brain.”²³⁴ Fine also notes that, “our hormones

²²⁸ Hoffman, “What Can Neuroscience Tell Us,” 38-39, and 52.

²²⁹ Cordelia Fine, *Delusions of Gender: How our Minds, Society, and Neurosexism Create Difference* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2010), 139.

²³⁰ Hoffman, “What Can Neuroscience Tell Us,” 52.

²³¹ Melissa Hines, *Brain Gender*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2004), 213.

²³² Hines, *Brain Gender*, 214.

²³³ Hines, *Brain Gender*, 228.

²³⁴ Hines, *Brain Gender*, 227.

respond to the life we lead.”²³⁵ She indicates that this idea explains why both mothers’ and fathers’ hormones “change during the transition to parenthood.”²³⁶ Mildner’s research finds “that sex hormones change male and female brains in such ways that they respond differently to social influences.”²³⁷

Hoffman argues that neuro-data fails to “provide any evidence of a permanent gender difference” and asserts that, “the brain itself is highly plastic (malleable).”²³⁸ Hines also thinks that the brain is quite malleable since “the adult brain undergoes dendritic growth, synapse formation, and even the birth of new neurons.”²³⁹ The same opinion is also held by Nelson, the neuroscientist, who notes that, “the developing brain is very plastic.”²⁴⁰ Hoffman concludes his studies by saying that the neuro-evidence about brain differences between genders “may do little or nothing to support the idea that genders are essentially or importantly different from one another.”²⁴¹ Fine also thinks that the gender differences are caused by human beings’ minds, society, and neurosexism and that these factors are soft wired and therefore “flexible, malleable, and changeable.”²⁴²

²³⁵ Fine, *Delusions of Gender*, 87.

²³⁶ Fine, *Delusions of Gender*, 87.

²³⁷ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 43.

²³⁸ Hoffman, “What Can Neuroscience Tell Us,” 52.

²³⁹ Hines, *Brain Gender*, 218.

²⁴⁰ Nelson, Haan, and Thomas, *Neuroscience of Cognitive Development*, 36.

²⁴¹ Hoffman, “What Can Neuroscience Tell Us,” 53.

²⁴² Fine, *Delusions of Gender*, 239.

Although it has been proved that there are differences between men's and women's brains, Mildner's reminder is a useful one: "the differences among individuals of the same sex are greater than the differences between sexes."²⁴³

²⁴³ Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 39. Similar thoughts are also seen in: Bear, Connors, and Paradiso, *Neuroscience*, 566.

Chapter 4

Literature Review on the Theories of Women's Pedagogy and Spiritual Formation in Theological Education

This chapter reviews the literature on the research of women's theological education with a focus on the theories of women's pedagogy and spiritual formation in theological education. For women's pedagogy, there are several important assertions from different theologians and research groups. The literature that pays attention to women's spirituality is inspiring and creative. Two themes from this literature are represented in this chapter: teaching women in theological education, and women's spiritual growth within theological education. Each theme is illustrated with four approaches.

Literatures of Women's Pedagogy and Spiritual Formation

The Pioneer Educator and Following Women Pedagogy Researchers

Paulo Freire, a Brazilian liberal educator, and his book, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, brought liberal and advanced educational concepts to traditional education. For instance, Freire takes to task the idea of banking education, which refers to teachers depositing their knowledge in students, just as one deposits money in the bank, and the students have no choice but to receive what the teacher has taught them. Freire thought that the students

needed to be liberated from this and by dialoguing with teachers in the learning process. Freire's concepts have inspired and been echoed by many of the following women pedagogy researchers and theologians.

The Cornwall Collective's *Your Daughters Shall Prophesy: Feminist Alternatives in Theological Education* is an important book published in 1980. The Cornwall Collective is composed of women who took on feminist issues within theological education and become a research group collecting primary data from the female programs of several woman's centers, coalitions, and theological institutions in the 1980s. The Cornwall Collective suggests some alternative forms of theological education in this book. The book of the Mud Flower Collective, *God's Fierce Whimsy: Christian Feminism and Theological Education*, was published in 1985 and represents seven female scholars' perspectives and experiences from their backgrounds. This book provides women-centered viewpoints and challenges the theologians to make considerations of race, ethnicity, and sexuality part of theological education.

Inspired by Freire's concepts and other cognitive development theories, *Women's Ways of Knowing: The Development of Self, Voice, and Mind* (hereafter WWK) was published in 1986 and became one of the important books on women's pedagogy. This

book portrays women's process of cognitive development with five perspectives and also has been influential for other women pedagogy researchers. The authors of WWK continued their research, one result of which was *Knowledge, Difference, and Power: Essays inspired by Women's Way of Knowing*, published in 1996. In WWK, the authors review women's learning concepts in the first part and go deeper to connect women's learning with the topics of culture, power, and ways of knowing in the remaining two parts of this book.

Other Feminist Educators and Theologians and Their Assertions

Mary Elizabeth Mullino Moore, an educator and current dean of the Boston University School of Theology, in her first book, *Education for Continuity and Change*, talks about cross-cultural issues and global concerns for religious education based in theology, sociology, and anthropology. Her second book, which is also her main work, *Teaching from the Heart*, was published in 1991 and re-published in 1998. In this book, Moore connects Process Theology with five educational methods: case study (midwife teaching – teaching students to see more from specific viewpoints), gestalt (integrative teaching – to help students seek unity among them while showing their variety), phenomenological (incarnational teaching – listening, observing, and dialogue are

important elements in teaching), narrative (relational teaching – to invite students to engage the imagination), and conscientizing (liberative teaching – focus on oppressive social realities and to name and transform them). Moore’s passion for process theology and religious education is also evident in her other three books, *Ministering to the Earth*, *Covenant and Call: Mission of the Future Church*, and *Teaching as a Sacramental Act*.

Rebecca Chopp, the first female Chancellor of the University of Denver, in her first two books, *The Praxis of Suffering* (published in 1986) and *The Power to Speak* (published in 1989), shows her concerns about feminist theology and liberal theology and finds a new way to do/practice theology. Chopp’s most important work regarding the practice of feminist theology and theological education, *Saving Work*, was published in 1995. Inspired by prior feminist educators and researches, Chopp connects the feminist practices (the practices of Narrativity, Ekklesia, and Theology) with theological education and suggests new ways to do theological education.

Another noteworthy work of women’s pedagogy, *Women as Learners: The Significance of Gender in Adult Learning*, was published in 2000. A collection of articles by Elisabeth Hayes, a professor at the University of Wisconsin-Madison, Daniele D. Flannery, an associate professor at Penn State-Harrisburg, and other authors, this book

discusses women's learning together with issues of identity, self-esteem, the social world, and power. In addition, this book also reveals many ideas about the women-experienced learning process based on these authors' research and teaching experiences of women's life stories.

The Contribution of Female Spiritual Development Theory

Maria Harris, a significant Christian educator, focuses on women's pedagogy, aesthetics, and spirituality, and has written many books about women's pedagogy and spiritual development. Her first two books, *Teaching and Religious Imagination: An Essay in the Theology of Teaching* and *Women and Teaching: Themes for a Spirituality of Pedagogy*, were published in 1987. In *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, Harris presents her teaching concepts about applying religious imagination as a teaching activity. In another book, *Women and Teaching*, Harris applies the idea of dance steps to a spirituality of teaching that can liberate women. Two years later, Harris developed her concepts of dance steps more deeply in another book, *Dance of the Spirit: The Seven Steps of Women's Spirituality* that was published in 1989. The seven steps of women's spirituality are: Awakening, Dis-Covering, Creating, Dwelling, Nourishing, Traditioning, and Transforming. Harris declares that, in each step of women's spirituality, women encounter

challenges as they moving forward and finding their spiritual birthright of the fullness and uniqueness inside of them.

Another significant book about women's spiritual development is *Women's Faith Development: Patterns and Processes* written by Nicola Slee, a feminist theologian and Research Fellow and MA Team leader at the Queen's Foundation for Ecumenical Theological Education in Birmingham, England. Slee represents the connections among practical theological concerns, pastoral practice, and Christian Education in this book. With a foundation of James Fowler's faith development theory and feminist models of women's faith, Slee applies social science methodology and researches thirty women mainly from Christian backgrounds. Slee represents the patterns and processes of women's faith development and spirituality based on these women's experiences.

Conn connects development psychology and spirituality in these books. In *Spirituality and Personal Maturity*, published in 1989, Conn looks at spirituality in different ways. She explains the relationship between psychology, spirituality, and human maturity and shows how the idea of self-denial in Christian spirituality can be related to the concept of self-fulfillment in contemporary psychology. Conn applies the method of case studies from the practice of pastoral counseling and spiritual direction, especially the

cases in the struggles of spiritual darkness and psychological depression and provides different views for ministry and feminist theology. *Women's Spirituality* was first published in 1986 with a second edition in 1996. In this book, Conn offers perspectives on the spiritual and psychological dimensions of women's lives through an anthology of writings that she divides into four sections. In addition to Conn, the contributors to this book include: Anne Carr, Kathleen Fischer, Constance FitzGerald, James Fowler, Carol Gilligan, Rosemary Haughton, Elizabeth A. Johnson, Robert Kegan, John McDargh, Jean Baker Miller, Sandra M. Schneiders, Elisabeth Schüssler Fiorenza, Mary Jo Weaver, Rowan Williams, and Wendy M. Wright.

A rather different but also interesting book about relating spirituality to creativity is Julia Cameron's *The Artist's Way: A Spiritual Path to Higher Creativity*, published in 1992. Based on her teaching experiences in a creativity spiritual workshop, here Cameron offers a twelve-week group meeting program to help readers remove the obstacles hindering their artistic creativity and their spiritual connection with God. This program is designed to facilitate supportive relationships between women and to help one another in the group to build up self-esteem and receive one's artistic inspiration from God.

Teaching Women in Theological Education

Every woman has her own way of learning. Feminist theological thought has been one of the fundamental concepts for female pedagogy in theological education. How can women pedagogy help female seminarians to learn, understand and, furthermore, strengthen their theological thinking skills, which could assist not only themselves but also the people, especially women, they encounter in their ministry? There are several indispensable elements in female pedagogy that are integral to theological education. The four approaches to women pedagogy in theological education presented in this section are based on the ideas of female-centered, experience-based, cooperatively oriented, and open-access learning.

Dialogue Process – A Way for Women to Voice Their Inner Thoughts

The first approach of women pedagogy is women's needs to be able to voice their inner thoughts. The concept of dialogue in Freire's *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* is one that many feminist theologians and other female pedagogues have mentioned. Freire's metaphor of banking education assumes that "the students are the depositories and the teacher is the depositor."²⁴⁴ Since women have been oppressed by patriarchal society for

²⁴⁴ Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, trans. Myra Bergman Ramos, 1970, reprint (New York: Seabury Press, 1974), 58.

a long time, it takes much energy to liberate women from this influence. Freire's opinions of dialogue process provide women, especially oppressed women, a chance to speak out. To have a dialogue process and invite everyone involved in class to speak is one way to get women to articulate their inner thoughts. The dialogue process provides women, especially oppressed women, a chance to voice their inner feelings, struggles, and problems.

The four authors of WWK recall Freire's thoughts of banking education and come to the conclusion that the role of the teachers is like that of the midwife.²⁴⁵ The authors think that midwife-teachers focus on learners' knowledge and encourage the learners "to speak in their own active voice."²⁴⁶ This idea relates to Freire's notion that loving, humble, and faithful dialogue can build mutual trust relationship between teachers and learners.²⁴⁷ The trusting relationship between teachers and learners is a prerequisite for teachers in order to be able to help learners to speak out their own active voice, just like a midwife helps mothers to give birth to their babies.

Harris also identifies the importance of a woman speaking out her own voice in her book, *Women and Teaching*. Based on Harris' assertion, the first step to stop experiencing

²⁴⁵ Belenky et al., *Women's Ways of Knowing*, 217-219.

²⁴⁶ Belenky et al., *Women's Ways of Knowing*, 218.

²⁴⁷ Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 78.

women's silence is to have women speak.²⁴⁸ To awaken women from silence and let them begin to practice saying their own names and finding their own voices is what the teachers need to teach.²⁴⁹ Harris reminds us that there are many essays and books on this theme, among them: *Lies, Secrets and Silences* written by Adrienne Rich; Carol Gilligan's work *In A Different Voice*; Tillie Olsen's series of essays, *Silence*; and *The Sound Of Our Own Voices* by Theodora Penny Martin.²⁵⁰

The Mud Flower Collective discusses the process of dialogue in *God's Fierce Whimsy* and notes that "a dialogue process assumes mutuality between teachers and students: educators learn and learners educate."²⁵¹ After being involved in theological education and in ordained ministry for many years, Chopp asserts that women help the balance by adding new perspectives and styles.²⁵² Moore, in her book, *Teaching from the Heart*, reflects her teaching experiences and says that both teachers and learners can learn together.²⁵³

²⁴⁸ Maria Harris, *Women and Teaching: Themes for a Spirituality of Pedagogy* (New York: Paulist Press, 1988), 27.

²⁴⁹ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 27.

²⁵⁰ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 17.

²⁵¹ The Mud Flower Collective, *God's Fierce Whimsy: Christian Feminism and Theological Education* (New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1985), 205.

²⁵² Rebecca S. Chopp, *Saving Work: Feminist Practices of Theological Education* (Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1995), 3.

²⁵³ Mary Elizabeth Mullino Moore, *Teaching from the Heart: Theology and Educational Method* (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1991), 200.

Both Chopp and Moore's words support The Mud Flower Collective's ideas. When women are involved into the dialogue process, they are participating and adding new thoughts so that everyone, both teachers and learners, learns from the process of education. In other words, new learning experiences happen in the dialogue process. This is related to "Birthing," the fifth steps of female pedagogy, which is Harris' work based on the life and experiences of women.²⁵⁴ According to Harris, the last stage of birthing is having "the sense of a new kind of universal bliss after birth."²⁵⁵ The parallel experience for a learner is "experiencing herself or himself as subject, as a receptor of the grace of power – coming to birth."²⁵⁶ Harris goes deeper and describes that birthing takes time and come "in its own time."²⁵⁷ Similarly, Moore mentions that a teacher plays the role of midwife and assists "in the birth process" in teaching.²⁵⁸ Relating this concept to the ideas of WWK, the role of a teacher is like that of a midwife who focuses on learners' knowledge and encourages the learners to give birth to "their own active voice."²⁵⁹

²⁵⁴ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 15-16.

²⁵⁵ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 79.

²⁵⁶ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 81.

²⁵⁷ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 81.

²⁵⁸ Moore, *Teaching from the Heart*, 98.

²⁵⁹ Belenky et al., *Women's Ways of Knowing*, 217-219.

Hayes claims that there are three meanings of voice related to women's learning, which are voice as talk, identity, and power.²⁶⁰ She notes that voice as talk suggests "the importance of gender-related patterns of speech and communication in learning," and voice as identity emphasizes "that how women develop and express identities is a key dimension of learning."²⁶¹ Regarding the idea of voice as power, Hayes thinks that it reflects that women's learning is "affected by unequal power relationships and that for women a goal of learning can be to acquire individual and collective power through the expression and validation of their interests, needs, and experiences."²⁶²

Furthermore, in order to have teachers be able to help learners talk about their own active voice, it is important that teachers establish a relationship of trust with learners. The essence of building up the trust relationship, *pace* Freire's ideas, is to have a loving, humble, and faithful dialogue process.²⁶³ Moreover, love, humility and, faith are at the core of Christian theology. Thus a loving, humble, and faithful dialogue process is a fitting way for women to speak out.

²⁶⁰ Elisabeth Hayes et al., *Women as Learners: The Significance of Gender in Adult Learning* (San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 2000), 108-109.

²⁶¹ Hayes et al., *Women as Learners*, 108.

²⁶² Hayes et al., *Women as Learners*, 108.

²⁶³ Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 78.

A Support Group – Strength for Women to Transform

Much research has shown that having connections with others and supporting each other are important skills and values for women.²⁶⁴ Chopp notes that women start to feel they belong to each other when they learn that they have the right and power to speak.²⁶⁵ Women need a support group to help them feel comfortable so they are able to voice their inner thoughts and enter into the dialogue process. A support group is what Chopp calls a community of friends.²⁶⁶ According to Chopp, this community of friends can keep women open to being changed and transformed.²⁶⁷ As a feminist theologian, Chopp expands the concept of friend into theology and says that friendship is also “a metaphor from the Christian tradition used to speak of human relationships with God.”²⁶⁸ To apply the concept of a support group to theological education, Chopp includes a theological foundation. Chopp cites Thomas Aquinas’ suggestion that the friendship between human and God is “a kind of intimacy” and this relationship is “a loving with.”²⁶⁹ Therefore, for Chopp, friendship affords “the intimacy that allows us to speak and hear the truth of our

²⁶⁴ Mercy Amba Oduyoye, *Introducing African Women’s Theology* (Cleveland, OH: Sheffield Academic Press, 2001), 29; and Kwok Pui-lan, *Chinese Women and Christianity 1860-1927* (Atlanta, GA: Scholars Press, 1992), 66. Both African feminist theologian, Mercy Amba Oduyoye and Asian feminist theologian, Kwok Pui-lan, assert this concept in their writings.

²⁶⁵ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 65.

²⁶⁶ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 64-66.

²⁶⁷ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 66.

²⁶⁸ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 66.

²⁶⁹ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 66.

lives.”²⁷⁰ Chopp’s words appropriately describe the essence of a support group from a theological perspective.

According to the members of The Cornwall Collective, learning should be “a process of affirming rather than putting down the learners” and should occur in “a supportive environment [where] one dares to claim one’s questions, to think the hitherto unthinkable thought, to make the first tentative explorations into new territory.”²⁷¹ The Cornwall Collective shows that to have a supportive environment helps learners be able to have new insights, which can lead them into a new stage. A support group helps everyone in the group to have the courage to think and speak out those things they have been holding inside and never get a chance or courage to tell. Furthermore, a support group assists group members to step into a new land so they can see differently.

Through studying the theological schools, The Mud Flower Collective asserts that every individual is related to the others and all women in seminaries need to depend on their “solidarity as sisters.”²⁷² They note that, “in the biblical tradition, this solidarity is called love” which “means acting, putting ourselves on the line, with (not for) others, on

²⁷⁰ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 66.

²⁷¹ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophesy: Feminist Alternatives in Theological Education* (New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1980), 57.

²⁷² The Mud Flower Collective, *God’s Fierce Whimsy*, 60.

behalf of the well-being – rights, dignity, needs – of all of us.”²⁷³ For women in seminaries, it is important to have a reliable and loving sisterhood of solidarity.

The authors of WWK suggest that those women who go through five major epistemological stages come to a position where they can “view all knowledge as contextual, experience themselves as creators of knowledge, and value both subjective and objective strategies for knowing.”²⁷⁴ Women in different stages have different tasks to complete. For instance, among the interviewees in WWK’s research, the women in the first category need to “cultivate their capacities for representational thought” and “explore the power that words have for either expressing or developing thought” so they are able to gain their own voice and have the reflection occur.²⁷⁵ The researchers conclude that through sharing, expanding, and reflecting on each other’s experience, people do not remain isolated from others and the self.²⁷⁶

After discovering the epistemology of women, based on Freire’s thoughts of pedagogy, the researchers of WWK suggest the concept of the connected class as being a way to provide “a culture of growth.”²⁷⁷ The teacher in the connected class tries “to create

²⁷³ The Mud Flower Collective, *God’s Fierce Whimsy*, 100.

²⁷⁴ Belenky et al., *Women’s Ways of Knowing*, 15.

²⁷⁵ Belenky et al., *Women’s Ways of Knowing*, 25.

²⁷⁶ Belenky et al., *Women’s Ways of Knowing*, 26.

²⁷⁷ Belenky et al., *Women’s Ways of Knowing*, 221.

groups in which members can nurture each other's thoughts to maturity."²⁷⁸ In this connected class, there is "a conversation in which teacher and students collaborated in constructing a new interpretation" and this class is a kind of class that "women remember with pleasure."²⁷⁹ This kind of connected class is just like a support group that can offer a secure environment for women to be able to open themselves, bring new perspectives, and provide a positive influence through helping women with transformation.

As Freire explains, transformation is a process of becoming one's true self.²⁸⁰ For women in seminary to have a support group allows women boldly and freely to express their own thoughts and, in my opinion, this models the process of transformation. According to Hayes, transformation through narratives is "a way that seems distinctly suited to the ways in which women think about themselves and interact with others" since "good narrative demands that she justify her actions, in terms of either a stereotypical narrative or a new narrative."²⁸¹ Hayes believes that "when women get together to tell stories, they can either reinforce the existing stereotypes, which no longer fit, or they can try to touch those places that are closer to the soul and be caught up in a narrative process

²⁷⁸ Belenky et al., *Women's Ways of Knowing*, 221.

²⁷⁹ Belenky et al., *Women's Ways of Knowing*, 221.

²⁸⁰ Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 159-160.

²⁸¹ Hayes et al., *Women as Learners*, 153.

of transformative learning.”²⁸² Hayes also suggests that connections include “women’s connections with/in themselves and women’s connection with others.”²⁸³ Transformation occurs in the process of building up the connections with self and others, and the support groups are built by having connections with each other.

The words of The Cornwall Collective explain why this is a necessary piece of teaching women in theological education: “The companionship and support of other feminists is critical to our attempts to reform theological education.”²⁸⁴ When women are able to trust others in the support groups and represent themselves in front of people they are empowered and this kind of empowerment is a “key to any significant change in theological education that will benefit women.”²⁸⁵

Alternative Space – An Opening for Women to Learn More

Women have lived in patriarchal culture for a long time and need to be liberated and transformed. This idea recalls Freire’s goal for education — to liberate and transform the oppressed.²⁸⁶ The traditional patriarchal idea that “nice girls fulfill other people’s expectations” has long become embedded in women’s hearts and minds.²⁸⁷ The Cornwall

²⁸² Hayes et al., *Women as Learners*, 153.

²⁸³ Hayes et al., *Women as Learners*, 137.

²⁸⁴ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophesy*, 10.

²⁸⁵ The Mud Flower Collective, *God’s Fierce Whimsy*, 60.

²⁸⁶ Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 28-29, and 159-160.

²⁸⁷ Belenky et al., *Women’s Ways of Knowing*, 206.

Collective's researchers assert that women with self-confidence have "been limited by their life circumstances."²⁸⁸ In the atmosphere of patriarchy, female clergy encounter more criticisms than male ones in a church or ministry setting.²⁸⁹ Based on a liberal and feminist theological perspective, Chopp asserts that justice is one of the themes in theological education because justice allows everyone to have his or her voice and demands an examination of the process of life together.²⁹⁰ To achieve this goal, having alternative spaces helps everyone in the community to encourage each other to come to voice and respect each other's opinions.

Alternative spaces, in the words of The Cornwall Collective's researchers, are "spaces where women's concerns can be treated as central."²⁹¹ The reason that these researchers assert this idea is that they find that women have been marginalized in theological schools in the 1980s where they are "latecomers to the seminary scene and remain marginal to the system,"²⁹² and that these women do "not expect colleges to honor their concerns."²⁹³ Chopp concurs and describes how "many women spoke of how often their experiences had been dismissed, ignored, belittled, or just never mentioned within the

²⁸⁸ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophecy*, 9.

²⁸⁹ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 46.

²⁹⁰ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 44-45.

²⁹¹ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophecy*, 55.

²⁹² The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophecy*, 49-50.

²⁹³ Belenky et al., *Women's Ways of Knowing*, 198.

‘traditional’ classrooms of theological education.”²⁹⁴ The Cornwall Collective thinks that women creating an alternative space for themselves was a natural reaction for the women who have been marginalized.²⁹⁵

The Cornwall Collective’s researchers enlarge the idea of alternative spaces and claim that alternative spaces provide “opportunities for personal growth, or creativity and resource development, for a new learning process, for experiments with new structures and forms of action.”²⁹⁶ This notion of alternative spaces can be related to the connected teachers, teachers who “welcome the diversity of opinion in class discussion,” according to the authors of WWK.²⁹⁷ To have alternative spaces helps teachers to prepare for and accommodate different kinds of learners and allows all kinds of dialogue in class. By doing so, the classrooms become alternative spaces for women.

In this alternative space, every woman can freely express her own thoughts, feelings, speak out her pain and anger, experience being accepted by listeners, and begin to be healed.²⁹⁸ This idea is related to Harris’ women teaching step 2 and 3 — remembering and ritual mourning. The step of remembering helps people to face their own past and present,

²⁹⁴ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 36.

²⁹⁵ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophesy*, 54.

²⁹⁶ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophesy*, 56.

²⁹⁷ Belenky et al., *Women’s Ways of Knowing*, 223.

²⁹⁸ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophesy*, 57.

fears and shadows.²⁹⁹ In the next step, expressing rage and anger in mourning assists people in understanding “the work of love.”³⁰⁰ For Harris, mourning together is “the beginning speech” for many women.³⁰¹ In the alternative spaces, there are connections among everyone. Here, Chopp’s perspective makes good sense: connections relate “through differences and that brought survival and flourishing together for all.”³⁰² In another words, “connection is the description of reality, a description not of warmth and bonding, but of conflict, of tension, of difference, of relatedness.”³⁰³ It is easy to support each other when everyone has the same thoughts or values. However, not to judge and even to support something new and different is much more difficult. Alternative spaces are needed when the group or community encounters this kind of conflict. To support means to respect, to understand, to appreciate, and to love. To have alternative spaces offers a way for women to support each other without judgment.

There are two dimensions in the concept of alternative spaces. First, alternative spaces make women central and leave room for women to think more and focus on themselves. Second, alternative spaces also offer a secure environment that allows women

²⁹⁹ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 33.

³⁰⁰ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 50.

³⁰¹ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 56.

³⁰² Chopp, *Saving Work*, 69.

³⁰³ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 69.

to voice their own struggles, pose their questions, represent their thoughts, and express their emotion, without worrying about being criticized or judged. Furthermore, to have alternative spaces is very important for the teachers, especially professors in theological schools. The teaching task for seminary teachers is not only “a question of how people learn best, but has ethical dimensions; public issues and how faculty and students relate to them are matters for collective reflection and mutual critique.”³⁰⁴ For instance, regarding the issues of lesbians, how might seminary communities discuss this topic and treat the women who identify themselves as lesbian? The way that professors talk about and address this topic and the values the professors represent has a crucial influence on students, as students tend to adopt professors’ views. Having alternative spaces allows everyone in the class/group to receive diverse opinions and to learn from each other. Both teachers and learners grow not only by sharing their own views but also hearing others’. These diverse opinions also provide a great resource for seminarians when they encounter this issue in their ministry.

According to the research of The Mud Flower Collective, “a good artist/theologian is able to envision the interactive dynamics of human experience and to see the essential

³⁰⁴ The Cornwall Collective, *Your Daughters Shall Prophesy*, 9-10.

connectedness between her life and the lives of other women and men.”³⁰⁵ Alternative spaces provide a room for women to freely share their lives and experiences. Everyone in the alternative spaces can learn from each other’s stories and assist each other to have self-growth via this sharing process. Furthermore, to have the alternative spaces is to allow the diversity to be revealed, which is particularly important when women start to build up their connections.

Aesthetic Teaching – An Artistic Manner for Women to be Authentic

This concept is based on Harris’ description of her experience as a teaching assistant of attending and observing Mary Anderson Tully teaching her classes.³⁰⁶ Harris thinks that Tully’s way of teaching is aesthetic, not goal-oriented, and that it fosters “a climate where one waits to see what will emerge.”³⁰⁷ Harris reports Tully’s pedagogy as having three main characteristics, which are language, the environment, and the engagement with feeling and experience.³⁰⁸

In Harris’ view, “it is art through which feeling is given expression” so the “engagement with feeling and the aesthetic dimension are necessarily related.”³⁰⁹ She sees

³⁰⁵ The Mud Flower Collective, *God’s Fierce Whimsy*, 68.

³⁰⁶ Maria Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination: An Essay in the Theology of Teaching* (San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1987), 119-141.

³⁰⁷ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 120.

³⁰⁸ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 127-141.

³⁰⁹ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 138.

serious engagement with human feeling and human relations in Tully's teaching, and notes that these are two primary elements in human experience.³¹⁰ Harris applies John Dewey's explanation to Tully's teaching and says that "an aesthetic quality must be felt in all experience."³¹¹

To engage human experience with feeling and to use an artistic way in one's teaching is helpful for authentic teaching. If the teachers/ educators have tried to have dialogue in their teaching, to support each other in groups, and to allow everyone to express themselves freely in alternative spaces, if some educators are feigning these roles, then their teaching and the students' learning cannot be authentic. This is where art comes in. Tully thought that, "art is one discipline which allows for directness and immediacy and where the possibility of pretension and escape is cut to a minimum."³¹² Tully suggested that when teachers apply an artistic approach in class, they teach authentically.

As an example, Harris shares the experience of using an artistic model in one course. She thinks that art is "not for use" and "not to provide or promote any one answer as the solution, goal, or definitive meaning of adulthood" but instead that it provides "a sense of

³¹⁰ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 139.

³¹¹ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 141.

³¹² Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 139.

play” and for “some moments not [to] be productive.”³¹³ Harris applies a variety of forms of art in her class: dance, choreography, poetry, creative dramatics, sculpting, silk-screening, puppetry, fairy tales, cooking, baking bread, and even making a kite.³¹⁴ To apply art in one’s teaching is not only to provide a free playground for learners but also to help people “make sense out of experience.”³¹⁵

In her teaching, Harris found that some people are afraid of the artistic and hesitate to become involved in it because of their traumatized memories in childhood.³¹⁶ In her class, such students when they realize it are “eager to overcome – even with some trepidation – their fear and tentativeness.”³¹⁷ In an aesthetic teaching model, everyone, including teachers and learners, is involved and needs to be authentic, not only to others but also to their self. If teachers are not freed from the fear of involving the artistic, there is no way for them to teach authentically. It is teachers who need to be liberated and to overcome the limits of selves in order to teach authentically. In another words, based on Freire’s concepts, the oppressors and the oppressed both need to be liberated.³¹⁸ In Tully’s words, the teacher’s main job, instead of really teaching something, is “to set up an

³¹³ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 145.

³¹⁴ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 149.

³¹⁵ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 140.

³¹⁶ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 147.

³¹⁷ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 147.

³¹⁸ Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 28-29.

environment” and expose learners to something.³¹⁹ Tully thought that, “in this field, the field of art, you really learn by yourself and from each other.”³²⁰ Harris recommends that teachers need to let go of their roles of being perfect or complete.³²¹

Aesthetic teaching is applied as an artistic way to approach women’s needs because aesthetic teaching is able to help both teachers and learners to express their feeling and experience in an authentic way, which is very important for women. According to the research of WWK, most women are living for others most of their life and are under the stress of fulfilling others’ requirements or expectations.³²² Chopp also talks about how patriarchy affects women and how to provide women a space of grace is to enable transformation.³²³ The Mud Flower Collective thinks that when women tell “their own stories with integrity, candor, and the expectation...they will be taken seriously because they take themselves seriously and because they understand that the meaning of their own lives is stretched and deepened in the relational interaction between their lives and the lives of others.”³²⁴

³¹⁹ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 131.

³²⁰ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 131.

³²¹ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 73-75.

³²² Belenky et al., *Women’s Ways of Knowing*, 206.

³²³ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 55.

³²⁴ The Mud Flower Collective, *God’s Fierce Whimsy*, 68.

The work of art in aesthetic teaching can come in many forms. For instance, Chopp thinks that writing can be a way of representing someone's life: "The narrativity of one's life, in a sense, is one possibility of emancipation: to free one's self from definition imposed on one and to live one's life in the activity of writing."³²⁵ In Moore's pedagogy of narrative method, she cited the views of Elliot, Eisner, and Harris and asserted that, "narratives are an important source of imagination."³²⁶ As long as the work is able to represent human experiences and selves, artistic work in aesthetic teaching can be done in many different forms including writing. Furthermore, writing can occur in many different ways, such as keeping a diary/journal, writing a personal reflection or a story, even a play script can be treated as an artistic work because through these writings the writers are actually applying all kinds of their experiences and imaginations in the words they put down. Aesthetic teaching is a way to allow women to focus only on themselves and express their selves freely because art work allows everyone to represent herself in any way without having to worry about being judged or criticized.

³²⁵ Chopp, *Saving Work*, 32.

³²⁶ Moore, *Teaching from the Heart*, 139.

Women's Spiritual Growth within Theological Education

According to Conn, "Spirituality refers to the totality of human life energized by an inner drive for self-transcendence, that is, for moving beyond self-maintenance to reach out in love, in free commitment to seek truth and goodness."³²⁷ Conn's words provide a good understanding regarding women's spiritual growth within theological education. For theological educators, the teaching task includes helping the learners to have spiritual growth, which can mean things like having them relate their spirituality to their experiences and real life, searching for the source of love, approaching truth and goodness. Based on the perspectives of women's psychological development, women's spiritual growth is both individual and interpersonal. The four approaches in this section include both such approaches: being a listener (for being heard), being a support (for being connected), being an authentic woman (for being transformed), and being an artist (for being empowered).

Being a Listener – For the Voice Needs to Be Heard

Educational and psychological research has found that women become silent in their contexts and their voices need to be heard. Many researchers have tried hard to dig out all kinds of women's voices. To have women be able to speak out in theological

³²⁷ Joann Wolski Conn, "Dancing in the Dark: Women's Spirituality and Ministry," in *Women's Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development*, ed. Joann Wolski Conn, 2nd ed. (Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1986), 9.

education can also help their spiritual growth. In addition, women not only need to make their voices heard, they also need to become active listeners. Listening is one of the important elements in spiritual life.³²⁸ Harris mentions that listening plays a variety of roles in her seven steps of women's spirituality. She thinks that listening "[leads] to responding" in the step of Dis-Covering, it "prepare[s] for Engagement," which is the beginning of the relationship in the step of Creating, and, in the step of Nourishing, it also "nurture[s] through prayer and contemplation."³²⁹

Active listening includes listening to our deeper selves, thoughts, dreams, and desires but also to the divine voice. This is how women experience the Divinity as a voice or a presence.³³⁰ Listening includes the power of healing because it means that people are free to speak in their own voices. Women are released from the oppression of having been taught "Don't Speak" in their lives. This kind of listening begins a relationship with self and the Divinity — Martin Buber's I-Thou relationship.³³¹ To believe women's own voices are heard also means that women are having a conversation with the Divinity, as Slee mentions in her book, *Women's Faith Development*. Slee thinks that "the process of the

³²⁸ Maria Harris, *Dance of the Spirit: Seven Steps of Women's Spirituality* (New York: Bantam Books, 1991), 182-185.

³²⁹ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 182.

³³⁰ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 91.

³³¹ Nicola Slee, *Women's Faith Development: Patterns and Processes* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate Publishing, 2004), 62.

conversation can illuminate and reflect the content and dynamic of the woman's faith-life."³³²

In Harris' book, she mentions several difficulties of having time to listen to the selves that women shared with her.³³³ One difficulty is that it is hard for women to find a time to listen to self; it might be because of the noise in the house or the demands of the job or children.³³⁴ However, some women mention innovative ways of how their female elders create space to listen to themselves, for instance, by putting her apron up over her head.³³⁵ It is important for women's spirituality to use any way to create a space and time to listen to the voices of both self and Divinity. This offers a crucial way for theological educators to help female seminarians with their spiritual growth within theological education.

Harris extends listening to mean "a listening to all the unheard voices – it is a listening to silence" and it is a listening "to what is not said."³³⁶ Harris asserts that "confronting our own silences, and listening to ourselves, eventually moves us toward listening to other, previously unheard silence."³³⁷ Listening is the beginning of the

³³² Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 65.

³³³ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 183-184.

³³⁴ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 184.

³³⁵ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 184.

³³⁶ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 182.

³³⁷ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 184.

relationship with self, the Divinity, and others. Women are able to be active listeners and listen to the unheard voice and silence because their voices have been heard. In theological education, it is important to provide chances to allow the learners, especially female seminarians, not only to speak out their inner voices but also to be active listeners and listen to the voice of self and the Divinity. In the process of being listeners, these female seminarians are on the way to finding the connection with the Divinity, the source of love. When women extend their listening, in Harris' terms, they "inevitably touch the Center of all stillness."³³⁸ As women touching the Center of all stillness, they are connecting to the resources of love and goodness and feeling loved, cherished, and needed.³³⁹ When women connect to the source of love and goodness, they are able to be "energized by an inner drive for self-transcendence" that makes them willing to be an active listener.³⁴⁰

Being a Supporter – For the Relationships Need to Be Connected

Slee says that women's understanding of faith is "as being in relationship to God and/or the Other."³⁴¹ In her studies she found that women used different metaphors for God: "God was imaged in hierarchical relational terms as parent, sovereign or lord, but

³³⁸ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 185.

³³⁹ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 185.

³⁴⁰ Conn, "Dancing in the Dark," 9.

³⁴¹ Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 140.

more frequently in relationships of mutuality as lover, partner or friend; and in both male and female imagery.”³⁴²

For women, the relationship with God is a relationship of love. In the relationship with God, women can feel “the constancy and dependability of divine presences in their lives” which, in my opinion, is a connection to the stability of Holiness.³⁴³

This relationship with God helps women to have a good connection with themselves. In Harris’ terms, “Spiritual Awakening” can make the connection with the aspects of selves that “remain hidden – mystery, and love, and sorrow, and dreams of wholeness – those that make us truly us.”³⁴⁴ When talking about relationality, one of the patterns of women’s faith development, Slee claims that a well-developed relational spirituality incorporated “due attention to diversity and difference within an epistemology of connectedness.”³⁴⁵ In this relationship with God, women are able to see themselves from the Divine side which is to look at themselves not with judgment, but with loving kindness, reception and, moreover, appreciation.

³⁴² Slee, *Women’s Faith Development*, 140.

³⁴³ Slee, *Women’s Faith Development*, 140.

³⁴⁴ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 4.

³⁴⁵ Slee, *Women’s Faith Development*, 138.

When Slee describes Mary Grey's work, she asserts that women "need to come to a sense of self before they can establish right relation with others."³⁴⁶ The acceptance of self helps women to be supporters in groups and communities. As Slee says:

Difference and connectedness do not need to be conceived in competition with each other; it is precisely the ability to maintain the connectedness to the other in the face of difference, without threatening the selfhood of either party, which characterizes mature interdependence and distinguishes it from symbiotic fusion on the one hand and alienated isolation on the other.³⁴⁷

Women are able to be supporters because they feel they are connected to the Divinity. One of the tasks in theological education is helping female seminarians to find ways to have a mature relationship with God. There are many options that provide practical ways of assisting everyone to build a mature relationship with God, among them, different kinds of spiritual practice, a spiritual mate, or joining a small spiritual group. When women are in this mature relationship with God, they are able to apply the perspectives of love to look at both themselves and others whose opinions might be very different from theirs. In Conn's terms, this is what of self-knowledge can teach women — so that they are able to

³⁴⁶ Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 137.

³⁴⁷ Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 138.

live in a more inclusive and compassionate way.³⁴⁸ In the mutual relationships (with self and others), women support each other instead of judging and competing.

Being an Authentic Woman – For Authentic Self Needs to Be Revealed

Research about female spirituality mentions women's experiences "of lack of authentic connection with self, other and God."³⁴⁹ Carol Christ and Sue Monk Kidd describe similar experiences of women.³⁵⁰ For Christ, "the loss of self and connection" are like "an experience of nothingness" and Kidd asserts that being "unaware or unfazed by the truth of her own female life" is like "the deep sleep," and "a kind of unconscious state."³⁵¹ Slee asserts that when women are awakened from this lack of authentic connections, they are able to find "a new sense of self and a new orientation of the world."³⁵² Based on Harris' concept of Dis-Covering as one of the seven steps of women's spirituality, to find a new sense of self and a new orientation of the world is a discovery of community and the Divinity.³⁵³ The discovery of community has two phases: community with oneself and with other women. The communities with oneself and with other women are ways to practice how to appreciate one's own and others' true self. In addition, the

³⁴⁸ Conn, "Dancing in the Dark," 18.

³⁴⁹ Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 82.

³⁵⁰ Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 82.

³⁵¹ Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 82.

³⁵² Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 82.

³⁵³ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 28-57.

community of the Divinity means to know that the Divinity is close, in Harris' terms, "as water in a sponge."³⁵⁴

Harris applies a metaphor and describes that women need to remove their makeup and take off their shoes in order to Awaken, her first step of seven steps of women's spirituality.³⁵⁵ To be authentic women is like removing one's makeup and allowing someone else to see them as they actually are.³⁵⁶ Yet in Harris' terms, makeup is an easier mask to remove than the masks women use to keep women from their own aging or their own pain or beauty or gaze.³⁵⁷ To connect to self, other, and God in an authentic way helps women to remove the masks they wear so they are able to find what is hidden behind them. To remove one's makeup/masks and to reveal the true self is a process of being mature which, in Conn's words, is "a matter of becoming one's true self."³⁵⁸

Regarding taking off one's shoes, Harris believes this relates to the ancient religious command that when human beings are in the presence of the Holy, they remove their shoes.³⁵⁹ Harris emphasizes that women need to awaken and realize that "all ground is

³⁵⁴ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 44.

³⁵⁵ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 15-17.

³⁵⁶ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 15.

³⁵⁷ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 16.

³⁵⁸ Conn, "Dancing in the Dark," 22.

³⁵⁹ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 17.

holy” and any place can be “the presence of God.”³⁶⁰ To remember the presence of God anywhere and anytime is to have the community of the Divinity.

Conn asserts that self-knowledge can “also teach us to examine critically how socialization affects our perception and feelings about self.”³⁶¹ When this world teaches women that they need to be tough in order to achieve their goal, if women do not have self-knowledge, they allow this teaching and arm themselves with a strong image. Women forget that they are all made in God’s image, they forget how to present their true selves because they want to hide their weakness. Women stop crying and forget how to mourn because they think that mourning and crying are signs of being weak. Harris suggests instead that mourning is “discarding what is no longer viable in order to turn toward re-forming and trans-forming Spirituality.”³⁶² This spiritual transformation is one of the goals that theological education can provide and it can help everyone in seminaries to become more authentic. In Harris’ terms, mourning is “not only personal; it is social and public too.”³⁶³ Mourning is what women can do in the community, within their selves, and also with other women. This spiritual transformation of mourning provides women the strength

³⁶⁰ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 17.

³⁶¹ Conn, “Dancing in the Dark,” 18.

³⁶² Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 188.

³⁶³ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 189.

to be authentic in front of themselves, others, and God. As Freire asserts, transformation is a process of being a true self.³⁶⁴ Therefore, women can be authentic because they are transformed.

Being an Artist – For Creativity Needs to Be Empowered

Slee also discovered “the remarkable linguistic and metaphoric creativity of women as they seek to give expression to their struggles to achieve authentic selfhood, relationships with others, and connectedness to ultimate reality.”³⁶⁵ Cameron considers the artist’s way to be a spiritual path of higher creativity. For Cameron, creativity is a spiritual experience.³⁶⁶ Cameron relates creativity with spirituality in her spiritual principles that I present below:

1. Creativity is the natural order of life. Life is energy: pure creative energy.
2. There is an underlying, in-dwelling creative force infusing all of life—including ourselves.
3. When we open ourselves to our creativity, we open ourselves to the creator’s creativity within us and our lives.
4. We are, ourselves, creations. And we, in turn, are meant to continue creativity by being creative ourselves.
5. Creativity is God’s gift to us. Using our creativity is our gift back to God.
6. The refusal to be creative is self-will and is counter to our true nature.

³⁶⁴ Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 159-160.

³⁶⁵ Slee, *Women’s Faith Development*, 175.

³⁶⁶ Julia Cameron, *The Artist’s Way: A Spiritual Path to Higher Creativity* (New York: J.P. Tarcher/ Putnam, 1996), 2.

7. When we open ourselves to exploring our creativity, we open ourselves to God: good orderly direction.
8. As we open our creative channel to the creator, many gentle but powerful changes are to be expected.
9. It is safe to open ourselves up to greater and greater creativity.
10. Our creative dreams and yearnings come from a divine source. As we move toward our dreams, we move toward our divinity.³⁶⁷

Like Cameron, Harris also considers creating to be one of the seven steps of women's spirituality. For Harris, the act of creating is a "molding and giving form of life" and people usually engage this in art works.³⁶⁸ Harris asserts that creating has two facets: one is "the work of a builder, or a carpenter" and another one is a life-giving energy.³⁶⁹ The first image of creating is "making," in Harris terms, to "construct something;" to "create a product."³⁷⁰ The second image of creating means to "never [be] cut off from the source of life, and nature itself, including human nature."³⁷¹ Harris believes women are builders and make things which can represent selves and that women connect to the source of life and nature in this process of creating.

For Slee, in the art work which represents women's creativity, women "came to a sense of their own capacity for meaningful activity, their own power of being and a

³⁶⁷ Cameron, *Artist's Way*, 3.

³⁶⁸ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 60.

³⁶⁹ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 61.

³⁷⁰ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 61.

³⁷¹ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 61.

connection to the mysterious source of creativity which they named variously as God, Being or Spirit.”³⁷² This is a process of empowerment that helps women to discover their inner power, which offers women the ability to go one step further from where they are. This empowerment process makes women to voice out their inner thoughts in the form of writings, to represent their imagination in the form of paintings, or to express their feelings in the form of music. In this empowerment process, women become artists.

³⁷² Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 131.

Chapter 5

The Life Stories and Experiences of Female Ministers in Taiwan

This chapter presents the life stories and experiences of Taiwanese female pastors through interviews and the inspirations from their sharing. These interviewees start their stories with the reasons for why they are at seminary and their learning experiences at seminary. These female ministers also share their practices of serving as female ministers in local churches and their opinions and expectations of theological education after they are trained by seminary and involved in ministry.

The first section of this chapter introduces the reader to the Taiwanese context to help the reader better understand this research. The life stories of twelve interviewees are in the following section. The findings from the interview data analysis are presented in the last section of this chapter.

Introduction to the Taiwanese Context

This research focuses on applying female ministers' experiences to theological education in Taiwan. The introduction of the Taiwanese context occurs in three parts: the general Taiwanese context, the Taiwanese women's context, and the PCT (Presbyterian

Church in Taiwan) context of female pastors and theological education in Taiwan. The reason for introducing the PCT context in this section is because the interviewees in this research are all PCT clergy.

Taiwanese General Context: Population Analysis and Religious Context

According to the records of the Taiwanese government, at the end of 2014 the Taiwanese population numbered 23,433,753.³⁷³ Taiwan is a multicultural country that includes the Han ethnicity, the Hakka, and fourteen indigenous tribes. Each tribe has its own culture, customs, and languages. For indigenous people in Taiwan, to keep their own culture and speak their own language is very important because these remind them of their identities. The indigenous villages are mostly in the mountains or on the islands around Taiwan. Most young indigenous people move with their families to big cities such as Taipei, Tainan, or Kaohsiung in order to find jobs.

Based on the report of the American Institute in Taiwan (the pseudo-embassy of the United States), 35 percent of the population in Taiwan consider themselves Buddhist and 33 percent Taoist.³⁷⁴ There are also many Taiwanese who believe in traditional Taiwanese

³⁷³ “Monthly Bulletin of Interior Statistics,” 台灣內政部統計處 [Department of Statistic in Ministry of Interior, Taiwan Government], last modified January 10, 2015, accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509180255/http://sowf.moi.gov.tw/stat/month/elist.htm>.

³⁷⁴ “Taiwan 2013 International Religious Freedom,” American Institute in Taiwan, last modified July 29, 2014, accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509180423/http://www.ait.org.tw/en/officialtext-ot1407.html>.

folk religions, which is the oldest among all religions in Taiwan.³⁷⁵ Those who believe in traditional Taiwanese folk religions number about 80 percent of the population.³⁷⁶ Small percentages of the population are Protestant, Roman Catholic, or Sunni Muslim.³⁷⁷ Regarding the indigenous people in Taiwan, they are mainly Protestant or Roman Catholic.³⁷⁸ One of the interesting phenomena is that the villages where the indigenous tribes live have the most churches.

Since Christians are the minority in Taiwan, most Taiwanese Christians are evangelists and passionate in sharing the gospels with people and converting people to Christianity. Because of this church context in Taiwan, the main purpose of all the seminaries in Taiwan is to train seminarians to be church leaders and to convert more people to Christianity. Theological education in Taiwan pays attentions to enriching seminarians' biblical knowledge, enhancing their leadership skills, and assisting them to grow spiritually.

³⁷⁵ Gary Marvin Davison and Barbara E. Reed, *Culture and Customs of Taiwan* (Westport, CN: Greenwood Press, 1998), 37.

³⁷⁶ "Taiwan 2013 International Religious Freedom," American Institute in Taiwan, last modified July 29, 2014, accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509180423/http://www.ait.org.tw/en/officialtext-ot1407.html>.

³⁷⁷ "Taiwan 2013 International Religious Freedom," American Institute in Taiwan, last modified July 29, 2014, accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509180423/http://www.ait.org.tw/en/officialtext-ot1407.html>.

³⁷⁸ "Taiwan 2013 International Religious Freedom," American Institute in Taiwan, last modified July 29, 2014, accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509180423/http://www.ait.org.tw/en/officialtext-ot1407.html>.

In the case of TTCS, it provides one program for the bachelor degree, and four programs for the master's degree. The courses for the bachelor degree are taught in the Department of Theology; it is a program for all lay people who are interested in learning more about theology and Christian faith. The four master's degrees TTCS offers are the Master of Art (M.A.) in Christian Care and Counseling, the M.A. in Church Music, the Master of Divinity (M. Div.), and the Master of Theology (Th. M.). The M. Div. program focuses on training future pastors and ministers for local churches and other ministries in Taiwan. The Th. M. program is only for those who have already received the M. Div. degree and want to study more on a specific theological topic or issues that interest them. The seminarians in the M. Div. program expect to be trained as pastors to fulfill the needs of local churches and ministries after they graduate from seminary. The other non-M.Div. program seminarians expect to serve in the churches or other Christian institutions in Taiwan. Some of these non-M. Div. program seminarians later choose to join the M. Div. program and prepare themselves to be pastors after they receive their non-M. Div. master's degree.

The Taiwanese Women's Context: The Influences of Traditional Views and the Rise of Women's Movements

In addition to Confucianism, the Taiwanese context is deeply influenced by Chinese and Japanese culture. Taiwanese women used to be expected to have what the Taiwanese called “three obediences and four virtues.”³⁷⁹ The three obediences are similar to early Jewish tradition and include a woman having to obey her father before she gets married, obeying her husband after she has one, and following her son after her husband dies. Four virtues means a woman must have a good personality, appropriate behaviors and manners, know when to speak, and how to be a good wife and manage her family.

Women's social positions have changed because of the efforts of many advocates of women's liberation. However, some traditional influences remain. As a woman who has grown up in Taiwan, based on my experiences I know that most Taiwanese women think that to find a good husband is equal to finding a good “long-term meal ticket.” I was told by an old Taiwanese lady in church in 2008, the year I started to pursue a doctoral degree at Claremont, that since I am a highly educated woman, it will be hard for me to find a husband because Taiwanese males don't like the idea of marrying a highly educated woman

³⁷⁹ This concept is well known to most Taiwanese woman.

like me. Married women in Taiwan have to try hard to have a son in order to carry on the family name. Because of this pressure, some women have to keep bearing children until they have a son. In addition, men usually get higher salaries and positions than women in the workplace. Career women therefore not only need to work as hard as a man, they also have to do most of the housework and take care of family too. Similar gender unequal situations also exist in Christian communities. Some Christian denominations in Taiwan still refuse to ordain women nowadays.

Chen Wen Shan, an active feminist theologian in Taiwan, asserts that the work of the missionaries from western countries opened the door of education to Taiwanese women.³⁸⁰ However, because of the occupation of Japan, Taiwanese people are deeply influenced by Japanese patriarchal culture. Taiwanese women have been oppressed and some of them were taken by the Japanese and become “comfort women” – the term meant sex slaves for the Japanese army during World War II.³⁸¹ Women’s position did not improve until the 1960s. Chen mentions that some Taiwanese women who studied in and graduated from institutions in western countries brought the women’s liberation movement

³⁸⁰ Chen Wen Shan, 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology] (Taipei, Taiwan: 永望文化事業有限公司, 2002), 110.

³⁸¹ Kwok Pui-lan, *Introducing Asian Feminist Theology* (Cleveland, OH: The Pilgrim Press, 2000), 20.

to Taiwan in the 1960s.³⁸² Their work awakened many Taiwanese women, and many women-supporting communities were established at that time.³⁸³

In the 1980s, more female organizations were established because of the influences of the female scholars who graduated from western countries and because of the impact of globalization.³⁸⁴ In the 1990s, feminist movements also spread out through campus. Women's study associations, which provided space for young women to talk about feminist or gender issues, were established in many universities. For instance, in 1993 the Taiwanese Feminist Scholars Association was established by a group of highly educated women and scholars who are passionate about feminist movements in campus and the issues of genders in Taiwanese society.³⁸⁵ For Chen, these women's and feminist movements allowed Taiwanese women to get together and try to challenge the traditional values and expectations in order to remove the bias for women and increase the social position of women in Taiwan.³⁸⁶

Although these women's movements have made a difference for women during the

³⁸² Chen, 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology], 111.

³⁸³ Chen, 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology], 111.

³⁸⁴ Chen, 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology], 111.

³⁸⁵ “關於我們[Introduction],” 台灣女性學學會[Taiwanese Feminist Scholars Association], accessed May 9, 2016,

<https://web.archive.org/web/20160509181130/http://twfeminist.org/modules/tadnews/index.php?nsn=5>.

³⁸⁶ Chen, 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology], 111.

past two decades, Chen suggests that the focus of these women's movements was mainly on "political policy and education for the equality between men and women and that it did not do much to change religious, ethnic, and cultural dimensions since most women involved were highly educated and single (unmarried)." ³⁸⁷ She suggests that these women's movement advocates should have broadened and deepened their views in order to involve and help more women from different situations. ³⁸⁸

The PCT Context of Theological Education and Female Pastors

The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan (PCT) is the denomination with the most congregations and it has four seminaries in Taiwan: Taiwan Theological College and Seminary (TTCS), Tainan Theological College and Seminary, Yu-Shan Theological College and Seminary, and Presbyterian Bible College. TTCS was founded in 1872 by Rev. George Leslie Mackay, a Canadian missionary. TTCS is located in Taipei, the capital of Taiwan, and is the oldest seminary not only in Taiwan but also in Asia. ³⁸⁹ In 1876, Rev. Thomas Barclay, a Presbyterian missionary from Scotland, established Tainan Theological College and Seminary, which is an important institution of theological education in

³⁸⁷ Chen, 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology], 111-112.

³⁸⁸ Chen, 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology], 111-112.

³⁸⁹ "Welcome to a Passion for Theological Excellence," Taiwan Theological College and Seminary, accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509181254/http://www.taitheo.org/>.

southern Taiwan. Yu-Shan Theological College and Seminary is the only theological school that provides theological education for indigenous people in Taiwan and was founded in 1946 by Rev. James Ira Dickson, an American Presbyterian missionary. Presbyterian Bible College is a spiritual retreat center for all Christians in Taiwan and was established by the PCT in 1952.

According to my survey of Taiwan Theological College and Seminary, the gender ratio of enrollment students from 2010 to 2013 has changed. See Table 4:

Academic year	Student enrollment (M. Div. program)		Gender Ratio of enrolled students (male student numbers divided by female student numbers)
	Male	Female	
2010	17	8	2.125
2011	15	12	1.25
2012	9	8	1.125
2013	10	10	1

Table 4. The gender ratio of the students enrolled at Taiwan Theological College and Seminary³⁹⁰

³⁹⁰ I collected this data from one staff person who is currently working in the registration office of the Taiwan Theological College and Seminary.

According to Table 4, there has been lower ratio of male seminarians enrolled in Taiwan Theological College and Seminary in the past four years. Since there is a lack of female faculty and experienced female pastors in the TTCS, it is hard to fulfill the needs of female seminarians as they prepare themselves to be the church leaders of the future.

In Taiwan, female pastors encounter more challenges than male ones in ministry due to the patriarchal-influenced church context. One of the significant situations is that female ministers and clergy are paid less and encounter other inequalities, which we can also see in the data provided by the interviewees in this research. For instance, if the female pastor is ministering at a local church with her husband, her salary is typically half of her husband's; sometimes she even receives no salary at all since (so the rationale goes) her husband already gets one. She will never be a senior pastor because she is "female" and a "pastor's wife." Instead, her husband is always the senior pastor in the church. Furthermore, even if there is an opportunity for her to be a senior pastor, she might not be willing to take it because of the work load or the congregation's opinions about having a female in that position. For those who minister alone, they have to face the elders and deacons with a double standard. If a female pastor cries when preaching or in some other ministry situation, the elders and deacons might think that women are always emotional. However, if a male

pastor cries when preaching, the elders and deacons will tend to think that this pastor has a soft heart. The stories of the female pastors in the next section represent the Taiwanese context in more details.

Her Stories

According to the laws and rules of the PCT, every seminarian becomes an evangelist after graduation from seminary. This is a position or status that comes before receiving ordination. There are several ways to get into ministry after becoming an evangelist: ministering at a church, becoming a chaplain on a college campus or at a hospital, or working in other PCT organizations. Ministering at a church is the most popular way of being involved in ministry. After ministering at a church for two years as an evangelist, a person has to fulfill several criteria to be ordained, allowed to wear clergy collar, and to receive the title of “Reverend.”³⁹¹ Regarding female seminarians, for the married ones, they have two ways to minister at a church after they graduate from seminary: alone or with her husband. For a married female minister, it is easier to minister at a church with her husband in the Taiwanese context. The twelve interviewees in this qualitative

³⁹¹ “Rule of Law for Ordination,” 台灣基督長老教會[The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan], accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509181418/http://www.pct.org.tw/ByLaws.aspx?LID=1011>. This is a Chinese website, although it also has an English version but the information on it is different from the Chinese one. I think that this is because the information I mention is mainly applied to Taiwanese clergy in the PCT. Therefore, this information only appears in the Chinese version of the website.

research project all graduated from TTCS between 1994 and 2011. Among the interviewees, there are four female pastors who are ministering with their husband, four married indigenous female ministers who minister at a church alone, and four single female pastors who are ministering at a church independently. Their stories are presented in this section. All names have been altered to protect the subjects' identities. Since the interviewees are recalling their memories in their personal stories, the verb tenses in this section are not uniform but depend on the context.

The Stories of Married Han Tribe Female Ministers

Story 1: Bonnie - A Lady Finding Balance between Family and Ministry

Growing up as a pastor's kid (PK), Bonnie decided to go to seminary at the age of twenty-three because she wanted to know God more. She met her husband at seminary and was married during the last year of seminary. After she received her M. Div. in 2010, she began ministering at a church located in the countryside of north Taiwan with her husband. As a PK who grew up in the Presbyterian Church context, she is familiar with church culture and knows how to deal with many issues that arise in the congregation. Therefore, she does not feel there is any difference between genders nor does she feel any disadvantage in her ministry in being a female clergy. Indeed, she mentioned that the

advantage of being a female minister is that the parishioners prefer to counsel with her and it is easier for her to understand their needs by talking to them. However, after she had her first child and became a mother, she started to feel that it is difficult for her to be a mother while she is serving in the church. She sometimes becomes anxious because of her fear of not doing a good job for both her ministry and her family. She is finding a balance between family and ministry among the roles of a minister, a pastor's wife, and the mother of two children.

Regarding what she learned at seminary, she shared that she learned how to understand the Bible more and better. She also learned how to prepare sermons and lead small groups in ministry. However, in her ministry she has encountered many people who are having a hard time with their family or who are suffering mentally and this makes her want to learn more about the issues of depression, divorce, unmarried pregnancy, and so on so she can better provide help to the people in need. In addition to training females to be ministers, Bonnie wants theological education to offer classes on how to find a balance between family and ministry and between different identities such as mother, minister's wife, and minister.

Story 2: Tiffany - A Young Mother Trying to Fulfill Multiple Roles in the Ministry

Tiffany grew up in a faithful Christian family; to her, serving the church is a natural part of her life. While she was in her college, for several years she was a church youth director. As she served the young people, she started to realize that what she could provide for these younger sisters and brothers was limited. She wanted to offer more to these adolescents. Therefore, she started to ask God to open ways for her to do so and she felt that God asked her to respond to His calling by going to seminary so that more of His people could be nurtured spiritually in truth. She said “yes” to God and confirmed the calling when she was a senior in college. However, since she wanted to have some work experience before she went to seminary, she told God that she would go to seminary after that. She met her husband while she was serving the youth at her college and they decided to go to seminary the same year. They got married before they graduated from seminary and in 2010 Tiffany chose to serve with her husband in a local church in a city near Taipei. The congregation of this church numbers around four hundred people.

Tiffany shared her experiences with other clergy in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan and said that it has been very challenging for her to be a female pastor. This is because most clergy and elders in Presbyterian churches in Taiwan are still male. She felt

that she is the minority among the clergy. Regarding her ministry, she found that the advantage for her is that people easily open up to her so she can have a heart-to-heart talk with them since she is a woman and pays attentions to their words. However, she also felt there is disadvantage in ministry. She is working in a church that has a senior pastor above her and her husband. Sometimes she feels as if she is being ignored; even the congregation treats her as a pastor's wife rather than a pastor. She thinks that when her position is not clear in the ministry, it is not easy for her to teach or do anything else because she has no authority among the congregation.

When she talked about the difficulties of being a female pastor, she shared her experience of being in charge of the outreach ministry in the communities around the church. This ministry needed lots of manpower but only a few people signed up for this ministry. She realized that no matter how big the church is, it is always the same group of people serving in the church. Furthermore, these people are really ambitious and want to do everything. If the pastors of the church do not have further plans for the ministries, they think that they are not being productive and efficient. Because of this situation, she had to deal with the relationship problems among people rather than spend her energy on this outreach ministry.

She also shared that one of the challenges she has is how to do a good job at inhabiting different roles such as a pastor, mother, and wife. It is difficult for her to find a balance among these three roles. She has a young daughter and hopes to have more time to be with and grow with her daughter. In short, she is trying to find a balance between her family and the ministry.

She talked about her experiences of the theological education she received at the seminary and said that her theological education laid good foundations for pastoring a church. She believes that the ministers are applying what they learned from the seminary in their ministry situation and that one of the most important responsibilities for them is to teach the truth. The ministers have to teach the congregation and help the parishioners understand not only the Bible but also about the related knowledge of history, culture, and so on. According to her experiences as a female pastor, the most helpful seminary courses for the ministry she had were the classes on Practical Theology and the courses about spiritual caring. She paid more attention in the courses on preaching, pastoral ministry, and so on. For her, the most precious part of these classes was what many pastors shared with the students about their ministry experiences.

After she became actively involved in ministry, she also realized that she needed to

know about pastoring and counseling. In addition to that she felt that everyone needs a spiritual director to help his or her spiritual growth. This spiritual director needs to be able to offer counseling, know the Bible well, and accompany people in need. Tiffany thinks that the courses offered at Taiwanese seminaries are rather limited, and wishes there were more courses about Practical Theology and specific curriculum on ministering in churches of different sizes. She also wishes that seminaries had the capacity to help clergy resolve problems when they do not know how to solve them. Her suggestion for theological education is to have required courses on Pastoral Care, because in her view having such skills is crucial for ministering in a church.

Story 3: Jenny - Finding her Identity in the Ministry

Jenny was baptized in her senior year in high school but her faith did not grow much until she attended fellowship groups at the university. She felt called to serve God full time as a clergy person at the university. After she graduated from university, during a time of searching and confirming her calling from God, Jenny spent three years working at the university, during which she also supervised the Christian fellowship group. In these three years, she encountered many young people who grew up in church but took the identity of Christian for granted as part of their inheritance. She realized the importance of

religious education and confirmed that God did not call her to keep company with only young people but with parishioners of different ages. She went to seminary and pursued her M. Div. afterwards. She married a pastor and has ministered in two churches with her husband in eastern Taiwan since she graduated from the seminary.

In our conversations about her experiences of ministry, since she is ministering at a church with her husband, she has to face the struggles of finding a balance between being a pastor and a pastor's wife. After ministering at two churches which included a small church in the countryside and a medium sized church in the city for seven years, she learned that the expectation of the congregation for her swings between her identity as a pastor and as a pastor's wife, and this influenced how she thought of herself. Both churches essentially wanted her to take the role of pastor's wife for which the expectations included being the pianist, decorating the churches with flowers, teaching in Sunday school, participating in choir, and so on. She has done all these things and has tried to be a good pastor's wife because she *is* a pastor's wife. However, she recognizes that the seminary did not train her to be a good pastor's wife but to be a pastor!

Although both she and her husband are ordained pastors, in their patriarchal culture it is inevitable that it is her husband who holds the position of senior pastor. She is an

assistant pastor for Christian education in her church. She believes that if the female pastors are a minority in Taiwanese context, then the female pastors who are also married to pastors are the minority of the minority. She is certainly looking forward to learning to do the things that a pastor needs to do in the ministry, like preaching, celebrating Communion, and leading the worship service. However, it is the parishioners, not her husband, who do not give her the chance to learn about these things because they perceive that these things need to be done by a pastor, not a pastor's wife. She mentioned two impressive experiences with regard to this issue. On one Sunday, her husband had to go to a different church to preach so she stayed in her church and preached. After Sunday service, many female congregants did not leave the church because they were waiting to see her husband; without that, they felt they had not really attended Sunday service. Inevitably such responses negatively influence her ministry and her perceptions of herself. Therefore, she is used to letting her husband take the lead in everything. The parishioners expect a male pastor to be the one praying for them in their homes, at weddings, and at funerals. She recognizes that if the congregation has a choice, they will choose the male pastor as the one who ministers to them every time. Such patriarchal concepts are also deeply embedded in her mother-in-law's mind.

This brings me to her other notable experience. It was a female pastor who preached at Jenny's husband's ordination ceremony and her mother-in-law responded indignantly: "Why is a female pastor preaching at my son's ordination ceremony?" Jenny described her feeling and said: "My mother-in-law apparently did not realize that her daughter-in-law is also a female pastor when she said that to me."

Because of the expectations of the congregation and the needs of taking care of her two little children, although she holds the position of assistant pastor in her church, she does not have much energy to devote to her ministry. However, she shared two experiences that remind her to keep learning and keep being trained as a pastor. The first experience is that she had a chance to be in charge of an entire service because it was a Sunday for honoring women. In her sermon, she encouraged women to get trained and use their spiritual gifts in the churches. At the end of the service, she let her husband do the announcements and benediction because she knew the congregation needed to see "the pastor" in the service. After the service, one elder's wife who is highly educated came to her angry. The elder's wife asked Jenny why Jenny had let a male pastor take over the announcements and benediction, which was in conflict with Jenny's sermon, which had encouraged women to serve God with women's gifts. Jenny explained to this elder's wife

that she had done so for those sisters and brothers who need to see “the pastor” on Sundays.

The elder’s wife shared her opinions with Jenny: “The parishioners see the male pastor all the time. Since it is a Sunday for honoring women, you (Jenny), the female pastor, should have let the congregation know that female pastors can lead the entire Sunday service by themselves and this is a good opportunity to educate the parishioners to accept the service hosted by a female pastor.” Jenny thought that perhaps this elder’s wife had been educated in a Western country or had been influenced by a women’s movement because she was so sensitive and aggressive on this issue of gender equality. Jenny really appreciated this woman’s opinions because she reminded Jenny that she does not have to accept and fulfill the expectations of the congregation. Jenny believes that she needs to reflect and discriminate on when to educate brothers and sisters so that female pastors can have the same positions as male ones.

Another experience Jenny had was of an old person passing away while her husband was leading a funeral at the church, which meant that he could not tend to the newly bereaved family, which meant Jenny had to. She was really nervous because she had no experience with ministering to the family of the deceased and was not familiar with the procedures and details of what was expected of her. Neither could she ask her husband’s

advice because he was busy with the funeral. Although at that time she had been ordained for three years, she realized that she did not have much more hands-on experience than an un-ordained evangelist. She was able to call her friend who was pastoring a church by herself, and her friend told her what to do and pay attention to and prayed for her on the phone. After she hung up the phone, Jenny put on her pastor's garb and went to the family, which had just lost their beloved elder. Because not everyone in that family was Christian, they were fearful about some taboo. Jenny took the opportunity to teach them about the hope of resurrection and the Christian faith and prayed for them. The family was comforted spiritually and mentally because there was a pastor with them. It didn't matter to them that she was a woman. This experience made Jenny learn that her parishioners sometimes did not realize that she is also a pastor until she puts on her pastor's garb. Jenny emphasized that the reason she said so is not because she thinks that the position of pastor is higher than the position of a pastor's wife. Jenny was just concerned that she has to grab every chance to learn and grow in order to prepare herself to be a pastor and answer God's calling faithfully. As she shared with me, she reminded herself: "I have to remember that I am a pastor always, and not only when I put on my pastor's garb."

Regarding the influence of theological education, Jenny shared that what she

learned at the seminary was mainly to help her think and reflect on Christian faith systematically and study the Scriptures with greater understanding. For Jenny, it was hard to say what part of her theological education helped her the most for it helped her in many respects. She believes that theological education does not only happen in the seminary; it can also happen when she goes to Sunday school, and when she attends Sunday services and fellowship. In Jenny's opinion, theological education has always been a part of her life and her seminary education was simply more complete and systematic.

Jenny is not from a Presbyterian background so she had a jolt when she went to a Presbyterian seminary. She believes that this experience woke her up from her own spiritual background and made her realize that there is not only one way to grow spiritually. Jenny emphasized that attending a seminary of a different denomination helped her greatly in her relationship with God.

In addition, Jenny asserted that theological education was also important in her ministry. She considers herself to be both a pastor and a theological educator in her church. She feels the needs for continuing training in ministry. Jenny declared that the three-year seminary education is not enough for her so she has to find alternative ways to meet and share with other pastors and learn from their experiences. Moreover, she feels the need to

attend different kinds of theological seminars in order to prepare herself to talk to her parishioners about different issues in the society from an educated Christian perspective. Jenny thinks that theological education provided her an environment to know God sincerely, to learn how to discriminate between all kinds of theological assertions, and to be responsible for her own discriminations. Theological education for Jenny is not only serious academic work or an ongoing education but also a great help in personal spirituality, and for having the right ministry mentality and practices. She asserted that, “the only way to keep serving God is to encounter God by keeping learning in theological education.”

When talking about her expectation of receiving assistance from theological education, she mentioned the context she is facing in her ministry. She said that since Christianity is not a main religion in Taiwan, many local cultures from other religions have been obstacles in evangelical ministries. In Jenny’s opinion, to solve the conflict between culture and Christian faith in Taiwan, ministers have to learn more about the history, development, and meanings of local culture and interpret the Scriptures in this context. Therefore, she hopes that theological education might help her understand how to have a dialogue with the Taiwanese local culture and understand more about how the culture influence the lives of Christians and non-Christians. She is looking forward to theological

education being able to assist her in building up different theological understandings and develop a more informed Christian culture because Jenny and her parishioners are trying to “do” contextual theology in their daily life. She hopes that this new Christian culture could have the character of local culture yet be able to reflect theologically from the perspective of Christian faith.

Recalling the experiences in her ministries, Jenny explained as an example that when she talks to the couple who are going to get married, she always asks the bride’s family to refuse, if they can, to take money from the groom’s family — an important Taiwanese custom. Her reason for this request is because, in Taiwanese culture, elders pay more attention to males than females and the money given by the groom’s family represents that they are buying the bride from her family, whereas the bride’s family thinks that this is a chance to make a lot of money. In her view, this custom twists the meaning of marriage. She herself has allowed some couples to keep this custom because she still needs to learn more about this issue and be able to explain her concerns using a biblical foundation. Jenny thinks that she will not be able to persuade her parishioners to forego this part of the marriage arrangement until she can completely understand the meaning of giving money to the bride’s family. Based on Jenny’s words, I think what Jenny needs from theological

education at this point is help in understanding and explaining some of these local customs using biblical reasoning.

Regarding her suggestions for the improvement of theological education, Jenny thinks that currently theological education does not provide well for the needs of female pastors of different statuses — meaning female clergy who are single, married to a clergy person, or married to a lay person. She found her direction in her ministry by herself. Jenny wishes that female clergy of different kinds, ministries, and levels of experience would help newer clergy understand societal expectations of them but then become clear themselves about who they are as ministers and how they are going to act.

Story 4: Wendy - Facing Gender Inequality in her Ministry

Before Wendy decided to go to seminary, she had worked for ten years. After ten years working, she realized that she lacked theological training in her career. This was what motivated her to study at seminary. She enrolled in the undergraduate program first and chose social work as her major in the seminary. She married a pastor the year she graduated from college and became a pastor's wife in the mid-western countryside of Taiwan. One year after she graduated from college, because of her experiences in field education, fellowships, and mission trips, she decided to enroll in the master's program and prepare

herself to be a female pastor. She has served at two churches with her husband since 2004 so 2014 was the tenth year of her ministry.

When Wendy looked back on her ten years of experience and talked about what she has been through in these years, what she shared was simple and clear. She mentioned that sometimes, because she needs helps from others physically, there are more opportunities for her to interact with other people. She continued by talking about the advantages and disadvantages of being a female pastor in her church. She said that because of her gender, it is easier for her to show her care for the parishioners and use judicious physical touch to increase trust and improve relationships with others. She found that when she talks to the parishioners, they are more open to female pastors and more willing to share. However, when Wendy needs to work alone with a male, she has to pay careful attention to the language she uses, and to keeping appropriate boundaries and body movements to prevent unnecessary misunderstandings. In terms of the challenges and difficulties she has encountered in her ministry, she asserted that not everything in her ministry is gender-equal, especially in the Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. When Wendy attends presbytery meetings, she sometimes feels the gender inequality. Since Wendy is ministering at a church with her husband, the same gender inequality situations also happen in the church.

When she talked about the influences she received from theological education at the seminary, she emphasized that it is necessary to have professional theological knowledge such as the history of theology, the deep thoughts of systematic theology, and so on because the teachings of professors in the seminary help ministers practically in their ministries. In light of her experiences in ministry, she believes that there is difference and distance between theological education and real situations in the ministry. There are also differences between ministering in a church in a big city and a rural church. The needs of each church are different and the spirit and attitudes of the parishioners are also diverse. She said that the training she received in theological education mainly followed the teachings of the professors and the reading of books. However, it is not enough for the ministers to apply what they learned in the seminary in their ministry situations. She asserted that what the seminarians learned in the seminary is limited. Therefore, she believes that ministers need to continue learning once they are involved in ministry and to extend what they have read or learned according to the needs of their ministries.

Regarding her expectation of theological education, she said that to have a continuing theological education is a very important learning process in nurturing a full time minister. Such continuing education allows ministers to learn what they didn't learn

in seminary; it can usefully supplement that information for their actual ministry context.

The learning attitudes of the experienced ministers are different from the seminarians who are inexperienced. Wendy is looking forward to receiving more theological and professional training and to getting more opportunities in continuing education from seminary after being involved in actual ministry.

The Stories of Married Indigenous Tribe Female Ministers

Story 5: Lynn - A Pastor with a Mother's Heart

Lynn is from the Ami tribe, one of the aboriginal tribes in Taiwan. She is one of the indigenous female pastors among the twelve interviewees in this qualitative research project. She grew up in a faithful Christian family. Regarding her reason for going to seminary, she said that she attended a winter retreat when she was eighteen and heard the speaker calling for those who were willing to dedicate themselves; the speaker wanted to pray for them. She answered the calling and dedicated herself to God at that event, yet she did not go to seminary until nine years later because she had been searching for the goal of her life and finally found that the deepest longing in her heart was to serve God with her whole life. She enrolled in the undergraduate program first and majored in social work, then studied for her master's degree. She married her husband, a classmate, in the second

year of seminary. Although Lynn did not grow up in an Ami village, she is fluent in both Ami and Mandarin. Because there is a great need for ministers in the presbyteries to which she belongs, she ministered at a church in the eastern part of Taiwan by herself after she graduated from seminary. Her husband ministers at a church in the neighboring village.

When Lynn talked about her experiences in the ministry, she emphasized that she is really thankful and honored to be a female pastor. She believes that this is the best thing in her life. She shared that to her it is a female pastor's privilege to nurture parishioners as a mother, which to her means feeding, nurturing, educating, supporting, sacrificing, and being protective, many of these being things that to her mind male clergy cannot do. However, she sometimes feels exhausted because she is so into these mothering characteristics and always does everything by herself.

She shared that she finds there are many situations of gender inequality in her ministry, which largely are the result of the deep patriarchal culture of her church. For example, whereas Lynn's minister husband is always invited to have lunch with different elders after Sunday service, this does not happen to Lynn. In her church, when the Sunday service is done, typically everything is over. However, there was one occasion on which an elder's wife in her church invited her to have lunch after Sunday service. During the lunch,

the elder asked Lynn why her husband had not joined them. Lynn replied it was because he always gets invited to have lunch with different elders in his church. To which the elder replied: “My wife cooks every meal for me. She always has lunch ready when I come back from church on Sundays. You also need to do so” (for your husband). Lynn was offended not only that she was not invited to lunch by others, as her husband always was, but that this elder was expecting her to prepare a meal for her husband as well as pastor the church! Lynn said that she does not care about getting a free lunch but she does feel she is unequally treated, given that she has the same pastoral responsibilities as her husband does. Though at first Lynn thought she was alone in feeling like this, later on she found out that this was a common experience among female pastors.

When Lynn looked back on her experiences in the ministry, she asserted there are three disadvantages of being a female pastor that she has encountered in her ministry. The first one is that female clergy are asked to do extra things which are expected to be done by women, such as preparing meals, housekeeping, and so on. If the parishioners were to see Lynn’s husband doing house work, the implication would be that Lynn does not take good care of her family — not that her husband doesn’t. Therefore, Lynn thinks that to be a female pastor in her context means being a superwoman. The second disadvantage of

being a female clergy and at the same time the wife of a pastor, is that Lynn is called “pastor’s wife” instead of “pastor” in her own right. Yet she notes that the parishioners do not call her husband a “pastor’s husband” although Lynn is a pastor, even though Lynn has talked to her congregation about this inequity many times. Such inequities go deeper. For example, Lynn’s congregation asked Lynn at a meeting when her husband was going to be ordained because they wanted Lynn to be ordained later than her husband. Lynn commented that, “It was my blessing that the pastor who was the moderator of the committee meeting explained everything to the elders and spoke for me,” and Lynn was in fact ordained before her husband. The third disadvantage of being a female clergy is that Lynn’s congregation thinks that because she is a woman, Lynn’s position or status cannot be higher than her husband. In Lynn’s case, some of the elders continued to shame her for being ordained before her husband, which they considered highly inappropriate.

When Lynn talked about the impacts and benefits of the theological education she received, she shared about learning about and thinking through issues from different perspectives. For instance, theological education helped Lynn to think more and more deeply about her sense of personal identification as a Taiwanese aborigine. As regards Lynn’s expectations of theological education, she asserted that it would be helpful if there

could be more courses and subjects about “knowing one’s self” at seminary. She noted: “Actually, there are many good courses regarding nurturing and training the future ministers in the program of Master of Divinity. However, [the program] lacks courses about nurturing or training females to become a pastor and for the female clergy to apply in their ministries.” “For instance,” Lynn continued, “I learned more about female issues in my college classes. I also recall that those courses on issues related to women (not religion related) that I took outside of seminary had a great impact on me.” Therefore, Lynn believes that it would be helpful if there were more courses about “female” issues at the seminary. She also emphasized that these courses do not have to be religion-related but could just focus on female issues and look at female issues from different perspectives and discuss the roles that female can play.

Regarding how to improve theological education, Lynn emphasized that it is important for female clergy to be prepared for their ministry careers while they are in seminary, before they get into the ministry. She recalled her learning experiences in seminary and said that when she was studying for her master’s degree at the seminary, she did not really think there was a need to know about female issues — precisely the issues that with more time became so vital for her. She admitted her lack of interest in such issues

at that time was also partly because some of the people who talked about female issues had what at the time were to her particularly strong opinions, radical views, and aggressive attitudes. Lynn shared that she did not realize the importance of understanding female issues until she was actually involved in ministry and that there are far more problems than she could have imagined when she was a seminarian. She mentioned the different attitudes to a female pastor between lay people and the elders of the congregation as an example. She said that most lay people in the church respect the ministers greatly but that the elders have a different attitude to male than to female pastors. She believes that it is pastors' responsibility to counter this bias and to encourage the parishioners, including elders, deacons and lay people, to treat male and female pastors with equal respect.

Lynn suggested that it would be good for female seminarians if there were courses about "knowing the self," and particularly recommended that these courses be taught not only in the Christian Counseling program but pervade the curriculum. Furthermore, she suggested that courses about female issues could pay attention to recognizing female identity and discuss it more deeply. It would be helpful for the female clergy, particularly if they also received the support of others by men also taking such classes.

Story 6: Isabella - A Dedicated and Brilliant Minister in the Village

Isabella is another indigenous female pastor, this time from the Bunun tribe whose villages are mainly located on the mountains of the central and southeastern area of Taiwan. After having worked in a non-profit organization for five years, mainly as a social worker, Isabella decided to go to seminary and pursued her M.A. degree in Christian Care and Counseling at the age of twenty-six. She started her M. Div. degree one year later. She received her M. Div. and M.A. degrees after four years at the seminary. This female pastor with dual master degrees ministers to a church near her home village in the mountains of southeastern Taiwan. Although she can speak both Bunun and Mandarin fluently, she has still encountered some difficulties in her ministry.

When Isabella talked about the advantages and disadvantages of being a female pastor in her ministry, the main factor she mentioned is her age. Because she ministers in a church near her home village, Isabella is familiar with the culture in the local village. Isabella is also able to get close to people easily because she is single, young, and female. However, most of the adult members of the congregation are the elders in her own family because the church she pastors is near her home village. In addition, because the congregation in her church is composed mainly of old people and children, it is not easy to

build up a team for ministry in her church. Another disadvantage is that the adult congregation in her church does not fully trust Isabella because she is young. Although Isabella can speak Bunun (her mother language) well, the congregation has really high expectations of her so her language ability has also become a disadvantage for Isabella.

When she talked about the influence the seminary has had on her, she mentioned that theological education helped her to understand the conflicts between her congregation and their expectation from the perspectives of empathy and kindness. In addition, the education and training she received through her M.A. course in Christian care and counseling influenced her way of communicating and interacting with people. To her, to keep on serving God and doing ministry includes daily devotional habits that she picked up when she studied in seminary. The daily devotional habits she meant include reading the Bible, meditating, and other spiritual practices. Isabella wishes that theological education could have taught her more ways to interpret the Scriptures and share the experiences (including leading a church) of senior pastors. She emphasized that she wishes theological education would do more to offer female perspectives and experiences. After leading a church alone for three years, in 2014 Isabella married another Bunun minister she met at seminary. Her husband is ministering alone to another church in another Bunun

village in the central mountain region of western Taiwan.

Story 7: Kirsten - A Young Female Pastor Earning Credits from the Male Elders

Kirsten is an indigenous female pastor from the Ami tribe. She grew up in a Christian family, and since she was young she has felt called to serve God as a full time minister. Specifically, Kirsten responded to a speaker at an evening meeting at a youth retreat who asked if there was anyone who wanted to serve God as a full time clergy. Afterwards, Kirsten learned about what kind of training and preparation a minister needs to have and enrolled at the seminary at the age of twenty-one. She started her study in the seminary after receiving a bachelor's degree in social work, enrolled in the graduate program, and received her M. Div. degree. For nine years she has led a church that is part of the Ami Presbyteries in the northern region of Taiwan. In 2014 Kirsten married her husband who is an evangelist and now serves the same church as she does.

When Kirsten shared about her nine years of ministry experience, she noted that female clergy are able to minister in a particularly feminine way without stressing the elders and deacons. In addition, the elders and deacons are more understanding and considerate about her needs in the ministry since Kirsten is female. However, the most challenging thing in her ministry is that most elders and deacons in the church are older than Kirsten

and they tend to denigrate Kirsten's lack of experience because of her youth.

Regarding what she learned at seminary, Kirsten believes that theological education enlarged her understanding of the Bible and made her not only read the scriptures but also get to know the background and contexts of the Bible and think more and more deeply about them. She considers that the field of practical theology helped her the most, especially in analyzing the sermon. Kirsten learned how to prepare sermons and preach and this has helped her a lot in the ministry. When Kirsten shared her expectations of theological education, she asserted that theological education can be more than learning from the Bible. She believes that it would be wonderful if theological education could do more practical training, such as how to lead and build up a new church, how to develop the outreach ministries in the communities around the church, how to have a one-on-one evangelical conversations, and so on. She made these suggestions because she realized after she got into the ministry that these are practical needs. She said that it would have been much better and helpful for her ministry if she could have been trained in such matters at the seminary. Regarding possible improvements to theological education, she noted that courses about feminist theology in seminary are more geared to academic training than practical applications. She would like to see some courses on things like how to work with

male clergy and colleagues, practices she can apply to her ministry.

Story 8: Holly - A Tough Woman Who Conquered Difficulties in her Ministry

Holly is an indigenous woman from the Ami tribe who grew up in Taipei. Unlike other aboriginals who grew up in the villages, Holly is a big city lady and can barely speak her mother language because to do so is not something that is valued in her life. When Holly talked about how she ended up at seminary, she said that she was not willing to go to seminary when someone first asked her about it. However, Holly was invited to attend her friend's graduation ceremony at Conservative Baptist Seminary in Taipei. During that ceremony, all the graduating students walked into the chapel one by one. Seeing her friend wearing the mortarboard cap and gown and walking into the chapel, suddenly one prayer just came to Holly's mind: "Dear Lord, I hope that there will be lots of people who attend my graduation." Holly was really shocked that she uttered this prayer, and she persuaded herself that it had welled up in her only because she was so touched by the atmosphere of that emotional moment. However, from that day, the idea of graduating from seminary would not leave her. At that point, she did not think that going to seminary would help her much to serve the Lord and she was not even ambitious to do something really great for God for which she might have to go to seminary. At that point, Holly couldn't find any

reason to go to seminary.

However, since the idea of going to seminary kept coming back to Holly's mind, she spent two years praying about it because she did not want to make this decision just based on her feelings. During those two years, Holly was getting more and more clear ideas about going to seminary and she found that her prayers were being answered in many ways. For example, during those two years, there were many people, including people Holly did not know or with whom she had not been in contact for a while, who asked her out of the blue whether she wanted to go to seminary. When Holly asked them why they were encouraging her to go to seminary, their answers were all the same: "I think that you are the one who should do it."

In the meantime, she also asked God for three confirmations for this decision. Holly does not remember the first two confirmations, but she remembers the third one, which was a particularly important one and pushed Holly to move forward. According to Holly, her mother was the one who never wanted Holly to be a pastor because Holly's mother thought that to be a pastor meant to live in a harsh situation with low pay. In Holly's mother's mind, going to seminary was tantamount to becoming a pastor, (no matter in which program she enrolled). At the time, Holly had a good job with a good salary and this

helped her family a great deal financially. If Holly were to go to seminary, she would need to quit her job and that would have a great financial impact on her family. The third confirmation for which Holly prayed to God was that if she should go to seminary her mother would allow and support her in doing so. Holly thought that her mother would stop her or ask her to reconsider such an option. To her utter surprise, Holly's mother not only cheerfully gave her approval but also encouraged and supported Holly mentally and financially until Holly completed her college major in Church Music.

During Holly's senior year of college, many people started asking her: "Do you want to study further and apply to the Master of Divinity (M.Div.) program?" Holly had been thinking that she could serve the Lord with her music skills after she graduated from the college program in seminary. She had never thought about being a pastor and preaching God's word. It had never crossed her mind. However, Holly's roommate reminded her: "Don't you think that you should pray about it since so many people have asked you about it?" Because of her roommate's reminder, Holly started to pray. One day, she prayed to God when she was riding a motorcycle: "Dear Lord, if this is your will and calling, I will do it. I will prepare my application and submit it. If I am not accepted, please do not ask me again." Holly shared that she did not apply to seminary with a serious intention of going.

However, she was admitted to the seminary and knew then that it was God's calling. Therefore, Holly studied and prepared herself to be a pastor who preaches God's word. After Holly received her master's degree, she was sent to a church in an Ami village, located in the mountains of the east-central region of Taiwan, and there ministered on her own to a church that is part of the Ami Presbyteries. One year later, Holly married her husband, who is a police officer working in Taipei. Holly's husband visited and helped her on the weekends or whenever he was off work. Holly is currently on maternity leave from her position after four years of ministry.

The church in which Holly had ministered is in a really conservative rural area. When Holly talked about the difficulties and challenges she encountered in her ministry she said that, quite apart from the issue of gender, the difficulties and challenges she encountered were issues of language, and a different culture and living environment. Holly grew up in Taipei where the people around her were mostly Han people who speak Mandarin and Taiwanese; her mother only occasionally spoke to Holly in Ami (her mother language). Therefore Holly can speak Mandarin and Taiwanese fluently but not Ami. When Holly started her ministry in this church, the first question the congregation asked her was: "Do you speak Ami?" Holly felt that this was really bizarre because the people who asked

this question do not expect their own offspring to speak Ami. In order to get close to the congregation, Holly worked really hard and learned how to speak Ami well. Holly described the attitude that her congregation had about this language issue with one phenomenon she observed. According to Holly, the density of the churches in Holly's parish is relatively high which means there are many churches around the Presbyterian church at which she ministered. For instance, within 1,000 feet, there is a True Jesus Church. The parishioners in these two churches are familiar with each other; some of them are even related. Therefore, whenever a person in either church passes away, the funeral takes on a competitive quality—because of the language issue. The parishioners in both of the churches are either friends or relatives of one another, so they are invited to the funeral. If Holly, the pastor of the Presbyterian church, preaches in Ami (actually Holly thought that she should preach in both Ami and Mandarin since there were some young people who understood only Mandarin), the congregation of True Jesus Church would compliment her to the church saying things like: “Your pastor is so excellent because she can preach in Ami at such a young age.” After hearing these comments, Holly realized that, instead of the content of the sermon, the parishioners were more focused on the issue of whether or not the minister could speak Ami.

Another challenge Holly faced in her ministry was that she had to adjust her life style. Holly is from Taipei, a big city. This city has many fun places to go to, even at night, and this is very convenient for her daily life. Life in the country is very different from Taipei. Holly had to drive quite a distance to stores from the church, and the options in the stores are limited. In addition, the urban towns become really quiet after 8 pm every night. Holly lived in the dormitory provided by her church; rice farms and roads surround it. After the sky turns dark, Holly can hear only the sounds of insects and cars. Furthermore, her dormitory is not close to any neighbors. Living in this rural area, Holly was concerned for her safety, especially after she married. Holly said that she needed to adjust her life style in order to fit in with the country life style but that her congregation did not think that this should be an issue for her. Holly noted, “The concept of empathy does not exist in the congregation’s minds.”

When Holly talked about the advantages of being a female pastor, she noted that she believes that being a female is a great thing. In Holly’s opinion, because women have a better sense than men of how to use an appropriate tone in their speech, they are better at solving congregational conflicts. Furthermore, she asserted that the ways that women think are different from the ways in which men do. In addition to thinking about how to make

the ministry successful, female pastors are also concerned about relationships among people and people's feelings. Holly noted that one of the important "weapons" or "powers" that women have is "tenderness" and she emphasized that this kind of tenderness could be very firm. Women's tenderness can make things happen, she said. For example, by speaking in a soft voice, women could calm others and make them listen. Holly also said that women's tenderness can decrease the conflicts between people and make people think through things calmly and analyze things clearly. For example, the elders in Holly's church were much older than her so if she showed them tenderness, they tended to treat her as their daughter. Holly learned that when she let go of the position/ title of pastor and spoke to her elders with a soft tone, it helped greatly in improving the relationship between Holly and these elders. Holly mentioned that another advantage is that female pastors can more easily become close with female parishioners and make them more willing to share their private concerns, especially conflicts or problems in their marriages.

Holly also talked about the disadvantages she encountered in the ministry. In particular she found it awkward to interact with single male parishioners of her age. These male parishioners were too shy to share their concerns with Holly and she also hesitated to probe. In this instance her husband had been helpful to her because he can more easily talk

to those male parishioners. Holly also encountered another challenge: her clothing. Whereas congregations in Taipei understand that the formal attire for female ministers can be either skirt suits or pants suits, this is not the case in her church. One day, Holly preached in her church and wore a pants suit. Afterwards, the congregation criticized her for not wearing a skirt. Since that time she preaches only in a skirt suit so as to meet her congregation's expectations.

Holly also noted that a pastor who ministers in a rural church has to be good at multitasking. This is because a pastor must play a big role in the church's financial affairs and other matters. Holly learned this from the elders and parishioners in her church. They thought a pastor has to be able to do all kinds of things including: administration, spiritual nurturing, visiting and caring for the parishioners, taking care of the church property and knowing where things are when the congregation needs them. In addition, Holly also had to check everything for church and make a list of what she needed. If Holly wants to do outreach ministries on different days other than regular special days like mother's day, father's day, thanksgiving, and Christmas, she has to do that ministry without a budget, in short "without spending money." Indeed, the elders and deacons explicitly told her that if a particular ministry exceeded the budget appropriated for it, the overage would have to

come out of Holly's salary. Holly shared that doing her ministry without spending too much money was a dilemma for her. And she noted this was not because the church does not have enough money; indeed every year the church has a surplus of over \$30,000.

Furthermore, when Holly talked about gender issues in her ministry, she asserted that there is a "double standard" between male and female ministers in her parishioners' minds. They expect more of a female pastor than a male one. They expect a male pastor to be masculine and aggressive, and find it normal if a male pastor sometimes has conflicts with others. However, they expect a female pastor to be tender and nice. Holly said that she needed to be careful about this issue, otherwise it will cause tension between her and the parishioners.

Another issue that Holly had in her ministry was her child. Holly married her husband in the third year of her ministry. Holly's husband works in Taipei, which is in the northern part of Taiwan, while Holly ministers in a church on the eastern side of Taiwan. It takes six to eight hours round trip to drive between Taipei and Holly's church. Her husband comes over to help her whenever he has a chance to do so. It was not a problem while Holly did not have children. However, the situation was different after Holly had her first child. "Who is going to take care of the baby?" became Holly's main concern after she

gave birth to her first son. Holly's husband works almost every day so he cannot take care of the baby. Although Holly's schedule was flexible, it was nonetheless difficult for her to lead a church and take care of the baby alone. She was always concerned about things like: "What if my baby is hungry when I am preaching? What if my baby is sick on Sunday? How do I take care of my baby when someone in my congregation dies and I need to take care of the whole process leading up to and including the funeral?" Some of Holly's parishioners' houses are not easy to reach since it is a village on a mountainside. Holly has to go up some narrow winding trails in order to get her members' homes. Therefore, Holly also needed to be concerned about things like: "How can I take my son there on a motorcycle, especially when there is a service at their houses on a rainy evening?" Therefore, after thinking through all the situations and praying, Holly decided to take a leave from her ministry at this church and she moved back to Taipei to live with her husband. Holly shared that taking time off from her ministry has had quite a financial impact on her family, especially since living expenses in Taipei are higher than any other place in Taiwan. Holly emphasized that she wants to cherish the time she has to be at home with her family, especially her son. Her thought is that she will have lots of opportunities to be involved in the ministry later but she will not have a second chance to be with her

son while he is young and growing. In addition, she also thought that she could take this break to rest and to review what has happened in her ministry so far and prepare for her next steps in ministry. According to Holly, although it looks like it is a drawback for her to take maternity leave, the loss is only material and she receives more spiritually and mentally. Holly believes that the parental leave is God's great gift to her.

When Holly talked about which part of her theological education had benefitted her the most, she found it hard to pinpoint one thing, but instead felt she was influenced in all ways by her theological education. The pastors who were deeply involved in spiritual movements in Taiwan taught Holly that she should not say passive or negative words like: I am sick, I am so poor, I have such bad luck, and so on. These pastors also taught Holly many things like: Do not "accuse others" when praying; Lift up both hands to show your obedience when singing praises to God; When pastors lay their hands on you and pray for you, you have to lie down to show that you are filled by the Holy Spirit; Do not go to seminary because there is the spirit of religion in the seminary; Clap your hands to welcome the Holy Spirit and glorify God when you worship; Do not watch TV programs other than news; Do not listen to popular music, only to hymns; It is very important to have spiritual gifts—like seeing visions, prophecy over people, and so on — so pursue them really hard.

After Holly studied in the seminary for seven years (four years for her B.A. and three years for her M. Div.), she realized that what she learned from these pastors had made her feel constrained rather than free. Holly said she has been so influenced by what they taught her that she cannot even express her true self to God in her prayers; she can only say positive things and bless those she does not like for fear that otherwise she will be cursed. Yet the professors at the seminary taught Holly that even King David expressed his true self to God, for example by cursing in his prayers. This made Holly realize that she can come to God with her true self and be honest. She does not have to numb herself with those positive words. Holly has felt a sense of release since she realized this.

In Holly's words, at the seminary she also learned that there are many ways to serve God. Holly used to think that to receive a calling from God meant only one thing: to serve Him as a full time minister. However, since studying at the seminary, Holly has come to realize that everyone has his or her own calling from God; she recalls what John Calvin said: that everyone is called to glorify God. She realized that a God believer has to glorify God at school, at home, and at work, and that this is the most important calling from God. Holly now thinks that glorifying God can and should occur in every single moment of one's life, not only by clapping during worship, being healed from sickness, or having demons

cast out. Holly extended what she learned from Calvin and said that Christians cannot only be concerned about their religious behaviors but also need to care about social issues and translate their concern into actions. When something unjust happens in society, when some people are treated unfairly, it is Christians' obligation to rebuke the injustice and speak for the weak and the poor. If Christians cannot do it, how can God's believers expect that God's will shall be done on earth as it is in heaven?

Before Holly went to the seminary, pastors encouraged her to pursue the spiritual gifts. However, as a result of her theological education, she realized that the most important thing for Christians to pursue is not spiritual gifts but love. Holly learned that when she saw these professors in the seminary express their love and care to students through their behavior, she saw "Jesus" in their humble attitudes. In her field education, she noticed that many elders do not have so-called "spiritual experiences," nor can many of them speak in tongues, but she nonetheless felt "Jesus" in their loving and modest characters. These learning experiences that were part of her theological education had a great impact on Holly.

Regarding her expectations of theological education, Holly said that she learned that it is very important for pastors to be able to counsel, because although many parishioners are not willing to talk to professional counselors, they typically are open to

talking with their pastor. She suggested that a lack of this kind of training could have serious results. Therefore, in Holly's opinion, it is very important for pastors to have professional counseling training, which they can apply in their ministry.

When Holly talked about what to improve about theological education, she noted first and foremost that theological education in Taiwan is still male-centered. She emphasized that, in her seminary learning experiences, understandings of scripture or of historical events were mainly from male points of view. Holly suggested that it would be helpful for students to encounter more women's views and to look at things from female perspectives. Holly also shared that the context and difficulties for female pastors are different from male ones. She suggested that it would be a great help if the seminary were to invite female pastors to share their experiences with seminarians. Besides sharing their experiences in ministry, the female pastors might also share some other issues, for instance: how they find balance between their ministry and family. In Holly's case, she is looking forward to hearing about how experienced female pastors deal with the family/ ministry balance when their spouse is a lay person, not clergy.

The Stories of Single Han Tribe Female Ministers

Story 9: Yolanda – Her Sufferings in Life Became the Blessings in her Ministry

Yolanda is the first person baptized in her family, which means she is a first generation Christian. Compared with other female pastors from a Christian background, Yolanda has taken a very different road in serving God. When Yolanda talked about the reason she decided to dedicate herself and go to seminary, she mentioned two facts: one was because she was deeply attracted to God and the other was that she received a very clear calling from God. Yolanda grew up in a non-Christian often-conflicted family and did not grow up to expect that she can be loved and accepted and live a secure life. After Yolanda had searched for a long time, she realized that there is nothing that can bring harmony to all human beings. In the meantime, she also lost a sense of meaning and hope in life as a result of some serious events in her life. She tried to kill herself in order to be released from the pain she felt. But Yolanda told me how, in her senior year at university, God amazingly had her classmates and advisor bring her to know God, the creator of the world. Yolanda finally found that the love and hope she had been looking for throughout her life can be found in Jesus Christ. This was the starting point of Yolanda's rebirth. Yolanda told me that she was finally able to face the challenges in her life, prepare herself

to be involved in society, and try to find a job and the value of her life because she received inner strength from God. Yolanda said that she finally learned that she is God's beloved creature and precious in God's eyes. When Yolanda realized that God loves her so much, she was deeply attracted by God. This was the first reason why she began thinking of serving God by going to seminary.

The other factor that triggered her to go to seminary was receiving a clear calling from God. Yolanda described the process of receiving the calling with several stories. When she was about to get a job and start her career after she graduated from the university, her mother church was looking for an assistant to help with the administration of the church. The pastor approached Yolanda and encouraged her to apply to her mother church what she had learned in the university. For Yolanda, this was a very serious invitation. The pastor and his wife prayed with Yolanda and reminded her to get the permission of her parents afterwards. Because Yolanda's family is from a folk religious background, it was hard for Yolanda's parents to imagine Yolanda working in a church. Yolanda's parents always expected her to find a job in government or the financial field, so that she could be financially worry-free in her future. After a serious and deep discussion with her mother, Yolanda finally decided to accept the offer to work in the church. Yolanda recalled her

experiences of this job and said: “It is an amazing experience to work in a church by attending the youth fellowship, young adult fellowship, choir, worship team, and teaching in Sunday school.” During these three years of working in the church, Yolanda got to know what a pastor’s life looks like and she was prepared as a disciple by the pastor. Yolanda also received the vision of a home on the earth and she knew that this vision represented that God would complete His mission through a ministry of the church, which is a home on the earth. Yolanda described that around that time there was a conference being hosted by her church and the speaker invited all the parishioners to ponder the mission and task of serving God. In Yolanda’s prayers, she heard a voice say “Feed my sheep” three times. At the end of the conference, the speaker requested that all attendees share with a pastor they trust whatever they had received in prayer. Yolanda shared with her pastor what she had received in prayer. The pastor told Yolanda that God was going to use her, but that Yolanda needed to pray more in order to know how God was going to use her in the future. Because of this experience, Yolanda started to listen to God’s calling for her. After seven years of listening and searching and lots of confirmation, Yolanda finally knew that God had called her to serve Him as a full-time minister because God had prepared her in many ways and trained her through the difficulties in order to “feed His sheep.” Therefore,

Yolanda enrolled at the seminary and now has worked as an assistant pastor taking care of the children's and youth ministry and working with a senior male pastor in a Presbyterian church in mid-western Taiwan for three years since she graduated from the seminary.

When Yolanda talked about the good and bad experiences she had in her ministry, she noted that her non-Christian background had caused some difficulties for her when she became a female minister. Yolanda said that whenever she went to the meetings or events, she was constantly asked questions like: Which church are you from? Who is your father? In what activities or events were you involved in the presbyteries and General Assembly of Presbyterian Church? This is because most Christians in the PCT are related in many ways. Clergy with a Presbyterian background often have relatives who are elders or pastors in different Presbyterian churches. Yolanda shared that the questions like, "Which church are you from?" or "Who baptized you?" were easy for her to answer. However, when people hear that she is the first Christian in a non-Christian family, Yolanda always gets responses like: "Oh!" or "Good for you!" Yolanda felt like she was left out when other people talked about their web of connections. She felt lonely when she realized that most of her peers have many people praying for them because they have so long shared a common Christian background. Yolanda imagined that these pastors would be much more

able to ask the appropriate people for help when they have problems in their ministries, but that she does not have anyone to turn to for help when she needs it.

Indeed, Yolanda shared that the most challenging part for her was that she had no idea whom she could ask for help when she had problems in her ministry. She remembered that the professors in the seminary always taught her to find a support group before she got involved in ministry, a group in which all the members could pray with each other and be a spiritual support for one another. However, this was not easy for Yolanda, partly because of her non-Christian background, and partly because she felt she would be bothering people who already had problems of their own to deal with. She wondered: “How can I share my problems in ministry with others when everyone has their own issues?” In addition, though she had been told to find a support group, many experienced ministers also advised Yolanda not to share her problems with others because “bad news travels fast.” Some rumors might be spread through supposed intercessors and the worst thing could be if the rumors got around and elders and deacons in the churches in which Yolanda is ministering heard about them, which would make Yolanda’s situation even worse and cause more problems.

One more piece of advice from the experienced ministers was: “Do not make friends with the elders and deacons in your church because it will jeopardize your pastoral

authority.” All the advice from the experienced pastors only made Yolanda feel even lonelier. Yolanda’s seminary classmates all got involved in their ministries after graduation and are busy in their ministries. Yolanda cannot find anyone among the ministers in the presbyteries that could be her spiritual support group. And she had been advised not to make friends with the elders and deacons in her church either. This was very different from her prior experiences of working in her mother church as an assistant. When she worked at her mother church, she could ask everyone in the youth fellowship, worship team, Sunday school teachers, or choir members to pray for her. Yolanda realized that being a minister is very different to being an assistant. To be a female minister for Yolanda was a lonely thing.

As well as this, because Yolanda is a single female minister, she also needs to pay attention to what she wears. Yolanda noted that she cannot wear the clothes that make her look young and fashionable because male congregants might perceive that to be a sexual hint. She also needed to be careful about the temptations and problems in romantic relationships in her ministry. Faced with all these situations, she started to doubt her calling and thought that she might have misunderstood God’s calling for her. Yolanda did not understand why her heart had become so narrow and why she did not feel as free and joyful after she became a full time clergy person.

However, after Yolanda had ministered in two different churches, encountered different difficulties in these two ministries, and really did not know how to face and deal with the problems, she finally discovered that God always waits for her to ask for help and receive strength from Him. In the first church in which Yolanda ministered, she had no clue how to deal with the elders and deacons in the church. In the second church, she is still learning how to work with a team. After experiencing all the disappointments and helplessness in her ministries, Yolanda said that she finally learned that what she can do is to call on God and cry out loud to Him for help.

Yolanda looked back on her painful experiences and asserted that she realized that what she had encountered was to build up her value in God's eyes and that God is her source of strength. Yolanda does not need to look for people's support and affirmations or question the value of her ministry because God is her spiritual supporter and Jesus Christ is her spiritual director. Yolanda learned that she is inevitably disappointed when she tries to earn people's affirmations; however, she can find great blessings in Jesus, her true hope, when she turns her eyes upon God and Jesus who love her so much. Yolanda said that, "God's affirmation is far beyond that of human beings." She believes that God will faithfully guide her through everything. Yolanda claimed that this has been a very

important journey of faith to her and that her painful experiences gave her a glimpse of the apostle Paul's difficulties in his ministry. In the fifth year of her ministry, Yolanda started to realize that: "God must increase, but I must decrease" and she learned how to let her "old me" die and rely on the Lord who is the victor. Therefore, Yolanda believes that the pain that she has experienced is a way to remind her to testify to Jesus' love. She keeps reminding herself that what she can do in her ministries is to "feed the sheep," enable them to receive the Great Commission of the Lord Jesus, and "go into all the world and proclaim the good news" of God's salvation.

When Yolanda talked about her learning experiences at seminary, she asserted that she benefitted in three ways: in her spirituality, ministry, and theology. Regarding spirituality, she said that theological education is the foundation of spiritual life. Seminarians can learn about God, Jesus, and the Holy Spirit through gaining the knowledge of theologians' thoughts about historical theology, the Old and New Testaments, systematic theology, and practical theology.

Yolanda also believes that the mystery experiences described by the theologians provide more scope for knowing God. In addition, seminarians are able to build up their understandings of God through philosophical thinking, observing society, and knowing

their true selves. Furthermore, seminarians can also go beyond their rationality and emotion and step into the area of spirituality. The seminarians can value their real relationship with God, allow God to work on them, and have God's words speak to them and nurture their spiritual life through daily Bible reading and devotional time. Therefore, the seminarians can develop habits of making decisions and valuing everything in life with God's guidance and standards. These are the spiritual benefits Yolanda received from theological education.

Regarding ministry, Yolanda asserted that ministers need to nurture and assist the parishioners to live out their lives with gratitude for everything, not ceasing to pray, and staying joyful always. This means the ministers serve the church with their lives. In Yolanda's opinion, the first and most important thing in the ministry is teaching the Bible through sermons and having Bible studies with practical applications in daily life. Yolanda emphasized that theological education provides theological training to have ministers be able to help the parishioners learn the truth in the Bible, pay attention to the needs of the parishioners, and provide what they need.

The third aspect was theology. According to Yolanda, theology is the important foundation for knowing the truth and ministers need to work hard to study theology in order to present the value of the truth, assist the parishioners in thinking through their own

problems, and provide thoughts on how to face the hardships of life with God's words. It is helpful for seminarians to be nurtured with theological understanding in the seminary because theology is the knowledge of God and to know the Trinitarian God is to be able to provide the right way to interpret the Bible and teach the parishioners how to apply it in life. Therefore, Yolanda also benefitted in learning theology at seminary.

When Yolanda talked about her expectations of theological education and made suggests for the improvement of theological education, she shared her opinions concerning her recent observations of society. Yolanda expected theological education to train ministers to be able to help the parishioners think more about God's will in social incidents and also to assist the parishioners to reflect theologically on all kinds of different situations in their country, society, and careers. She asserted that there are more and more females who would like to have theological training so she hopes that theological education can provide more female opinions and opportunities for having theological conversations between genders. In addition, Yolanda also looks forward to seeing theological education provide the resources of female opinions to the male clergy for them to learn, recognize, and have empathy with female clergy.

Story 10: Yvonne – A City Girl Adjusting to Country Life

Yvonne grew up in a faithful Christian family and her parents paid great attention to her education. Yvonne had a chance to study overseas and received her bachelor degree with a major in marketing and advertisement. She went back to Taiwan and got a job in the advertising industry after she graduated from a university in California. According to Yvonne, although this job was really interesting to her, she felt it lacked meaning. For instance, Yvonne could find no good reason to work day and night just to encourage people to buy more junk food. Yvonne commented that her Christian background did not encourage her to think seriously about her Christian faith until she had worked for years.

Yvonne described her thoughts on those busy days and said that she asked herself one question: “If I died from overwork, would I regret it?” Her response was an unequivocal “Yes!” Therefore, Yvonne started to consider her options: “What is The One Thing that is worth my spending the rest of my life on?” Because of a special opportunity, Yvonne went on a mission trip to Sumatera, Indonesia hosted by TTCS. On this nine-day mission trip, Yvonne followed the local missionaries and served the people there with the pastors and seminarians from Taiwan. One afternoon during the mission trip, Yvonne and the local missionaries went to visit an old man in the village and served him. The elder

wept emotionally because he was touched by their care and service. Yvonne was so moved by seeing this she was speechless. Yvonne said that she realized that she had taken her Christian belief for granted and made the Christian faith a mere decoration in her life. Because of this incident, Yvonne realized that there are many people who never get a chance to hear the gospels and know about God's love in the world. Since that day, she has prayed to God: "Dear Lord, please forgive me for being selfish for a long time and using the gifts You gave me to satisfy myself. Lord, please use me to pass out the gospel and prepare me to serve You." Yvonne quit her job after this mission trip and enrolled in the seminary to be trained to become a full time clergy person.

Yvonne received her M. Div. from seminary and worked in a Christian non-profit organization for one year. Afterwards, she was sent to minister to a rural church in the midwest of Taiwan. Because she had grown up in the big city of Taipei, it was a challenge for Yvonne to minister alone in a rural church. Yvonne described what she observed and said that the main difference between living in the countryside and big city is the much slower pace of rural life. In her work, she also learned that rural parishioners are not used to having meetings or to having lecture-style teaching, but that they pay great attention to human relationship. What made Yvonne feel happy is their pure and simple faith; however,

what tired her were the differences between her background and theirs. Yvonne always felt that because of the differences in their backgrounds, she could not fully understand and experience what her parishioners were feeling, including happiness, anger, sadness, and joy.

Because Yvonne did not want to waste the energy she had put into her ministry, after praying for half a year, she decided to be ordained in this church instead of going to a big city and ministering at a church there. Yvonne wanted to continue following God and dedicated herself in this church to expressing the good news to the communities around the church.

Regarding the role of female minister, unlike other rural churches, this church is open to having a female minister because the daughter of one of the elders is also a minister, though in another church. However, the residents outside of the church are more curious about Yvonne because she is a young and single female minister. Yvonne described what she encountered in her ministry and said that she had experienced verbal sexual harassment when visiting the residents of the community, and so on. Therefore, Yvonne believes that to be a single female pastor in this church, she has to be careful and pay more attention to her security and establishing boundaries with other people.

Yvonne summarized her experiences in her ministry and said that the biggest challenge for her is to overcome the differences in backgrounds rather than being a female single pastor in this church. Yvonne noted that she has the advantage of being a careful and good listener and good company, but the disadvantage of lacking charisma and self-esteem. After seven years of ministry, Yvonne believes the relationship between her and parishioners is like a family now, a relationship she has strengthened through being company to others and learning, reconciling, and staying with each other in God's love.

When Yvonne talked about her learning experiences in the seminary, she said that the most precious lesson she learned from seminary was "the attitude of life-long learning" or of having "a teachable heart." After two and half years fully involved in ministry, Yvonne felt that she needed to learn more in order to provide good service. However, when she thought realistically, she realized that it is impossible for her just to leave her congregation and ministry and concentrate fully on learning for another three years. Therefore, the habits of self-learning she has had since studying at the seminary have become a great help for her in the ministry, habits such as continuing to read books, attending seminars and workshops, and so on. In addition, she asserted that the rigorous attitude she learned from theological education regarding paying attention to the Scriptures,

the Word of God, also benefits her by laying a good foundation for her sermons and Bible study.

Regarding Yvonne's expectation of theological education, she said that if she could start over at seminary, she would like the seminary to be more like a "monastery." The reason she said so is because after she had ministered at a church for years, she realized that ministers really need to have a healthy life style. Yvonne explained more and said that a healthy life style includes a regular schedule and healthy relationship with self, others, and God. She asserted that Taiwanese churches are all involved in a society that values efficiency and bustle. Without Christians' consciousness, because of the influences of the major culture from the society, the church has become more like any other place that pursues good grades or numbers instead of being a place to accept people's weakness and have people encounter God's love. Furthermore, in her opinion, the ministers become more like CEOs of companies arranging different kinds of ministry plans and sacrificing their health to have good results, instead of being spiritual directors and spending time to keep company with self and others on the journey of life.

What Yvonne hopes for theological education is that it would let seminarians experience "monastic life" in the seminary. By this she meant a place in which there is a

balance between work and rest, a simple life style, a life to have time and space to stay with self and a life to spend time to be with God. Yvonne believes that it would help the ministers to serve the Lord longer if they could have a life style of “Action in contemplation, and contemplation in action” when they study at the seminary. According to Yvonne, the reason why she had these thoughts is because she almost got burned out in the past years of ministry, and she realized that she did not know how to treat herself well. After a spiritual retreat, Yvonne finally started to walk on the journey of reconciling with self. Yvonne’s life and ministries were restored, become more complementary, and she is now thriving.

When Yvonne shared her thoughts on possible improvements to theological education, she started from the perspective of connecting church life with the culture of the society, based on her own experiences in work and ministry. Yvonne believes that the church is an epitome of society in Taiwan. Furthermore, she asserted that how the society respects women is also reflected in the extent to which people respect women clergy in the church setting. After working in society and then serving in the ministry, Yvonne realized that the attitude of female employees (including clergy) in the PCT is really lagging behind that of Taiwanese society. She illustrated this idea with an example. Church committees tend to treat clergy couples as “buy one get one free” and pay only one of them — always

the man. Furthermore, even financially stable mega churches do not think that there is anything wrong with paying only one salary (or one and half) to a clergy couple.

Yvonne concluded her thoughts and said that, instead of talking about the need for theological education to improve the theological training of female clergy, she would suggest that the seminary needs to become “a leading sheep for the churches” and itself work on ideological education and a gender-equal environment so that female employees and clergy are treated equally and respectfully. Yvonne believes that if seminaries can lead the churches to establish a healthy relationship between genders and respect each other, it could also lead the society to respect both genders equally. “Then,” Yvonne said, “there will be no need to have a special training program for female clergy.”

Story 11: Faith – From Ministering Alone to Team Work

Faith grew up in a Christian family. When Faith attended and served in all kinds of services and meetings in the church in her life, she felt joyful and passionate. Faith believes that sisters and brothers in the fellowship are her spiritual families in Christ and help her a lot. Faith encountered God in a hard time of her life and this experience changed her values. According to Faith, she dedicated herself to God because she knew God’s salvation. Furthermore, Faith was also longing to know God more. She was enthusiastic about

anything to do with “God” and realized the need to establish a good theological foundation when she served God in a church’s ministries. After she received her bachelor’s degree in science from a university and had worked for years, Faith enrolled in seminary and prepared herself to become a minister. After she graduated from the seminary, Faith ministered in two Presbyterian churches. The first church Faith served is a small local church in the south of Taiwan with a small congregation of about twenty five. She served this church alone for four years. The second church at which Faith served, again for four years, is also a Presbyterian church, this time in Taipei and with a congregation of about two hundred people. Unlike the first church, Faith was the youth pastor at the second one and worked with a senior pastor.

When Faith talked about the advantages and disadvantages of being a female single pastor, she looked back on her experiences in both churches and claimed that she does not feel that there is big difference between male and female pastors in ministry. In terms of female pastors’ advantages, she thinks that female pastors are able to take care of deeper needs of female parishioners; however, for the needs of male parishioners, a female pastor like her needs help from male colleagues. In addition, she asserted that it is easier for female pastors to be the peacemakers. In terms of disadvantages, she said that due to her

personality, she feels something is missing like a lack of assertiveness and the ability to express clearly what she wants to say when she senses there is pressure toward her. She reflected on her experiences and said that she needs to learn how to speak the truth in love without fear of offending people.

Based on her experiences, Faith described how she valued her ministries in both churches separately. In the first church, because it is a rural church, the parishioners have pure hearts and are more straightforward, but do not have enough self-confidence. They are not highly educated and lack leadership and management skills, but they are willing to cooperate and be followers. Even though they have few funds, they are rich in their relationships with others. They look to the pastor for leadership so the pastor has to assist the parishioners to have autonomy. Therefore, the ministries of this church are hard to set up without the pastor. There were three main challenges Faith encountered in this country church. The first challenge was the lack of people who can work with pastors. The second one was that it was not easy to spread the gospel because folk religion is strong in rural areas. Faith noted that it takes time to build up long-term relationships with people in order to convert them to Christianity. The third challenge Faith encountered in this church was that the parishioners lacked the desire to change.

In the second (urban) church, Faith had a different journey. These parishioners are individualists, hold their own opinions, and have high self-esteem. They are highly educated, have plenty of leaders, and are able to set up and run projects. They are able to secure more resources but typically too many opinions are asserted and they make little progress. They have good financial ability and capacity, value efficient ministries and benefits, and focus on people's abilities. Because of these characteristics, they tend to get bogged down in the details of particular ministries. Therefore, if there is a lack of communication, they are quite capable of working on their own, but tend to lose the connection with the original goal that was established. Furthermore, the ministries can keep going without a pastor ministering to this church.

Regarding the challenges Faith faced in this church, she named four things that she had to work on. The first one was that, since she worked in a team with other pastors, she needed to learn how to communicate with her clergy colleagues when she had a different opinion. The second one was that Faith was concerned how to help the parishioners become mature in their spirituality rather than just nurture them with "knowledge" which does not apply to their lives. The third challenge Faith described was that she needed to adjust her attitude as an assistant pastor/a youth pastor and learn how to be obedient to the authority

figure in the church. The last challenge she shared was that she also needed to learn how to seek or ask for help when her work load was unmanageable.

Faith concluded that she had learned four things in her ministry to these two churches. The first learning was that she realized the importance of working as a team. She explained more and said that she learned that just as Christ is the head of the church and everyone in the church is part of the body of Christ and connects to Him, so all people in the church can grow in love. The second thing Faith learned is that it is “people” she serves in the church. This is just like Jesus who notices the needs of people and cares about people’s hearts. Only through the actions of care can people experience the love of God, Faith said.

The third thing Faith learned was how to find the balance between her relationships with God and with people. Faith shared the key to learning this is from Jesus and spending time with God. She explained more and said that Jesus spent time with God and he also lived with his disciples, so Jesus already set a good example for her from which she can learn. Another key for this is to spend time with God; this she believes is the foundation and assurance of ministry. In the process of spending time with God, she is able to practice Christian belief in life and implement actions of love rather than just speak the words of

love. The last thing Faith learned in her ministry was that she realized the physical, mental, and spiritual health of the pastors influences the growth of the church. Therefore, she learned how to manage her time, balance her personal life and her work, and set up a time of Sabbath every week and a period for personal retreat every year so that God can restore her to full vitality.

When Faith talked about the influences she received from her theological education, she talked about three things. The first thing was to face the ministries and teachings with a wide vision. The second was that, as regards many contemporary issues, theological education helped her to think about things from a wholistic perspective, not just follow what most people say, but look at the Bible for what the truth of God has taught us. The third thing was the biblical and homiletics courses, which helped her most in her eight-year-ministry.

Faith shared her expectation for theological education with five things that she is looking forward to having at seminary. The first expectation is for there to be courses or other learning programs about restoring one's personal life and knowing one's self, for instance, inner healing courses. The second thing she mentioned is that theological education could provide more teaching on practical theology, such as teaching the

seminarians how to face and respond to contemporary issues. The third thing she asserted is that she is hoping that theological education can offer teaching about the relationships between pastors like: how to face and solve the conflicts among clergy colleagues; how to set up a healthy boundary among the pastors, and so on. The last two expectations she talked about are teaching pastors how to build up and enhance their leadership; and teaching pastors how to know the Trinitarian God more through such things as spiritual practices and experiences.

Regarding her comment on improving theological education for training female clergy in Taiwan, Faith said that she was still concerned about this issue so she could only share what was on her mind at the moment. Based on her experiences in the ministry, she said that she does not encounter issues of gender differences or discrimination in her ministry and she believes that this is because that she does not emphasize that she is a “female” pastor. This is because her major in the university was science related; in short, she had been trained to be independent and rational. In addition, since she had been nurtured to have feminine attributes, she is able to be attentive and detail-oriented and express herself softly when she gives orders. Since she holds feminine attributes alongside an independent and rational personality, she feels she does not encounter gender issues in

her ministry. However, she said that it is more challenging for her to minister to a church as a single rather than as a married female clergy person.

Story 12: Lily – Facing the Patriarchal Culture in the Church

Lily is the first Christian in her family. She hopes to bring the Good News to her family and have all her family members and relatives become Christians. In the ten years following her baptism, she worked in a social welfare agency and specialized in special education. During those years, she realized that God creates lives amazingly and that human beings' understandings of lives are so limited. While doing different kinds of work helping people, Lily found the most joyful thing is to lead people to know the Lord Jesus and watch them become His disciples. She learned the theories and skills of special education and helped children learn how to take care of themselves. In her work, she kept company with the children and youth in need. Through these experiences, she got to know the needs of each family as she served them. Lily found that the needs of these families were not only about getting the help and support from the staff and social workers in the organizations but also about getting the medical care and the support of social services and special education from the government. In her ten years of working in this field, Lily learned that this kind of job demands the love of Jesus Christ in order to give her the

strength to love her clients in an ongoing way. Lily found that when she shared the Good News, talked about the Bible, and prayed for these families whose children have special needs; and when she gave her testimony to her boss, supervisors, and colleagues, she did not know the Bible sufficiently well. In addition, Lily also wanted to spend more time on her personal devotions, to worship God, and pray to Him so she could focus on caring for the souls that Jesus cares about, listen to the guidance of Holy Spirit, and understand the work of God in her work and life.

After working for ten years in this organization, it was clear to Lily that she wanted to work by caring for people. Furthermore, Lily felt that the Holy Spirit had nudged her heart and that she wanted to pursue theological education. Therefore, Lily consulted the clergy in her church, quit her job in this organization, and enrolled at seminary. When she shared her thoughts of going to seminary, she said: “I love Jesus and long to dedicate my life to be a pastor and learn how to practice my Christian belief in life and be a disciple of the Lord Jesus.” Lily asserted that, “I am so willing to dedicate myself to God as a representative of my family.” Lily enrolled in the undergraduate program and majored in social work. She completed her degree of B.A. (Bachelor of Art) and continued by studying for her M.Div. degree.

She graduated from seminary in 2006 and has ministered at a church as an assistant pastor in a big city church in the southern part of Taiwan for three years. She worked with a senior pastor and another male assistant pastor in the church, whose congregation numbered around 350 people. Lily was ordained in 2009 and started to minister in another church in 2010. When Lily shared with me her experiences in her ministry, she talked about the differences between ministering to a church alone and with a team. According to Lily, working as a ministry team, she learned that because all her colleagues received theological education, are well trained, prepared for following Jesus Christ, and working for God's kingdom, each team member has benefitted from the other. In this team work, every member respected each other and worked together to testify to and glorify God's name. Lily just focused on the vision that the senior pastor received and with which he led the elders, deacons, and the core workers of every fellowship and small group. Three pastors worked as a team and delivered the messages to each fellowship group in different services, including weddings and funerals and the three services on Sundays. In addition, because Lily also had to take care of the old people, women, and children in the community, she was able to apply her female attributes and build up relationships with everyone. In this outreach ministry, the old people enjoyed her care a lot. According to Lily, in her busy

working schedule, “The most fun and stressful challenge is to have personal devotional time and prepare a fantastic sermon.”

When Lily talked about her experiences of ministering alone in a church, she said that the situation is really different. Lily shared that in the ministry of the second church which she is pastoring by herself now, she found that each elder and deacon has a different level of spirituality and holds different concepts of management or leadership. Lily prayed, received a vision, established a goal, and built up the new management and leadership in this church. Lily started by praying and having devotional time with the elders and deacons and nurturing their spirituality. She also set up the small groups and had them connect with each other. She led the elders and deacons to build up the core-worker-team of the church. When Lily delivered the messages on Sundays, she preached the Bible systematically and with a well-planned schedule so she could help the church become like “a school of spirituality.” Lily realized that what she is doing in the second church is what she did not get a chance to do when she worked on the first church’s team. Based on her experiences, Lily described that the elders and deacons in the second church she is pastoring are used to being led by male pastors. Therefore, to help them adapt to the leadership of a female pastor has been a challenge to her. Lily learned that it takes time to allow the Holy Spirit to inspire

the elders and deacons to learn to be obedient.

Another challenge Lily encountered in this church is her living environment. The dormitory that the church provides for pastors is not sensitive or attentive to a single female minister's need for security and privacy. In particular, Lily is sharing the only bathroom with the parishioners. In addition, because the elders and deacons all hold the key to the church they can come and go to the church and Lily's dormitory whenever they want. Lily said that this environment has seriously affected her family and personal life.

Regarding what she received from the theological education in the seminary, Lily mentioned two aspects. The first one was that theological education helped Lily understand that doing theology is more about learning how to be like Jesus Christ, God's only and beloved son. Lily asserted that to serve God is not to rely on her own ability and knowledge but to reflect on her deeds and see if they please God and serve God's people. Lily realized that when she used to teach in Sunday school and be the supervisor of youth fellowship she had passion but little knowledge of how to manage people. She also used to think that, as long as she serves God at the church, she is a good Christian and this is the way to please God. However, she found that what she could do is limited and that she needs God to help her to see how He can make wonderful things happen in her ministry. Therefore, she

learned that to rely on God and serve God's people with a humble heart is what pleases God the most.

The other aspect, according to Lily, was about learning how to mentor and counsel those people who are hurt spiritually and mentally with comforting, encouraging, and sustaining words. To help these people means to clarify the problems that they have and encourage them to face the problems in their lives. Lily believes that sins make people unable to present the beautiful images that God has put inside of everyone, and as a result of this people get hurt and hurt people. Lily learned that the only and most fundamental solution to this issue is to bring people to know Jesus Christ.

Regarding the expectations that Lily has for theological education, she asserted that she looks forward to theological educators being able to free people from many different understandings and have everyone learn to know Jesus, the Bible, and the Trinitarian God correctly and with a joyful heart. In addition, she also looks forward to seeing whether the seminary can provide the teaching skills on how to apply theological education to people in different ages and contexts, such as theological education for construction workers, laborers, and cleaning persons; and disciple training for children, youth, and young adult who are students, and so on. Lily believes that this kind of teaching would be very helpful

and beneficial for seminarians when they get involved in ministry. When Lily talked about how theological education could improve training for female ministers, she suggested that the seminary consider having a course or workshop to teach and practice what is the proper attire for female clergy. Lily also mentioned that theological education could include a course for seminarians on how to plan and arrange finances based on biblical values and views.

What We Learned from these Stories

This section presents the inspirations from these stories of female pastors. First, these interviewees are sorted according to their backgrounds. The advantages and disadvantages that these interviewees describe in their stories are presented in the second part, and their expectations of theological education in seminary are put in the last part of this section.

The Analysis of Interviewees' Background

These twelve interviewees are sorted into three groups. In the first group, there are four married Han tribe female pastors whose husbands are also pastors. That means the women are “a pastor in the church and a pastor’s wife at the same time in the ministry.” In the second group are four married indigenous female pastors whose husbands are either

pastors or lay persons and all of the women are serving a church alone. Four single Han tribe female pastors constitute the third group and three of them have experience in serving churches alone and as part of a ministry team. Sorted according to the interviewees' age and years of being in ministry, the result is presented in Table 5.

Interviewee's Name	Age in 2014	Years of active ministry
Group 1: Han tribe female pastor married to a minister		
Bonnie	30	4
Tiffany	31	4
Jenny	35	7
Wendy	40	10
Group 2: Married indigenous female pastors (serving a church alone)		
Lynn	35	4
Isabella	33	3
Kirsten	36	9
Holly	40	4

Group 3: Single Han tribe female pastor		
Yolanda	40	4
Yvonne	42	7
Faith	40	8
Lily	52	8

Table 5. The interviewees' information

Table 5 shows that the interviewees in this research are mainly in their thirties to forties and the time they have spent in ministry does not necessarily correlate with their age. Sorting the interviewees into three groups is helpful for analyzing and presenting the data on different aspects of Taiwanese female ministers' contexts.

The Advantages and Disadvantages/ Challenges in their Ministries

The way to analyze the data is based on a research method in the tradition of phenomenological study. According to the contents of the stories provided by the interviewees, data is analyzed by coding the data by identifying key words, listing the statements, and categorizing the advantages and disadvantages these interviewees encounter in their ministry. Table 6 represents the result of data analysis; the illustrations and descriptions appear in the subsequent paragraphs.

Category	Interviewee's Name (group number)
Advantages of being a female minister	
People are more open to talking to a female pastor	Bonnie (1), Tiffany (1), Wendy (1), Holly (2), Faith (3)
Easy to get close with people	Wendy (1), Isabella (2)
Nurture congregation or lead ministries using female attributes	Lynn (2), Kirsten (2), Holly (2), Yvonne (3), Faith (3), Lily (3)
Disadvantages/ challenges of being a female minister	
Gender inequality	Tiffany (1), Jenny (1), Wendy 1), Lynn (2), Holly (2), Lily (3)
Finding balance between family/personal life and ministry	Bonnie (1), Tiffany (1), Holly (2), Yvonne (3), Faith (3), Lily (3)
Identification	Tiffany (1), Jenny (1), Lynn (2), Holly (2), Yolanda (3)
Setting boundaries with male parishioners /	Wendy (1), Holly (2), Yolanda (3),

need help in serving male parishioners	Yvonne (3), Faith (3)
Dealing with the problems of interpersonal relationships	Tiffany (1), Faith (3)
Too young to be trusted	Isabella (2), Kirsten (2)
Language	Isabella (2), Holly (2)
Adjusting to the culture and life style/ environment	Holly (2), Yvonne (3)
Other disadvantages/ challenges	
Lack of spiritual company	Yolanda (3)
Lack of charisma and self-esteem	Faith (3)
Lack of people with whom to work	Faith (3)
Help congregation to grow spiritually	Faith (3)
Work with pastors as a team	Faith (3)
Financial harassment	Holly (2)
Living environment lacking in privacy	Lily (3)

Table 6. The advantages and disadvantages/ challenges for female pastors in the ministry

The Advantages that the Female Pastors Find in their Ministries

Table 6 shows that there are three phenomena that the interviewees encounter as advantages in their ministry: people are more open to talk to a female pastor, a female pastor often finds it easier to get close with people, and a female pastor can nurture parishioners or lead ministries by using their feminine traits. Regarding the first phenomenon, people are more open to talk to a female pastor, Bonnie mentions that the advantage of a female minister is that parishioners prefer to counsel with her and it is easier for her to understand their needs by talking to them. Tiffany recalls her experiences and says that people find it easy to open up to her so she can easily have a heart-to-heart talk with them since she is a woman and pays attentions to their words. Wendy finds that when she talks to parishioners, they are more open to female pastors and willing to share in the ministry. Holly thinks that female pastors find it easier to get close with female parishioners who are willing to share their private issues with female pastors, especially the conflicts or problems in their marriage. Faith also says that female pastors are able to take care of deeper needs of female parishioners. When Wendy talks about a female pastor finding it easy to get close with people, she realizes that because of her gender, it is easier for her to show her care toward the parishioners and have physical touch for increasing trust and

improving relationships with others. Isabella also mentions that she is able to get close to people easily because she is single, young, and female.

When talking about how to nurture parishioners or lead ministries with feminine traits, Lynn asserts that it is a female pastor's privilege to nurture parishioners as a mother. Lynn shares more and says that to lead a church with motherly traits like feeding, nurturing, educating, supporting, sacrificing, and being protective are things that male clergies cannot do as easily. With the experience of nine years of ministry, Kirsten thinks that female ministers are able to minister to a church by using their feminine traits without making the elders and deacons feel stressed. Holly thinks that the tenderness that females represent not only can make things happen, like calming people by speaking with a soft voice, it can also decrease the conflicts between people and make people think about things calmly and analyze things clearly. Yvonne recalls her experiences in ministry and says that the advantages of her being a woman are that she is a careful and good listener and good company. Faith asserts that only through the actions of care can people experience the love from God. Lily says that she is able to apply her female characteristics and build up relationships with everyone.

Several things are interesting among the advantages. First, among these three

phenomena, the only advantage that applies to all three groups, which includes married female pastor, indigenous female pastor, and single female pastors, is that people are more open to talk to a female pastor. Nevertheless, among the interviewees, most married female pastors who minister with their husbands find that this is an advantage for her in the ministry. There is only one of each in the other two groups who feels the same thing. Second, none of the single female pastors among the interviewees finds that it is an advantage for her as a female pastor that it is easy to get close with people. This is because these single female pastors are concerned about setting boundaries with people, especially male ones, to prevent unnecessary misunderstandings in their ministries since they are serving a church alone. I hypothesize that therefore they might not be able to have the same experiences as other interviewees who assert this advantage. Another thing shown in this data analysis of advantages is that none of the married female pastor who are serving the church with their husbands thinks that to nurture the congregation or lead ministries using particular feminine traits is an advantage for them. This is perhaps because they are serving a church with their husbands who hold most of the authority of nurturing a church. Since these married female pastors are also pastors' wives, their role is more like an assistant to her husband. Therefore, they rarely have chances to really be a minister or a leader in the

church.

The Disadvantages/ Challenges that Female Pastors Find in their Ministries

Regarding the disadvantages, the top two phenomena which are mentioned by half of the interviewees are: facing the situation of gender inequality in the ministry and finding the balance between the ministry and family (for married interviewees)/ personal (for single interviewees) life. Regarding gender inequality, Tiffany mentions that it has been very challenging for her to be a female pastor because most clergies and elders in the PCT are still male and she feels that she is a minority among the clergy. In Jenny's case, although both Jenny and her husband are ordained pastors, it is natural in Taiwanese patriarchal society that her husband holds the position of senior pastor. Currently, Jenny is an assistant pastor for Christian Education in her church and looks forward to learning the things that a pastor needs to do in the ministry. It is the parishioners, not her husband, who do not give her the chance to learn about these things because they insist that these things need to be done by a (male) pastor, not a pastor's wife. Wendy also says that when she attends the presbytery meetings, she sometimes can feel the gender inequality in the presbyteries. Lynn shares that female clergies are asked to do extra things commonly asked of women and this represents the deep influence of patriarchal culture in her church. In addition, Lynn is called

“pastor’s wife” instead of “pastor” since her husband is also a minister. In Holly’s experience, when she preaches in her church, she must wear skirt suits to preach in order to fit her parishioners’ expectations. When Holly talks about the gender issues in her ministry, she asserts that there is a “double standard” between male and female ministers in her parishioners’ minds and they expect more from female pastors than male ones. Based on her experiences, Lily describes that the elders and deacons in the second church she is pastoring are used to being led by male pastors, so to get them accustomed to being led by a female pastor has been a challenge for her.

Another phenomenon also mentioned by half of the interviewees is that they have trouble finding a balance between the ministry and family (for married interviewees)/personal (for single interviewees) life. Bonnie says that she started to feel that it was difficult for her to be a mother while she was serving in the church after she had her first child. She sometimes becomes anxious because of her fear of not doing a good enough job with her ministry and her family. She is having a hard time finding the balance between family and ministry among the roles of a minister, a pastor’s wife, and a mother of two children. Tiffany also mentions that one of the challenges for her is how to play well among different roles, such as a pastor, mother, and wife and that it is difficult for her to find a

balance among these three roles. Jenny talks about her experiences of her ministry and says that since she has been serving a church with her husband, she has had to face the struggle of finding a balance between being a pastor and a pastor's wife. In Holly's case, she is looking forward to hearing about how the experienced female pastors who are married to a lay person deal with the issues of family life and ministry. For single interviewees, Yvonne asserts that to find a balance between work and rest, to have a simple life style that has time and space for the self and a life as well as time and space to be with God can help ministers serve the Lord longer. This is because Yvonne almost burned out after several years of ministry and she realized that she did not know how to treat herself well. Faith also mentions that one of the things she has learned in the ministry is how to find balance between her relationships with God and with people. According to Lily, in her busy working schedule, "the most fun and stressful challenge is to have personal devotional time and prepare a fantastic sermon."

The interviewees who assert that they encounter gender inequality in the ministry include both married and single pastors, both those who minister in cities and in the countryside, and both members of the Han tribe and indigenous people. Based on this research, we can see that gender inequality can exist anywhere and happen to anyone in

the ministry in Taiwan.

Another challenge the interviewees mention in their ministries is that they have to find a balance between the ministry and family (for married interviewees)/ personal (for single interviewees) life. Both married and single female pastors mention this phenomenon in their stories. In addition, the interviewees who indicate this challenge include female pastors who serve churches in cities and those who serve them in the countryside. Therefore, this is an important issue for ministers. The same issues appear again with their expectation of theological education in the latter part of this section.

The other two phenomena mentioned in the interviewees' stories are the issues of identity and setting boundaries with male parishioners or the need for help in ministering to male parishioners. Talking about the issues of identity, Tiffany says that the congregation treats her as a pastor's wife rather than as a pastor. She thinks that when her position is not clear in the ministry, it is not easy for her to teach or do anything else because she has no authority among the congregation. After serving for seven years in two churches which include a small church in the countryside and a medium church in the city, Jenny learned that the expectation of the congregation for her has swung between the identity of pastor and pastor's wife and has influenced how she thinks of herself. Lynn says that theological

education makes her think more and more deeply about her sense of personal identity as an aborigine of Taiwan. For Yolanda, she has started to doubt her calling and thinks that she might have misunderstood God's calling for her as she faces challenges in ministry. After all the struggles, she realizes that she does not need to look for people's support and affirmation or question the value of her ministry because God is her spiritual supporter and Jesus Christ is her spiritual director. She asserts that "God's affirmation is far beyond that of human beings."

According to the literature reviews of women's psychology and pedagogy, the issues of identity echo these women's theories. Among these three groups, the married Han tribe pastors are struggling to find the balance among different roles, which include being a pastor and a pastor's wife in the ministry and being a mother and a wife in the family, while the married indigenous pastors are facing the issues of recognizing their identity in their own tribe. There is only one single Han tribe pastor, Yolanda, who mentions the issue of identity and this is because of her background. She is a first generation Christian, which means she has no experience growing up in a church setting and with a Christian faith. In addition, she had no one to support her spiritually in her family when she becomes involved in ministry. The stories and struggles Yolanda shared are precious to theological educators

in Taiwan because she is one of the few female pastors who comes from a non-Christian family. When theological educators encounter female seminarians who are first generation Christians, this interviewee's stories provide an important reference for them.

Another challenge these interviewees talk about is that they have to set boundaries with male parishioners or regarding the need for help in ministering to male parishioners. According to Wendy's sharing, when she has to work alone with a male, she has to pay particular attention to her language, boundaries, and body movements to prevent misunderstandings. Holly also mentions that it is inconvenient for her to interact with male parishioners who are single and around her age because of the gender differences in her ministry. She asks her husband to help her by talking to those male parishioners. In Yolanda's case, she needs to take care what she wears because she is a single female minister. Yolanda shares more and says that she cannot wear the clothes that make her look young and fashionable because some male parishioners might understand that as a sexual hint. She also needs to be careful about the temptations and problems of romantic relationships in her ministry. Yvonne also mentions that she has experienced verbal sexual harassment when visiting the residents of the community, and so on. Therefore, she believes that to be a single female pastor in this church, she has to be careful and pay more

attention to her security and set up appropriate boundaries with other people. Faith mentions that she needs help from other male colleagues when ministering to male parishioners.

It is mainly single interviewees and the married interviewees who serve a church alone who mention setting boundaries with male parishioners. This is because both the married Han tribe pastors and the single Han tribe pastors who serve a church with a team have either the husband or the male colleagues take care of the male parishioners, while the other interviewees who serve a church alone have to tend to male parishioners by themselves. Although there are disadvantages, like the struggles of being a pastor or a pastor's wife, for these married Han tribe female pastors, there are benefits for them in this context because the female pastors who serve a church alone do not have a husband to take care of this issue. The same situation applies to the single Han tribe female pastors who serve a church with a team. They have the male colleagues to take care of male parishioners so they do not have the experience of asking for help to take care of the male parishioners.

In addition to the disadvantages/ challenges described before, there are four phenomena mentioned by a small number of interviewees. These four phenomena are: dealing with the problems of interpersonal relationships, being perceived as being too

young to be trusted, the issues of languages, and adjusting to the culture and life style/ environment. In my analysis, I found that several interviewees, who have something in common, encounter the same or similar challenges.

The first one, dealing with the problems of relationships, means that the ministers are busy dealing with interpersonal relationships when they are involved in ministry. When Tiffany talks about her experiences in the ministry, she realizes that no matter how big the church, there is always a group of people with great ambitions serving in the church, so if the pastors of the church do not have any particular plans for the ministries, this groups thinks they are not productive and efficient. Because of this situation, Tiffany has to deal with relationship problems among people rather than spend her energy on outreach ministry. Faith tells of a similar situation in the second church in which she ministered. Both Tiffany and Faith minister at a city church and mention this issue. The parishioners in cities tend to be individualists, are more goal-orientated, focus on efficiency, and they are also highly educated and have their own ideas. The parishioners in the countryside put more focus on the harmony of interpersonal relationships since rural populations are much smaller than those in big cities. They tend to be less educated and their personality is more passive and mellow.

The second challenge mentioned by two interviewees is that parishioners perceive them to be too young to be trusted. One of the interviewees who mentions this challenge is Isabella of the Bunun tribe. According to her, the adult congregation in her church does not easily trust her because she is young. Kirsten from the Ami tribe also mentions this challenge and says that most elders and deacons in the church are older than her so they always think that Kirsten's experiences are not enough because she is young. The reason they encounter this challenge is because the culture in the indigenous villages is more conservative and influenced by patriarchal tradition. Young female pastors need to put in extra effort to gain the trust of parishioners in indigenous villages. This is especially true for Isabella who ministers in a church which is next to her home village and in which most of her parishioners are the elders in her family or other older relatives. It is the context of the village that causes the interviewees to encounter this challenge.

The third challenge asserted by two interviewees is the issues of language. In Isabella's situation, although Isabella can speak Bunun (her mother language) well, the congregation has really high expectations of her so her language ability also becomes a disadvantage for Isabella. Holly only spoke Ami (her mother language) from time to time as she grew up so although she can speak Mandarin and Taiwanese fluently she cannot do

so for Ami. In order to get close to the congregation, Holly works really hard and learns how to speak Ami well because she realizes that the parishioners are more focused on the issue of whether the minister can speak Ami well than on the actual content of her sermon. As with the prior challenge, both interviewees who encounter this challenge in the ministries are indigenous people. Indigenous people in Taiwan all have different languages and customs in each tribe. For the indigenous people, the ways to learn their own language and customs is learning from their families, by living in the villages with elders, or taking classes (if there are any in the colleges). For the indigenous people who move to the cities and grew up with the families and people who only speak Mandarin and Taiwanese, the two major languages in Taiwan, it is hard for them to learn how to speak their own language. This is a challenge that usually happens to indigenous ministers who are not fluent in their own language.

Another challenge mentioned by two interviewees is that they have to adjust to the culture and life style/ environment in their parish. Holly mentions that one of the challenges she faces in her ministry is that she has to adjust her life style. Holly is from Taipei, the capital city of Taiwan, yet she ministers in a church that is in a small and remote village and rice farms and roads surround her dormitory. Living in this rural area, Holly's concern

is about her safety, especially before her marriage. Yvonne is also from Taipei and serves a church in rural southern Taiwan. Yvonne describes that the main difference between living in the countryside and the big city is that the pace of life in the countryside is not as fast as the big cities. Yvonne reported that she always felt that she could not fully understand and experience what her parishioners were feeling including happiness, anger, sadness, and joy because of the background differences. Holly is from the Ami tribe and Yvonne is from the Han tribe. Both of them grew up in the city and serve a church alone in the country. Those interviewees who do not mention this challenge in their experiences might also face a similar situation. Holly and Yvonne talk about this because the culture and lifestyle in the country are so different from where they grew up. In short, whether this is a challenge depends on personal experience.

There are also other challenges mentioned by at least one interviewee. Some of these challenges are personal issues, like they feel a lack of spiritual company or charisma and self-esteem or need to learn how to serve a church as part of a team. Yolanda experiences the lack of spiritual company and talks about her feelings of being a female minister and says that being a female pastor for her is a lonely thing because she has to be high up there in the mountains by herself. Faith experiences the lack of self-esteem and the

need to learn how to serve a church as part of a team. She works in a team with other pastors, so she has to learn how to communicate with the clergy colleagues when she has different opinions. She describes that she also needs to adjust her attitude as an assistant pastor/a youth pastor and learn how to be obedient to the authority figure in the church.

Some of the challenges are caused by the situation of the churches. The challenges include a lack of people to work together in the ministry, financial harassment by the elders, and a lack of privacy in the living environment provided by the church. In Faith's experiences in the first church she serves, she encounters a lack of people who can work with pastors. Holly experiences financial harassment from the elders in her ministry. According to Holly, if she wants to do outreach ministries on different days other than special days like mother's day, father's day, Thanksgiving, and Christmas, she has to do it without spending money, otherwise the money is taken out of her salary. Lily encounters the challenge of lack of privacy in the living environment provided by the church. Lily shares that the dormitory that the church provides for pastors is within the church's building and lacks privacy and personal space, most notably that she has to share a bathroom with the parishioners. In addition, the elders and deacons all have a copy of the key to the church so they can come to the church and to Lily's dormitory whenever they want. There is a

definite lack of sensitivity, security, and privacy here for a single female minister.

Although these seven challenges are mentioned by only one of the interviewees, these data provide useful information on the disadvantages/ challenges the female pastors might encounter and this becomes good information for theological educators.

Their Expectations of Theological Education

Using the data provided by the interviewees, their expectations of theological education are categorized and represented in Table 7.

Expectations of Theological Education	Interviewee's name
More courses that can apply practically in the ministry (including: Practical Theology/ Contextual Theology/ helping congregation to do theological reflection on contemporary issues or incidents/ practical training for the ministry)	Tiffany (1), Jenny (1), Kirsten (2), Yolanda (3), Faith (3), Lily (3)
Learning more about counseling	Bonnie (1), Tiffany (1), Holly (2)
How to balance family/personal life and ministry	Bonnie (1), Holly (2), Yvonne (3)

Provide more female views/perspectives or experience-sharing from female pastors	Isabella (2), Holly (2), Yolanda (3)
Help females to build up their identities (knowing self)	Jenny (1), Lynn (2), Faith (3)
Help seminarians to build a spiritually healthy life style	Yvonne (3), Faith (3)
Others <i>-the aspect of self-needs</i> Help female to balance different roles Provide courses on inner healing Help to build up the leadership How to do financial planning based on biblical values <i>-the aspect of ministry</i> How to find assistance/solutions in ministry Continuing education for pastors Learning different ways to interpret the Scriptures How to work with male clergy/ colleagues Teaching appropriate attire for female pastors	 Bonnie (1) Faith (3) Faith (3) Lily (3) Tiffany (1) Wendy (1) Isabella (2) Kirsten (2) Lily (3)

<i>-the aspect of seminary</i>	
Become the lead sheep for the churches	Yvonne (3)
Provide an environment of learning theology with joy	Lily (3)

Table 7. Interviewees' expectations of theological education

The expectation asserted by the most interviewees is that they hope that there could be more courses that can apply practically in ministry. Some of the interviewees suggest courses in the field of practical theology or contextual theology because they face the conflicts between traditional customs and Christian faith and want to find appropriate solutions for these kinds of issues. Tiffany expects that theological education could offer more courses about Practical Theology and provide specific curricula for churches of different sizes. According to Jenny, to solve the conflict between culture and Christian faith in Taiwan, the ministers have to learn more about the history, development, and meanings of local culture and interpret the Scriptures in this context. Jenny looks forward to theological education assisting her in building up different concepts that have theological foundations and become a new Christian culture because Jenny and her parishioners are trying to “do” contextual theology in their daily lives. She expects that theological education could teach her how to have a dialogue with the Taiwanese local culture and

understand more about how the culture influences the lives of Christians and non-Christians; she hopes to see this new Christian culture include characteristics of local culture with theological reflection and how it fits into Christian faith. Faith suggests that theological education could provide more teaching of practical theology like teaching the seminarians how to face and respond to contemporary issues.

Some of the interviewees long to have courses that could teach them how to help their parishioners do theological reflection on contemporary issues or incidents. This is because they encounter many social movements happening in Taiwanese society and it makes them concerned about building up fundamental Christian values in their parishioners. By looking back at her experiences in ministry, Yolanda hopes that theological education can provide the training to be able to help parishioners think more about God's will in social incidents and also assist the parishioners in shaping their theological reflection by examining all kinds of different situations of the country, society, and in their careers. Lily looks forward to seeing whether the seminary can provide her with skills on how to apply theological education to people of different ages and in different contexts, such as theological education for construction workers, laborers, and cleaning persons; and discipleship training for children, youth, and young adults who are students, and so on.

Some of the interviewees, based on their observations and experiences in the ministries, realize the need for realistic training that could apply to their ministries. They hope for training in: how to have and build up a new church; how to develop outreach ministries in the communities; how to have a one-on-one evangelical conversation; and so on. Tiffany suggests theological education could have courses on Pastoral Care as a requirement because from her point of view these courses are really important for serving a church. Kirsten believes that it would be wonderful if theological education could provide practical training like how to have and build up a new church, how to develop outreach ministries in the communities around the church, how to have a one-on-one evangelical conversation, and so on. The reason that she made these suggestions is because she realized these are practical needs after she got into ministry.

What theological education could provide in the field of practical training is partial because there are all kinds of different and unexpected incidents happening in ministry all the time. Such teachings are limited only by the educators' knowledge and experience. However, in addition to providing theological and academic training, this is an important reminder for theological educators to provide practical training related to the real needs of ministry.

The other four expectations asserted by some interviewees include that they hope to acquire more counseling knowledge; how to balance their work/personal life schedule; to have more female views/perspectives or experience-sharing from female pastors; and how to build up one's identity (knowing self). The interviewees hope for courses on counseling because they encounter people all the time who are going through hard times, like divorce or losing a loved one, and they realize they need more counseling knowledge in order to help these people. Bonnie has encountered many people who are having a hard time with their family or with mental suffering, and this makes her want to learn more about the issues of depression, divorce, unmarried pregnancy, and so on so she can help people in need. After being involved in ministry, Tiffany realizes that she needs to know about pastoring and about counseling. Also, in her opinion, everyone needs a spiritual director to help his or her spiritual growth. This spiritual director needs to provide biblical advice, have good counseling skills, and accompany people in need. Holly says that it is very important for pastors to have the ability to counsel parishioners; whereas many parishioners are not willing to talk to professional counselors, they are often open to talking with their pastors.

The interviewees expect that theological education could provide teaching on how

to balance family/personal life and ministry because they find that this is very important for them once they are involved in ministry. For Bonnie, in addition to training females to be ministers, she expects that theological education could provide classes about how to find balance between family and ministry. Holly also expects that theological education could invite female pastors to share how they find balance between their ministry and family. In Holly's case, she is also looking forward to hearing about how the experienced female pastor with a lay husband deals with issues of family and ministry. As a single female minister, Yvonne suggests that theological education could let seminarians experience "the monastic life" in the seminary, meaning a life style that balances work and rest. Yvonne believes that it would help ministers to serve the Lord longer.

The reason why interviewees talked about wanting to learn more about female views/ perspectives is because they think that what they learn in the seminary is mostly from male theologians or professors. They look forward to hearing more views/ perspectives from female theologians and ministers. In her interview, Isabella emphasizes that it would be better to provide more about female perspectives and experiences in theological education. In Holly's learning experiences in the seminary, readings of the Scriptures and historical events were mainly from male points of view and she thinks that

theological education in Taiwan is still very men-centered. Therefore, Holly suggests that it would be helpful to incorporate more women's view in theological education. Yolanda says that there are more and more females who are seeking out theological training, so she hopes that theological education can in future provide more female perspectives and more opportunities to have theological conversations between genders.

Another hope of interviewees was for classes on how to build up one's identity. Furthermore, Jenny thinks that currently, theological education does not provide well for the needs for female pastors with different status, by which she means the female pastor who is single, a married pastor whose spouse is a lay person, or a married pastor whose spouse is also clergy. She works hard to establish her own identity and to find direction in her ministry by herself. Jenny suggests, "there can be more and more sharing from female clergy who have different characters, ministries, and experiences. This would help more female clergy to be woken up from the expectations of the society and churches and find their own identities and ways!" Lynn thinks about how she receives help in finding her own identity as an aborigine of Taiwan and asserts that it would be helpful if there could be more courses and subjects about "knowing self" in the seminary. Faith has the same idea and says that she looks forward to theological education providing courses or other learning

programs about knowing the self. This expectation echoes the literature review on women's learning theories and psychology mentioned in earlier chapters. Interviewees encounter the issues of self-identity in their ministries and realize the importance of female pastors building up their identities.

Another expectation for theological education asserted by two interviewees is that it will help seminarians to build up a spiritually healthy life style. Yvonne thinks that theological education could help seminarians to have a simple life style, meaning a life in which one has the time and space to stay with self and the time to spend with God. Faith also suggests that theological education could offer a course or other learning program about restoring personal life, and how to know the Trinitarian God better through spiritual practices and experiences. Both Yvonne and Faith are single female pastors and based on their ministry experiences think that it is very important for a pastor to have a spiritually healthy life style. In addition, both of them emphasize the importance of having a regular personal spiritual devotion time daily and a personal retreat once in a while and assert that this is vital for having long-term healthy ministries.

There are also some other expectations mentioned by one interviewee. These expectations can be sorted into three categories: self-needs, ministry needs, and seminary.

The category of self-needs includes providing teaching to help female pastors find balance among their different roles; building up a pastor's leadership skills; providing a course on inner healing; and on how to do personal financial planning based on biblical principles. The reason for grouping these expectations under the category of self-needs is because they are more related to personal issues. Bonnie looks forward to learning how to balance among different identities, which are mother, minister's wife, and minister. Faith suggests that theological education could offer courses on how to help pastors build up and enhance pastors' leadership skills and courses on inner healing. Lily is hoping that theological education could include courses for seminarians on how to plan and arrange finances based on biblical values.

The expectations in the category of ministry-needs includes: courses on how to find assistance/solutions in the ministry; different ways to interpret the Scriptures; how to work with male clergy/colleagues; appropriate attire for female pastors; and continuing education for pastors. Although some expectations in this category also relate to personal needs, such as courses on how to work with male clergy/colleagues and appropriate attire for female pastors, they are also related to the broader needs of ministry. Tiffany hopes for courses on finding solutions when clergy encounter problems and do not know how to

solve them. Isabella hopes for courses on interpreting the Scriptures and sharing the experiences of senior pastors. Kirsten is looking forward to having courses on how to work with male clergy and colleagues that she can apply to her ministry. Lily suggests the need for a course or workshop to teach and practice what is appropriate attire for female clergy. Wendy recalls her experiences in the ministry and says that, to have continuing theological education is a very important learning process in nurturing a full time minister. Therefore, besides providing theological education in the seminary, Wendy is looking forward to receiving more ongoing theological and professional training and having more opportunities for continuing education after graduation and during her years of ministry.

The interviewees also expect the seminary could provide a joyful environment for learning theology; and be the lead sheep for the churches. These two expectations are part of the seminary category. Lily looks forward to theological educators being able to free people from many different backgrounds and have everyone learn to know Jesus, the Bible, and the Trinitarian God with a joyful heart. Yvonne believes that the church is an epitome of the society in Taiwan so she asserts that, instead of talking about the improvement of theological education for assisting the theological training of female clergies, she would suggest that the seminary needs to become “a leading sheep for the churches” and work on

ideological education and a gender-equal environment so the female employees and clergy are treated with fairness and respect. Yvonne believes that “there will be no need to have a special training program for female clergy” if seminaries can lead the churches to establish a healthy relationship and respect between the genders.

Chapter 6

Educational Applications of this Research and Suggestions for Theological Education in Taiwan

In this research project, by connecting the literature reviews of women's theories with the interview data, two categories of educational applications become clear: educational applications for theological educators and suggestions to theological schools/seminaries. The first part of this chapter presents a brief summary of the teaching concepts from the literature review and educational applications for theological educators and suggestions to theological schools/seminaries are illustrated in the last two parts.

A Summary of Teaching Concepts from Women's Theories

In the literature reviews about teaching female seminarians, there are four main concepts for theological educators to keep in mind. First, it is important to have a dialogue process when teaching women because dialogue is a way for women to voice their inner thoughts. Following Freire's assertion of this concept, the researchers of WWK, Harries, and The Mud Flower Collective all emphasize this concept in teaching women. In addition, according to the research of neuroscientists Mildner and Bear, women are typically much

better than men at verbal expression because they develop the ability to communicate by taking care of the family.³⁹² Based on their research and teaching experiences in theological education, Chopp, Moore, and Hayes also extol the importance of having women speak out their thoughts in class, and think that teachers should be like a midwife and help female learners give birth to their true thoughts.

In Taiwan, female seminarians have a lot of chances to speak in front of people when they preach or talk to people in churches, but this does not mean that female seminarians have many chances to voice their true inner thoughts. To have a dialogue process when teaching provides female seminarians in particular with opportunities to articulate their true thoughts. In addition to being speakers, teachers need to be listeners in order for this dialogue process to work well in their teaching. Harries claims that listening is also one of the important elements of spiritual life — indeed she says it is the beginning of the relationship of self, Divinity, and others. Theological educators therefore need to be listeners and listen to female seminarians' real thoughts.

In order for female seminarians to speak out their true and inner voices, besides having a dialogue process, the second concept – building a supportive group in class – is

³⁹² Bear, *Neuroscience*, 566-567 and Mildner, *Cognitive Neuroscience*, 41- 42.

also needed. The Cornwall Collective asserts that learning occurs best in a supportive environment and that the companionship and supports from others is particularly necessary in women's learning process. The Mud Flower Collective suggests that female seminarians particularly depend on the sisterhood, meaning women in solidarity who support each other. WWK advocates for the idea of a connected class, which is just like a support group. Hayes thinks that women's connections with themselves and others assist one another's transformation.

In order to help everyone in class be a good support to each other, one needs to have an alternative space, the third concept that the literature review recommends. The Cornwall Collective believes that an alternative space offers opportunities to learners to have personal growth and understand the work of love. The concept of alternative space is also related to the idea we find in WWK of welcoming diversity of opinion. Chopp relates the idea of alternative space to connection and asserts that connections happen not only in situations of warmth and bonding but also of conflict, tension, and difference. When Slee talks about women's faith development, she also asserts that women are able to establish right relations with others when they connect to and accept the real self. Based on Slee's assertions, when women have a mature relationship with God and self, they are able to

have a divine view of others and appreciate difference. This is the element necessary for being a supporter, which is one of the important roles for teachers.

The last concept common to the literature review is aesthetic teaching, a way to help women be authentic. Harries shares how she was inspired by the teaching of Tully, who incorporates art work into her classes. Harries claims that art work is a way for women to engage their own feelings, express their true selves, and be authentic. Based on Chopp's words, writing is a way of representing someone's life and, according to Moore, narratives are the source of imagination. These are also called artistic ways to express the true self. Based on Christ's and Harries' ideas, discovering and expressing one's real thoughts is a way to find connections with the true self, God, and others. In the process of doing so, one finds new and divine perspectives on one's true self and women are able to be authentic. Artistic works assist women in being authentic and creative and this is liberative for women.

Educational Applications for Theological Educators

Based on the four teaching concepts from women's theories and the interview data, the educational application suggestions for theological educators in Taiwan teaching female seminarians include three concepts: be a listener before being a speaker, be a supporter before being a teacher, and be liberated before liberating others.

Be a Listener before Being a Speaker

This educational application for theological educators mainly applies the concepts of midwife teachers that are learner-centered and focus on assisting learners to give birth to their unheard and sometimes unformed voices. Many female learning theorists promote the dialogue process as a key teaching method in teaching female learners in theological education. The dialogue process is an important way for women to articulate their voices and ideas, which might have been suppressed for a long time and be longing to be heard. Furthermore, listening is a spiritual practice; women all need to experience the Divinity as a voice or a presence, as we saw in the review of the literature on women's spiritual formation.³⁹³ It is beneficial for the female seminarian to recognize her own voice, which might include a voice of resistance, and to let her talk about her own feelings without social negotiation. It is very important to have female seminarians speak with their own voices because it helps them develop their selves.

In the stories that came out of the interviews, half of the interviewees experience gender inequality in their ministries because they do not have many chances to voice their struggles, especially in the area of their hard battle to satisfy unreasonable congregational

³⁹³ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 91.

expectations, trying to develop a sense of self, and achieving balance in their work/ family roles. This seems to indicate that one of the goals of theological educators should be to listen before speaking, and to teach particular issues to these female students. For female seminarians voicing their issues can help them to know themselves better and thus develop a stronger sense of self and self-esteem, which surely are also aspects of theological education. In the process of listening to the female seminarians, in taking time to dialogue, both theological educators and seminarians benefit.

Be a Supporter before Being a Teacher

The second educational application of this research to theological educators in Taiwan is to be a supporter before being a teacher. Based on what we know about women's psychology, relationships play important roles in women developing their concepts of self. Having a support group is important and helpful to women because to receive the support of others provides strength for women to transform and move to a different psychological developmental stage. The support of theological educators also helps female seminarians develop their own identities and then be better placed to help female parishioners in their churches. In addition, the idea of relationships with others can be extended to the relationship with God. To help female seminarians to build up a mature relationship with

God is one of the teaching tasks for theological educators in Taiwan.

Furthermore, having alternative spaces and welcoming diversity are also helpful tactics in teaching women in the seminaries. Having an alternative space allows women to learn freely and better. With this alternative space in place, female seminarians can reveal their authentic selves without any fear of being judged or rejected. Theological educators need to have alternatives space in their teaching in order to support female students in particular.

In the stories that came out of the interviewees, some interviewees mention that they lack charisma and self-esteem in their ministries. They also share that it is hard for them to find spiritual company and people to work with in their ministries. They yearn for theological education to help them find ways to do both. The women interviewees also look forward to having courses on inner healing and continuing education for pastors. These female pastors need to be supported in many ways in their ministries. What theological educators can offer to female seminarians is to be a supporter and have a good relationship with them. Moreover, theological educators can also help with building up support groups among them when they are studying at the seminary so they can be supporters to each other after they graduate and are involved in ministry.

Be Liberated before Liberating Others

The last and the most needed educational application of these findings for theological educators is for them to be liberated before liberating others. Theological educators must have experiences of being liberated and reveal their true self in front of people first in order to teach authentically and help the female learners be liberated.

According to women psychologists, women have been directly or indirectly hurt in their relationships during the process of growing-up and built up systems of self-protection. Enabling female seminarians to break through this self-protection system and reveal their true selves is to help them to grow and achieve human maturity. This concept can be extended to include aesthetic teaching. Being an artist is a way for women to be authentic. It also engages human feelings and experiences. This idea is from Harris' observation of Tully's teaching, which she describes as teaching an aesthetic, rather than being goal-oriented, and having "a climate where one waits to see what will emerge."³⁹⁴ When women are able to freely express their authentic self in all kinds of art work, they are finding a way to access and develop their creativity.

For a long time, women have been negatively influenced and oppressed in the

³⁹⁴ Harris, *Teaching and Religious Imagination*, 120.

contexts in which they grew up. It is also a long process for women to recover and develop a new identity. Yet as long as a woman is moving toward maturity, it does not matter how long it takes for her to develop this own voice and new identity. According to the interview data, one of the greatest challenges that the female pastors face in their ministries is the issue of identity. They have to reach the point at which what they do in their ministries is not only to fulfill the expectations of the parishioners and the society but also for it to be an expression of their selves. These former seminarians think that theological education can do better at helping them know their selves and develop a strong self identity while still at seminary. As part of this task, one of the female pastors, Lily, even looks forward to learning how to dress appropriately in the ministry. Many things make these female pastors lose or get confused about their sense of identity once they are involved in full-time ministry. One of the helpful things that theological educators can offer in their teaching is to liberate these female clergy from what they have already experienced and help them to build up their own sense of identity. But in order to liberate others, theological educators themselves first need to be liberated.

Educational Suggestions for Theological Schools/ Seminaries

Based on the literatures of women's pedagogy and psychology and the expectations

of theological education garnered from the interviewees, I offer some educational suggestions for theological schools/ seminaries in Taiwan. In this section, I propose three aspects (for seminarians, ministers, and churches respectively) about what theological schools/ seminaries can do regarding strengthening theological education in Taiwan. Each aspect illustrates the connections between the literature and the interview data and the practical suggestions for changes that could be applied in theological schools/ seminary settings.

For Seminarians: Improve/ Increase the Courses about Practical Theology

The interviewees uniformly express a desire that theological schools/ seminaries offer more courses that have practical ministry applications, including courses on: practical theology, contextual theology, helping congregation to do theological reflection on contemporary issues or incidents, practical training for the ministry, and so on. Such courses can be divided into two kinds: courses that apply to ministers' own needs, and courses that apply to specific church ministries.

Women psychologists note the importance of women building strong relationships (both with self and others) for healthy female psychological development. Courses on self-need help female seminarians grow spiritually and psychologically, and are helpful for such

women to develop a good sense of and relationship to their self. The courses for ministry-need help female seminarians to build up and improve relationships with others. Through these courses, female seminarians are able to find, understand, and accept their true self and that of others. This echoes the findings of studies of women's psychology and pedagogy.

Practices:

Theological schools/ seminaries can provide courses about inner healing, leadership, biblical hermeneutics from female perspectives, and so on, to help female seminarians grow personally and spiritually, and to prepare them for their future ministry.

Theological schools/ seminaries can also host short-term workshops and invite the experienced pastors to share their thoughts and experiences on topics such as finding balance between different roles (eg. parenting and professional roles), setting up schedules that can balance self and ministry, how to work with male clergy/ colleagues, and how to prepare budgets based on biblical values.

In addition, if it is hard to have experienced female pastors come to share with seminarians/clergy in person, theological schools/ seminaries can try to build an on-line platform through social media so that participation is not limited by time, geography, and

access.

For Ministers: Enhance Continuing Education

Another educational application suggestion for theological schools/ seminaries is to enhance continuing education, especially for female and full-time ministers. This is somewhat like an alumni program. Currently the clergy's continuing education program in the PCT is only for evangelists who have just graduated but are not yet ordained.³⁹⁵ My interviews strongly suggest there is a need for continuing education among pastors in Taiwan, and especially among female pastors. When these female seminarians are still enrolled in theological school/ seminary, they are under the institution's wing and do not have to face every challenge from the local churches by themselves. They have teachers and friends in theological schools/ seminaries to support them. Many interviewees mentioned that they feel they are alone once they become involved in ministry.

Women psychologists emphasize that it takes support to help women face and overcome the challenges. Ordained full-time female pastors in Taiwan have to find their own support systems once they are involved in ministry. Continuing education programs

³⁹⁵ "Continuing Education and Training for Evangelists," 台灣基督長老教會傳道委員會[Evangelism Committee of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan], accessed May 9, 2016, https://web.archive.org/web/20160509182012/http://www.pct.org.tw/ab_eva.aspx. This is a Chinese website, although it also has English version but the information is different from the Chinese one. I think it is because the information I mention is mainly applied to Taiwanese clergy in the PCT. Therefore, the information only appears in the website of Chinese version.

of theological schools/ seminaries are well situated to continue providing support to full-time female pastors after they graduate.

Practice:

Theological schools/ seminaries can for example offer continuing education programs that provide courses about facing contemporary global/ social issues or incidents with biblical values; how to identify the spiritual needs of the parishioners; and so on. Theological schools/ seminaries can also host monthly seminars and annual retreats for the female pastors in the continuing education program so these women have opportunities to get together and receive each other's support.

For those clergies who for whatever reasons have difficulty attending such programs, seminars, or retreats, theological schools/ seminaries can also establish long-distance/ on-line courses so they can also benefit.

With Churches: Build up Good Relationships/ Partnerships

The last educational suggestion for theological schools/ seminaries is to build up good relationships/ partnerships with churches. This is because there is a clear "congregation-seminarian-pastor cycle" between theological schools/ seminaries and local churches in Taiwan. Seminarians are used to being parishioners in churches and being

nurtured by the pastors. Then, these parishioners enroll in theological schools/ seminaries and become pastors after graduation. These pastors trained by these self-same theological schools/ seminaries are sent to minister to the local churches and nurture the parishioners, including the future seminarians. This is what I mean by the “congregation-seminarian-pastor cycle.” Therefore, theological schools/ seminaries can be a bridge between pastors and churches with what they can provide. According to the interview data, one of the female pastors, Yvonne, looks forward to theological schools/ seminaries providing churches/ pastors with the advanced theological assumptions and reflections on contemporary issues. The seminary provides theological and academic knowledge but the churches are dealing with practical situations, facts, and real life issues. If theological schools/ seminaries could provide theological knowledge and churches could provide the challenges or issues they are facing, theological schools/ seminaries and churches could work together to discover solutions for or appropriate theological perspectives on practical issues or contemporary incidents. Therefore, theological knowledge can be applied in real life. This way both parties can benefit one other. But it seems up to theological schools/ seminaries to take the first step and establish good relationships/ partnerships with churches.

Furthermore, we saw from studies on women’s pedagogy that to have dialogue and

alternative spaces are important in educating female learners. To have platforms for both theological educators and local church clergy (including pastors, elders, and deacons) to communicate and exchange opinions is a way of applying the dialogue process and creating alternative spaces. Both parties are able to be listeners and offer an alternative space for others who have different opinions. It is also a practice that encourages both parties to be authentic and speak their real thoughts.

Practices:

Theological schools/ seminaries can host a seasonal forum or annual conference with feminist topics and invite theological educators, pastors, and the elders and deacons of churches to attend. This way, all participants have a chance to share what they think and together to build up views on contemporary/ practical issues based on Christian faith and theology. By sharing their views and perspectives, both theological schools/ seminaries and churches are better able to understand each other and build up good relationships/ partnerships.

In addition, the discussions and opinions asserted in the forums/ conferences can be published in books or posted on social media so other Christians can also benefit from these forums and conferences.

Chapter 7

Conclusion

This is a qualitative research study about the life stories of female ministers in Taiwan. The purpose of this research was to discover the experiences of female pastors in Taiwan and submit these experiences as teaching resources for theological educators to consider as they teach in seminaries. The title of this research, “Learning from Her Story,” represents the essence of this research project. This is also original and pioneering research since to my knowledge no one has done qualitative research on this topic before.

The literature reviews include the theories of women’s psychology and neuroscience studies and the research on women’s pedagogy and spiritual formation in theological education. Women’s psychological development relates to their relationships with others and selves from the perspective of women’s psychology. Both Gilligan and Kegan claim the importance of relationship to women based on different psychological traditions.³⁹⁶ Gilligan asserts that social interaction and personal relationships characterize women’s lives whereas Kegan thinks that the relationships with others brings different

³⁹⁶ Gilligan, *In A Different Voice*, 8-9; and Kegan, *Evolving Self*, 184-220.

influences when women are developing their concepts, of self according to his human development theory.

In terms of women's pedagogy, to have a dialog process is one of the necessary methods while teaching women. Freire counters the idea of banking education and asserts instead that dialogue is a necessary part of teaching that liberates students from banking-style education.³⁹⁷ Harris also points out the importance for a woman to speak in her own voice and declares that teachers need to teach women to awaken from silence and begin to practice saying their own names and finding their own voices.³⁹⁸ Regarding the theories of women's spiritual formation, Harris applies the metaphor of asking women to remove their make-up and take off their shoes in order to reveal their true spiritual selves.³⁹⁹ In addition, Conn asserts that women's spirituality is about self-knowledge, which can teach women to be more inclusive and compassionate.⁴⁰⁰ Slee believes women's faith development is about "being in relationship to God and/or the Other."⁴⁰¹

Since to my knowledge there is no one else who has done or is doing this kind of qualitative research that relates theological education and theories of education to women's

³⁹⁷ Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 58.

³⁹⁸ Harris, *Women and Teaching*, 27.

³⁹⁹ Harris, *Dance of the Spirit*, 15-17.

⁴⁰⁰ Conn, "Dancing in the Dark," 17-18.

⁴⁰¹ Slee, *Women's Faith Development*, 140.

experiences in Taiwan, the qualitative research in this dissertation paints a useful picture of the life experiences of female ministers in Taiwan and connects these stories with theories of women's psychology and neuroscience and the research of female pedagogy and spiritual formation in theological education. Furthermore, this qualitative research is offered as a teaching resource for theological educators and also a work that contextualizes what the literatures from the United States can offer in the Taiwanese context. Taiwanese female ministers' experiences, both positive and negative ones, include very helpful and practical suggestions to theological educators in Taiwan that might help them better assist and prepare female seminarians both before and after they begin ministry.

The educational applications and suggestions connect the life stories and experiences of female pastors to the women's theories relating to theological education for female learners. Three educational applications for theological educators and three educational suggestions for theological schools/ seminaries are proposed in this research project. The three educational applications for theological educators in Taiwan are: be a listener before being a speaker; be a supporter before being a teacher; and be liberated before liberating others. The three educational suggestions to theological schools/ seminaries are: to improve/ increase the courses in the field of practical theology for

seminarians; to enhance continuing education for ministers/ pastors; and to build up good relationships/ partnerships with churches.

Theological educators in Taiwan could provide more helpful and practical training to the female seminarians by connecting the theories with the female pastors' life stories. This is what this research could offer to theological education, especially for female learners, in Taiwan. Another wonderful part of the research project is the feedback from some interviewees who show their appreciation for having had a chance to share about their experiences. They all appreciated being able to look back on what they have gone through, reflect on the experiences, and realize God's grace and will in their lives through the process of speaking and writing for this research. Although it is not comfortable to recall the bad experiences, they noted that they are grateful for what God has done in their lives.

The Challenges of this Research

One of the challenging parts of doing this qualitative research was to get enough interviewees who were willing to offer their time to work for this research project. The schedules of most female pastors in Taiwan leading a church, either with her husband or a team or alone, are really tight. Most interviewees had to use their spare/personal time to

write down their life stories and experiences in their ministries and to review and approve the English translation. Obviously it took them more energy and time to make this qualitative research happen in English than it would have had it all been in Mandarin. Yet as female pastors in Taiwan, they do understand and value the importance of the qualitative research, and this is why they devoted their time and energies to doing their part for this qualitative research project.

The other challenge for this research project was to adjust the different writing styles of the interviewees and to translate the data appropriately. After all the interviewees were satisfied with the English translation, the next challenge was how to do the data coding. Although the studies of two research methods, the tradition of biography and phenomenological study, were done in chapter 2, it still takes time to consider how to sort, code, analyze, and represent the data properly. There are differences between studying the knowledge of research methods and putting it into practice in the research project.

Research Limitations

Regarding the research limitations in this research project, the first issue is that of language. Since Mandarin is the interviewees' native language (and mine too), there are things in their stories that they express better in Mandarin than I can translate into English.

Another limitation is to present the data to readers who are in a different context. Therefore, there is an introduction about the context of Taiwan and Taiwanese women and theological education in Taiwan in chapter 5 to temper this limitation, although it still exists.

Further Research Directions/ Plans

After completing this research, I recognize that that I could pursue this research in several ways. One way is to include more interviewees, including other tribes in Taiwan, to work with the same questions in this research project and see what kind of data can be collected from them. Another way is to go deeper with some specific topics, such as gender inequality or building up self-identity among female ministers, both of which interviewees experienced in their ministries. Collecting similar data from theological educators in Taiwan and seeing what is on their minds about teaching female seminarians could also be a meaningful research project.

There are many other female pastors who are in different ministries like campus ministries, serving in the hospital as a chaplain, and so on. I imagine that the data from such female clergy would differ from that of the interviewees in this research project. It, too, could be helpful for theological education in Taiwan since these Taiwanese female clergy's experiences could likewise provide abundant teaching resources for theological

educators in teaching female seminarians.

Appendix A

Informed Consent Form

Informed Consent Form

Thank you for being willing to participate in this research project. This Informed Consent Form includes the information about the participation of this research project. Please read this form thoroughly and sign and date both copies of the form at the end if you are comfortable and satisfied with being a participant/interviewee in this research project.

Project Title

Learning from her story – a qualitative research of female pastors life stories as teaching resources of theological education in Taiwan

Principal Investigator:

Yu-Hui Chang (Student of Doctoral Program at Claremont School of Theology)

Statement of Research Project

This research project is to apply a qualitative research study about the life stories of female ministers in Taiwan and see how these women's experiences could offer resources for theological educators to apply in their teachings. The purpose of this research project is to learn from Taiwanese female clergies' experiences and apply them into theological education. The way of collecting data in this research project is to have the participants/interviewees answer the interview questions through personal email responds. The questions they will be asked include the following aspects: the reasons why they went to seminary, their learning experiences in the seminary, their practices of serving as female ministers in local churches and their opinions about theological education after they involved into ministry. The primary data that provided by the participants/interviewees will be read only by Principal Investigator of this research project. The participants/interviewees will be anonymous respondents when the data is presented in the research project. Any name mentioned in the primary data will be presented with fake

name instead of real name in the research project.

The primary data provided by participants/interviewees will be translated from Mandarin to English and collated. The data will be connected and examined from the perspectives of the theories of women's psychology, pedagogy and spiritual formation and the research of theological education for women. Based on the studies and researches, the educational applications to theological education for women in Taiwan will be presented in the research project.

The process of participation in this research project as a participant/interviewee

First, participants/interviewees who are willing to involve into this research project will receive Informed Consent Form with both original English and Mandarin translated versions. After participants/interviewees read and signed Informed Consent Form, the interview questions will be sent to their personal email so they can provide their stories, experiences and thoughts according to the questions. Principal Investigator will translate the primary data from Mandarin to English. After the data is translated, the participants/interviewees will get a copy to make sure their words are translated correctly and properly. The participation duration will be done once participants/interviewees received and satisfied with the translation of primary data.

Foreseeable Risks and Protection Procedure in the Research Project

The foreseeable risks and protection procedure in this research project will be presented in three aspects.

1. The participants/interviewees will be requested to provide their negative experiences or challenges they encountered in their life or ministry in the interview questions. Participants/interviewees have the right to choose what kind of experiences they would like to share. If participants/interviewees encounter the discomfort or emotional overwhelmed while answering the interview questions, they can withdraw at any time by contacting the Principal Investigator. The participants/interviewees are going to answer interview questions with email that allows the participants/interviewees have spaces and time to consider and choose what kind of their personal stories they would like to tell. This is the way to reduce foreseeable risks/discomforts to the minimum regarding to the personal emotional issue.
2. Second foreseeable risk is about the way to secure the primary data from the collecting process. Participants/Interviewees will transmit their data via a secured email address.

To protect the incoming emails, the password of this secured email will be changed daily. The data provided by participants/interviewees will be downloaded and saved in disks with a secured storage so the data will not be stolen or revealed in any way. After the data are downloaded and saved, the emails from the participants/interviewees will be deleted. This way can prevent the primary data be stolen by internet thieves and keep the primary data in a safe and secure place. The disks that saving the primary data will be destroyed once the research project is completed.

3. The last one is related to the way of presenting the data. In order to prevent the unnecessary risk of revealing the privacy information of the participants/interviews as presenting the data, the participants/interviewees will be anonymous in the research project. If there is any name mentioned in the primary data, the Principal Investigator will use fake name to present and declare that these names are fake ones in the research project.

The above mentioned three foreseeable risks and protection procedures will provide a comfortable environment for participants/interviewees to share their stories authentically.

Expected Benefits in the Research Project

There are several expected benefits to the participants/interviewees or others in the research project.

1. Participants/Interviewees will be benefited by providing the primary data

By answering the interview questions, the participants/interviewees are able to look back what they experienced and have a chance to think through those issues that they do not have a chance to re-think on. With connecting their own experiences to the theories of women's psychology, pedagogy and spiritual formation and the research of theological education for women, the participants/interviewees are able to revisit their experiences from different perspectives and be benefited from it.

2. Theological educators in Taiwan will be benefited from this research project

According to my previous researches, there are no qualitative studies, neither in English nor in Chinese, relating the theories of women's psychology, pedagogy, and spiritual formation to theological education in Taiwan. In Taiwan, for those female ministers who graduated from seminary and involved into the ministry by being a full-time pastor in local church do not have chances to go back to seminary and share their experiences to the current female seminarians. This is because either the professors in seminaries or female pastors in the local churches do not try to connect the female pastors'

experiences to theological education. This research project is trying to build up the connections of relating the experiences of life stories of female pastors to theological education. The theological educators in Taiwan will be benefited from this research project and provide more helpful and practical training to the female seminarians by connecting the theories with the female pastors' life stories.

3. Female seminarians in Taiwan will be benefited from this research project

Another people will be benefited from this research project are the currently and future female seminarians. The practical data that provided by the female clergies in Taiwan will offer a greater view for the currently and future female seminarians as they preparing themselves to be clergies in the future. The research project could provide them opportunities to think deeper, view the clergy life from multiple perspectives and prepare them mentally and spiritually before they involve into the ministry.

Statement of Voluntary Nature

Participation in this research is voluntary and persons who consent to participate may choose to conclude their involvement in the project at any point without penalty.

The Number of Participants Involved in the Study

The number of the people will be involved in this research project is 19-24 that includes one principal investigator, three faculty members and 15-20 participants/interviewees who are female clergy in Taiwan.

Contact Information:

If the participants/interviewees have the questions about the research and the research participant's rights, in the event of problems arising as a result of the research, or if they wish to withdraw from the project, the contact information is below:

Principal Investigator: Yu-Hui Chang Email: yu-hui.chang@cst.edu

Faculty advisor of the project: Dr. Frank Rogers Email: frogs@cst.edu

If you are satisfied with your understanding of the information in this document and agree to participate in this research project, please sign and date both copies of the form. By your signature, you document your consent to the participation and the conditions described above.

Participant's name:

(Printed)

(Signature)

(Date)

Researcher's name:

Yu-Hui Chang

(Printed)

(Signature)

(Date)

Appendix B

English Translation of Interviewees' Primary Data

Group 1: Married female pastor and also a Pastor's wife

Interviewee: Bonnie

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: Actually, the reason for me to go to seminary is just because I want to know God more.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: Actually, I did not feel there is any difference between genders when I start to involve into the ministry. However, I need to pay attention on taking care of family after I got a kid. I think that this is the difficulty for being a mother. I feel like I could not catch up with church's ministry. Sometimes, when I am working, I am anxious because of my fear of not taking good care of both ministry and family. Regarding to the advantage, I feel like that everyone prefer to counsel with female ministers and it is easier for me to know the needs of my congregation by talking to them.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: I think that theological education helped me to understand the Bible more and better. Also, I learned how to prepare sermons or lead the small group and so on. These all make me become not only a minister's wife but also a minister.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: After I involved into ministry, I have encountered many people who are having the hard time with their family or mental suffering. I wish I could learn more knowledge about melancholia, divorce, unmarried pregnancy and so on.

5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: Based on my experiences, in addition to train female to be ministers, theological education could also have more classes about how to find the balance between family and ministry and the balance among different identities which are mother, minister's wife and minister.

Interviewee: Tiffany

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: I was youth director in the church when I was in college. I started to realize that what I could provide for these younger sisters and brothers was not enough by spending time with them every week. To face and overcome this problem, I started to ask God open the way for me. More than one time, God spoke to me in many different occasions which are like in the fellowships in both church and school, and sermons on Sundays and ask me to respond His calling boldly and get theological education in the seminary so more of His people could be nurtured spiritually in truth. I said "yes" to God and confirmed the calling when I was senior in college. Because I want to have some working experiences before I go to seminary, I told God that I would go to seminary after two years graduated from college. Therefore, I worked for two years after I graduated from college and went to seminary afterward.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: As a female pastor, I have to say that it is really a challenge to me. It is because that most clergies and elders in Presbyterian churches in Taiwan are still male. I feel that it is not easy since I am the minority among the clergies.

Advantage for female pastors:

As a woman, I am sensitive so people are easy to open up to me. Therefore, it is easy for me to have a heart to heart talk with the congregations.

Disadvantage for female pastors:

I am working in a church which has a senior pastor above me and working with my husband who is a pastor as well. Sometimes, I feel like being ignored, even the congregation looked at me as a pastor's wife. When my position is not clear in the ministry, it is not easy for me to teach or do anything else in the ministry because I have no direction to move on.

Challenges for female pastor:

One of the challenges to me is how to play a role model in many ways. I am a pastor,

but I am also a mother and a wife. It is difficult for me to find a balance among these three roles. My kid is still young so I also hope to have more time to be with her and grow with her. It is also hard for me to find a balance between my family and ministry. I am still trying and finding the solutions.

Difficulties for female pastors:

I am in charge of the outreach ministry in the communities around the church. This ministry needs lots of manpower to get involved but I got few in this ministry. I realized that no matter how big the size of the church is, there are always same group of people work on every ministry in the church. Furthermore, these people are really ambitious and want to do everything. If the pastors of the church do not have any further plan for the ministries, they think that it is not efficient. Because of this situation, I usually must work and deal with the relationship problems among people.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: For me, theological education laid foundations of pastoring a church. One of the most important responsibilities for clergies is to teach the truth. Therefore, I think that we are applying what we learned in the seminary into the ministry. We have to teach the congregation and provide the information to make them understand the knowledge of not only about the Bible but also about the history, culture and so on.

As a female pastor who is ministering a church, the most helpful courses for the ministry I have in the seminary is the classes of Practical Theology and the ones about spiritual caring. The theories in the books cannot apply to all situations in the ministry. I paid more attentions in the courses of Practical Theology which includes Preach, Pastoring Ministry and so on. The most precious part in these classes is the sharing from many pastors about their experiences in the ministries. After involved into the ministry, I also realized that there are needs to have the knowledge about pastoring and counseling. Everyone needs to be cared about their spirituality. Spiritual caring is not only to provide the words in the Bible, but also involved with the skills of counseling and being company in order to help the people in needs.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: As I mentioned before, the courses are limited in seminary regarding to the theological education in Taiwan. I expect that there could be more courses about Practical Theology and have specific curriculum for the churches in different sizes. I also hope that the theological education is able to provide the information of finding solutions

when the clergies found the problems and did not know how to solve them. My suggestion for theological education is to make the courses of Pastoring Caring as a request because it is not required when I studied in the seminary and these courses are really important for ministering a church.

5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: I do not have a specific answer for this question.

Interviewee: Jenny

Questions :

6. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: I got baptized in my high school. However, my faith was not built up until I attended fellowship in the university. Although I was young back to then, I realized that God called me to server Him as a full time clergy. After graduated from university, I spent three years to work in my university and be a supervisor of the fellowship in the meantime. During these three years, I encountered many young people who grew up in church but they took the identity of Christian as a inheritance. I realized the importance of religious education and confirmed that God does not call me to be company with only young people but be with the congregations with different ages. Therefore, after three years working, I went to seminary and pursue my Master of Divinity.

7. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: Although I got ordained as a pastor, I also have another identity, a pastor's wife. Ministering a church with my husband, it is for sure that my husband is the senior pastor and I am an assistant pastor for Christian education. I used to share that female pastors are minority in our culture in some perspectives. However, a female pastor who is also a pastor's wife is the minority of the minority.

I have ministered several churches which include a small size church in the country side and medium churches in the cities. In my ministries, I deeply felt that the expectation of the congregation for me is swinging between the identity of pastor and pastor's wife. Their expectation also influenced my identification to myself. In either church, the congregation all expected me as a pastor's wife. Their expectations for a pastor's wife are like being the pianist, decorating churches with flowers, teaching

in Sunday school, attending the choir and so on. I did all the things I just mentioned and try to be a good pastor's wife. I am not trained to be a pastor's wife and I am still learning. However, I also think of another identity, a female pastor. Of course, I am looking forward to also learn about preach, hosting the communion and leading the meeting. Sometimes, it is the congregations, not my husband, do not want to give me the chance to learn because they think that these things need to be done by a pastor, not a pastor's wife.

One of my impressive experiences is that my husband went to a different church to preach on Sunday so I stayed in my church and preached. After Sunday service, many female congregations did not leave the church because they were waiting to see my husband. It seems like they have to see "the pastor" in order to feel like they attend the Sunday service. This is an interesting phenomenon but it also influenced my ministry. I am used to let my husband to stand out for everything because I do see the weakness of many congregations is that they are expecting they got prayed by a male pastor in service at home, wedding or funeral. I have to commit that if the congregation can have an option, they prefer to have a male pastor to minister them. It was a female pastor preached in my husband's ordination ceremony. My mother-in-law even told me that: "Why it is a female pastor preached in my son's ordination ceremony?" She did not realize that her daughter-in-law is also a female pastor.

Because the expectation of the congregation and the needs of taking care of my two little children, I do not have to put lots of energies in my ministry, even though I am a pastor for my church. The two experiences I am going to share remind me that I have to keep learning and being trained as a pastor.

1. In my church, there is an elder's wife who is highly educated. She got retired from a very good job. I had a chance to be in charge in whole service because it was a Sunday for honoring women. In my sermon, I talked about that women have to get train and use their spiritual gifts in the churches, just like Jesus to be companies to everyone. In the service, I allow my husband to take over the announcement and benediction because I always think that I have to let the congregation to see the pastor. However, the elder's wife came to me with her anger. She asked me that why I let a male pastor take over the announcement and benediction. This is conflict to my sermon because I encouraged women to serve God with our gifts and let the male pastor take over at the end.

To facing her anger and answering questions, I explained that the reason I did so is for those sisters and brothers who want to see the pastor on Sundays. The elder's wife

shared her opinions to me: the congregations have seen the male pastor all the time. Since it is a Sunday of honoring women I, the female pastor, can let them know that female pastor can complete the Sunday service by themselves and educating the congregations that to accept the service from a female pastor. I think that it is because she received the education from western country and attended many women movements, she is very sensitive and aggressive in this gender equality issues.

I appreciated her opinions because this reminds me that I do not have to accept and fulfill the expectation of the congregation fully. I need to reflect and discriminate the context and educate brothers and sisters when there is a chance so female pastors can have equal position as male ones.

2. Another experience is that there was an ongoing funeral in my church and another old person passed away during that time. Because my husband was occupied by the ongoing funeral, I was asked to take care of this incident. I was really nervous then because I had no experience about this and have no idea about the procedure and other things. The worse situation was that I could not ask my husband, either, because he was busy in the funeral. Although I was ordained for three years, I realized that I do not have many hands-on experiences than un-ordained evangelist. I found a chance to call my friends I met in seminary who is pastoring a church by herself. She told me what to do and pay attention to and pray for me in the phone. After hung up the phone, I put on my pastor's garb and went to the family whose just lost their beloved elder. Because not everyone in that family is Christian so they were fearful and concerning about some taboo. I grabbed the chance and taught the ideas about the hope of resurrection in Christian faith and prayed for them.

This experience made me learned that my congregations sometimes did not realize that I am also a pastor until I put on my pastor's garb. The families were comforted spiritually and mentally because there was a pastor with them. I do not think that the position of pastor is higher than the position of a pastor's wife. In my opinion, I think that I have to grab every chance to learn and grow in order to prepare myself to be a pastor and answering God's calling faithfully. I have to remember that I am a pastor, not only when I put on my pastor's garb.

8. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: I think my learning for three years in the seminary is mainly to help me think and reflect Christian faith systematically and studied more in understanding and interpreting the Scriptures. However, I believed that theological education does not only happen in

the seminary. Theological education also happened when I went to Sunday school, attended Sunday services and fellowship. It had been in my life. I think that, for me, learning in the seminary is to get trained completely and systematically.

Because I came from a spiritual background, I was having great impact when I went a Presbyterian seminary. However, this woke me up from the specific Christian faith concepts by learning and understanding the history, Theological emphasis and context of different denominations. I also realized that there is not only one way to have spiritual growth. It helps me greatly in my relationship with God.

Theological education is also playing a very important role in my ministries. I am a pastor so I am also a theological educator. I need continuing to be trained after I am involved into the ministries. The three years learning in the seminary is not enough for me. I have to find many chances to share with other pastors and receive their experiences. I also have to attend different kinds of theological seminars in order to prepare myself to face different issues in the society. I know that I am limited and I cannot fulfill all the needs of the congregations. I also deeply know that the only way to keep serving God is to encounter God by keeping learning in theological education. The theological education in Presbyterian churches emphasized reflection and discrimination. I think that theological education provided me an environment to know God sincerely, learn how to discriminate from all kinds of theological assertions and be responsible for our own discriminations. To clarify the theological position and experience how true God is in many issues. For me, theological education is not only a serious academic work or an ongoing education but also a great help in personal spirituality, the mentality and practices in my ministries. It is hard to say that which part helped me the most. It helps me in many aspects.

9. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: Christianity is not a main religion in Taiwan. Many local cultures from other religions have been obstacles in evangelical ministries. To solve the conflict between culture and Christian faith, we have to learn more about the history, development and meanings of local culture and interpret the Scriptures into this context. I am expecting that theological education could help me how to have a dialogue with the Taiwanese local culture and understand more about how the culture influence the lives of Christians and non-Christians. I looking forward that theological education could assist me to have the concepts of building up a new culture which has theological foundation when I and my congregations are trying to “do” the contextual theology.

I hope to see this kind of new culture could be a new Christian culture that has the characters of local culture with theological reflection and fits into Christian faith.

For example, when I talk to the couple who are going to get married, I always ask the bride's family to refuse to get the money from the groom's family if they can. This is because, in Taiwanese local culture, elders pay more attention on male than female. The money is given by the groom's family is representing that they are buying the bride from her family. It twisted the meaning of marriage when the bride's families think that this is a chance to make a big money. I allowed some couples to go through the process because I think I need to learn more about this issue and be able to explain my concerns with Biblical foundation. I cannot have my congregations to cancel this part until I completely understand the meaning of giving money to bride's family. I think that this is what I need help from theological education.

10. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: In my opinion, I think that it does not represent all aspects of female pastors in the theological education. The female clergy could be single, married whose spouse is a lay person, and married whose spouse is also clergy. I have tried to identify myself and find the direction in my ministry by myself. I hope that there can be more and more sharing from female clergy who has different characters, ministries and experiences and help more female clergy to be woken up from the expectations of the society and churches and find their own identification and ways!

Interviewee: Wendy

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: I have worked for ten years before I went to seminary. After working for ten years, I realized that I lacked theological training in my carrier. This is the reason that motivated me to study in the seminary. My major in college was social work. After I graduated from college, I kept studying in the master program in the same seminary and prepared myself to be a female pastor because of my experiences in field education, fellowships and other mission trips.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: Good and bad experiences: I sometime need helps from others. However, because of this, there are more opportunities for me to interact with other people.

Advantages and disadvantages: Because of my gender, it is easier for me to show my cares to the congregations and have physical touch for increasing the trust and improving the relationships with others. When I talk to the congregations, they are more open to female pastors and willing to share. However, when I need to work alone with other male, I need to pay attention on the languages, boundary, and body movements to prevent the unnecessary misunderstandings.

Challenges and difficulties: Not everything in my ministries is gender-equal, especially in the organizations. My husband and I are ministering in the same church. When we attend the presbyteries meetings, I can feel the gender inequality in the presbyteries.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: There is difference and distance between theological education and real situations in the ministries. In my opinions, I think that there are only few years for nurturing seminarians with theological education in the seminary and theological education is following the teachings of the professors and the reading of the books.

In facing the real situations in the ministries, there are many factors difference between ministering a church in big cities or country sides. The needs for different churches are different and the spirit and attitudes of the congregations are also diverse. What we learned in the seminary is limited. We need to continuing learning after we got involved into the ministry and extend what we read or learn according to the needs in our ministries. It is necessary to have theological professional knowledge such as the history of theology, the deep thoughts of systematic theology and so on. It helps practically from the teachings of professors in the seminary.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: To have a systematic theological education is a very important learning process in nurturing a minister. After having theological education, the ministers could know what they lacking or missing any part of theological education when they are involved into ministries. They can enhance their weakness according to the needs in their ministries from continuing education in the seminary. The learning attitudes of the experienced ministers will be different from being seminarians who were inexperienced in the continuing education in the seminary.

5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: What I received from the seminary I used to study is appropriate and fits my needs. I do not think that there is anything needs to be improved for focusing on the gender issues.

Group 2: Married Indigenous female pastor (minister a church alone)

Interviewee: Lynn

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: I attended a winter retreat when I was 18. In the second evening meeting in the retreat, the speaker had a calling for those who were willing to dedicate themselves and the speaker wanted to pray for these people. Although I did not really understand what does this mean, but I prayed and dedicated myself because I was so touched in that meeting.

I did not go to seminary until nine years later because I had been searching the goal of my life. I finally found that it is my deepest longing in my heart to serve God with my life. Therefore, I went to seminary.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: First of all, I have to say that I am really thankful to become a female pastor. This is very honor to me. It is also the best thing in my life. I am very proud to be a female pastor. In my opinion, I think that it is a female pastor's privilege to nurture congregations as a mother. To lead a church with mother characters which are like feeding, nurturing, educating, supporting, sacrificing, protective and so on is something that male clergies cannot do.

But it is also because I was too into these mother characters and always do everything by myself, it makes me really exhausted.

For example, my husband is also a minister who is pastoring another church. After Sunday service, he is invited to have lunch together by different elders on Sundays. However, this is not my case. In the church I am pastoring, when the Sunday service is done, everything is done. One Sunday, one elder's wife invited me to have lunch together after Sunday service. During the lunch, the elder asked me that why I did

not have my husband come to join this lunch meeting with me. I answered him that because he always got invited to have lunch together by different elders in his church. Then, the elder told me: “My wife cooks every meal for me. She always has lunch ready when I come back from church on Sundays. You also need to do so.” I felt offended and thought that I, who is your pastor, does not get invited for lunch on Sundays, like my husband does. Furthermore, you even asked me to prepare the meal for my husband?!

I do not care about if I get a free lunch or not. I just feel that it is so unequal since both my husband and I are ministering a church alone and have to preach on Sundays, however, I got more requests than my husband from the elder in my church.

I thought that it is just my case but, later on, I found out that there are some female pastors are having same experiences.

The disadvantage of female pastors:

1. Both my husband and I are doing same work, however, female clergies are asked to do extra things which are expected that need to be done by women. For example: preparing meals, housekeeping, and so on. Our husbands cannot be seen doing housekeeping by the congregation; otherwise, we will be thought that we do not take good care of our families. Therefore, I think that to be a female pastor means to be a superwoman.
 2. I was called “pastor’s wife” instead of “Pastor.” However, the congregation will not call my husband as “pastor’s husband.” Although I did some teachings to my congregation, but they just cannot help it and call me “pastor’s wife” without thinking. They even asked me that when my husband will be ordained because they want me to be ordained later than my husband in the committee meeting. It is my blessing that the pastor who is the moderator of the meeting explain everything to the elders for me. Therefore, I got ordained earlier than my husband.
 3. My position or status cannot be higher than my husband. In my case, I got ordained earlier than my husband. Some elders in my church thought that it is shameful because I got ordained earlier.
3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?
- A: The thing that influenced me the most in the theological education is that I learned how to think things or issues from different perspectives. For instance: my sense of personal identification as aborigines of Taiwan.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?
- A: It would be helpful if there could be more courses about knowing ourselves in the seminary. Actually, there are many good classes regarding nurturing and training the future ministers in the program of Master of Divinity. However, it lacks of the courses about nurturing or training female to become a pastor and for the female clergies to apply in their ministries. For instance, I learned more about female issues in the classes when I was in the college. I also remembered that those female issues related courses (not religion related) I took outside of seminary gave me great impacts. Therefore, it would be helpful if there are more courses about “female” issues in the seminary. These courses do not have to be religion-related but just focus on female issues. These courses also could be simply to look at female issues from different perspectives and discuss about the role or characters that the female can play or have.
5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?
- A: When I studied my M. Div. program in the seminary, I did not really think there is a need to know about the female issues. Also, there were some people emphasized about female issues with radical opinions. I did not realize the importance until I got involved into ministry. There are much more problems than I could imagine. When I look back the past years in my ministry, most lay people in the church respect the ministers greatly. However, this is not the story for the elders. I think that the congregations, including elders, deacons and lay people, have to hold same attitude to both male and female pastors. It is our, the pastors’, responsibility to express this message. However, it is also important that the female clergies can get prepared in the seminary, before they get involved into ministry. Just like I mentioned in the last question, it would be good for the female seminarians if there are courses about know themselves. These courses cannot be only taught in the program of Christian Counseling in the seminary. Furthermore, the courses about female issues could pay attention on recognizing the female identification and have more discussion about it. It would be helpful for the female clergies and receive the supports from others.
- I feel like it is hard for me to answer the fifth question. I would talk about it from my experiences at this moment. I think that the teachings and training in the seminary is not personal enough. It would help a lot for nurturing and training future clergies to

have a personal spiritual director individually. In my opinion, I think that this way could help the seminarians to see what they are missing. Sometimes I feel like it is hard for seminary to have this kind of education for female seminarians due to lack of good and proper spiritual directors.

For the issues of female, my opinion would be it is impossible to talk about female issues without relating to male ones. This is what I experienced in my marriage. I learned that God makes the person be completed through the marriage.

As a female pastor, I experienced God's love to me through my marriage and my children. This made me, the imperfect person, the impact pastor, be able to accept myself and put my focus on God so I can love the people around me and the people in the church.

I am grateful to have this opportunity to share what I have experienced in this research. Although I felt uncomfortable by thinking of those unpleasant experiences, but God has helped me to face it, learn from it and redefine myself.

It is not easy to be a pastor, but it has been my honor to be a minister.

I thank God for calling me and having me be a female pastor.

Interviewee: Isabella

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: I went to seminary after I worked in a non-profit organization which is mainly doing social work. I actually did dual masters in the seminary. I started with the master (M.A.) of art which concentration is in Christian care and counseling and then I started the master of divinity (M. Div.) one year later. The reason I decided to study M.Div. is because I wanted to have a break from doing my M.A.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: Advantage:

The church I am pastoring is nearby my home village. Therefore, I am familiar with the culture in the local village. I am single and young, especially I am female, so I could get close to people easily.

Disadvantage:

Most of the adult congregation people are the elders in my family. In addition, the main congregations in my church are elders and children so it is not easy to build up a team work for ministry. I am still young to them so it is not easy for them to fully trust me.

- The main language which is popular in my village is Bunun, however, I am not very fluent in Bunun and this also disadvantage me form my ministry.
3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?
- A: Theological education helped me to understand the conflicts between my congregation people and their expectation from the perspectives of empathy and kindness. The education and training I received from M.A. in Christian care and counseling assisted me to communicate and interact with people. However, in my opinion, I think that the foundation for me to involve into ministry is my daily devotional time which includes reading Bible and doing spiritual practice which is like meditation.
4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?
- A: I expect that theological education could provide me the ways to interpret the Scriptures and sharing the experiences (including ministering a church) from senior pastors.
5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?
- A: It would be better to provide more about female perspectives and experiences in theological education.

Interviewee: Kirsten

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?
- A: I always want to serve God as a full time minister. In a youth retreat, the speaker/pastor in an evening asked if there is anyone who wants to serve God as a full time clergy and I responded that calling. Afterward, I learned about what kind of training and preparation that a minister needs to have and enrolled the seminary.
2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)
- A: Since I am female, the elders and deacons are more understanding and considerate about my needs in the ministry. I feel like the advantage of female clergies is that female ministers are able to minister a church with female characters and not make the elders and deacons feel stressful. My most challenging thing in the ministries is that most elders and deacons in the church are older than me so they always think that my experiences are not enough.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?
A: Theological education enlarged my understandings of the Bible and made me not only just read the scriptures but also get to know the background and contexts of the Bible and think more and deeper. The field of practical theology helped me the most, especially in analyzing the sermon. It taught me how to prepare the sermon and preach.
4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?
A: To me, the theological education is more than learning from the Bible. It would be wonderful if theological education could provide the practical trainings which like how to have and build up a new church, how to develop the outreach ministries in the communities, how to have a one by one evangelical conversation and so on. I realized the needs after I got involved into the ministries. I think that it would be much better and helpful for my ministry if I could be trained in the seminary.
5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?
A: In my opinion, I think that theological education is pretty much set for the most needs of the ministers. Although there are courses about feminist theology, they are more toward to academic trainings. I am looking forward to have some practical courses which like how to work with male clergies and colleagues.

Interviewee: Holly

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?
A: Long time ago, someone asked me: “Do you want to go to seminary?” For no reason, I hated this idea, so I always said: “No way!” or “I will never do it even if you kill me.” Later on, I got an invitation from a friend who went to study at Conservative Baptist Seminary. She invited me to go to her graduation. In that ceremony, all the graduating students walked into the chapel one by one. By seeing her wearing the mortarboard cap and gown and walking into the chapel, suddenly, one prayer just came to my mind: “Dear Lord, I hope that there will be lots of people come and join my graduation.” I was really shocked by this prayer from myself, and I persuaded myself that it is just because I was so touched by the atmosphere at that moment.

However, this idea started to keep coming back to my mind since that day. I do not think that going to seminary would help a lot for me to serve the Lord. I am not even ambitious to do something really great for God so I have to go to seminary. Honestly speaking, I have no idea why I have to go to seminary. Since the idea, going to seminary, kept coming back to my mind, I spent two years and prayed about it because I do not want to make this decision just out of my feelings.

In those two years, I am more and more clear about going to seminary. My prayers were answered. There were many people, that included the people I do not know or I had not contacted them for a while, asked me if I want to go to seminary. I asked them why they encouraged me to go to seminary; their answers are all the same: "I think that you are the one who should do it."

I also asked three confirmations for this decision. I am sorry for forgetting the first two confirmations, but I remembered the third one which was also an important one and encouraged me to move forward.

My mother is the one who never wants me to be a pastor because she thought that to be a pastor is to live in a harsh situation with low pay. In her mind, going to seminary is same with going to be pastors (no matter which program we enrolled). I had a good job with good salary at that time and this helped a lot on my family financially. If I go to seminary, it will have a great impact financially for my family. I prayed to God that I will go to seminary if my mother allowed and supported me. I thought that my mother would stop me or ask me to reconsider about it. Surprisingly, she said yes with a joyful heart and encouraged and supported me mentally and financially until I completed my college majored in Church Music.

At my senior year of college, there were many people started to ask me: "Do you want to study further and apply the program of Master of Divinity(M. Div.)?" I used to think that I could serve the Lord with my music skills after I graduated from college program in seminary. I never thought about being a pastor and preach God's words. I never forced myself to think this way, and of course, I would not pray about it, either. However, my roommate told me: "Don't you think that you have to pray about it since there had been so many people asked you about it?"

Because of my roommate's words, I started to pray. I remembered that I was praying to God when I was riding my motorcycle and wearing the helmet on my head. I said to God: "Dear Lord, if this is your will and calling, I would do it. I will have my application ready and submit it. If I do not make it, please do not ask me to do it again since I already tried."

Because this was not voluntary, I did not do it seriously. However, I got the admission from the seminary. I know that it is the calling from God so I enrolled, studied and prepared myself to be a pastor who preaches God's words.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: The church I used to minister is in the country side which is simple and really conservative. Regardless the issues of genders, the first difficulty and challenge I encountered are language and different culture.

I grew up in Taipei which is the capital city. Although my mother is aborigine and speaks our own language from time to time, but the people around me were mostly belong to Han tribe, not any other tribes of aborigines. Therefore, I used to speak Mandarin and Taiwanese. I rarely spoke my own language.

However, when I pastored the church in the country side, the first question congregation asked me is: "Do you speak our own language?" It is really bizarre that they do not request their offspring speak our own language, but me who is the pastor of the church. In order to get close to the congregation, I worked really hard and learned how to speak our own language.

The density of the churches in my parish is relatively high which means there are many churches around the church I ministered. Within 1,000 feet, there is a True Jesus Church nearby my church, a Presbyterian Church. The congregations in two churches are familiar with each other, even some of them are relatives. Therefore, whenever there is a person in either church passed away, the funeral has become a competition. How? It is because of language issue. The congregations in two churches are either friends or relatives so they are invited to the funeral. If I, the pastor of the Presbyterian church, preached in our own language (actually I should preach in both our own language and Mandarin since there are some young people can only understand Mandarin), the congregation of True Jesus Church will say good words, which could be: "Your pastor is excellent. She can speak our own language in such a young age" and so on, to my congregation. The congregation in my church will be proud of me.

Another thing for me to adjust is life style. I used to live in Taipei which has many fun places, even during the night time the life there is very convenience. The life in the country side where my church is now is very different from Taipei. It takes me five minutes to drive from church to country side downtown. The options in the stores are limited. The country side downtown becomes really quiet after 8 pm every night. I

lived in the dormitory which is provided by my church is surrounded by rice farms and roads. After the sky turns to dark, I could only hear the sounds of insects and cars. My dormitory is not close to the neighbor's either. By facing this kind of environment, I have to concern about the safety issue, especially before I got married.

I need to adjust greatly in order to fit into the life style in the country side. However, my congregations do not concern about this. They think that I have to live in the same way as they do; therefore, I learned that the concept of empathy does not exist in their mind.

In my opinion, I think that female pastor has a great advantage which is our gender. How come? Different from male pastors, if we (female pastors) could use appropriate tone and volume, many conflicts could be solved. Furthermore, the ways that women think are different from men's. In addition to consider about how to make the ministry be successful, we also concern about the factors of relationships among people, the feelings of people and the arrangement of manpower.

In addition, one of the important "weapon" or "power" of women is gentle. This kind of gentle could be very firm. To compare with male, the gentle that female represents could also make the things happen. To speak with a gentle tone could make the people who are working with you become calm and want to listen to you. It could also solve the conflicts between people and make people can think things calmly and analyze things clearly. The elders in my church are much older than me so they would treat me as their daughter if my attitude is gentle. Sometimes, when I do not hold the position of pastor but speak to my elders with a soft tone helped me to improve the situation between me and these elders.

One of advantage for female pastors is that we are easier to get close with female congregations. They are willing to share their private issues with me, especially the conflicts or problems in their marriage.

Because of the gender differences, it is inconvenient for me to face those male congregations who are about my age and single. They are shy to share their things to me and I also hesitated to ask them more. Therefore, after I got married, although my husband is working in Taipei, whenever he was on vacation and came to visit me, I always asked his help to talk to those male congregations.

In Taipei, most church's congregations understand that the formal dress for female ministers can be either skirt suits or pants suits. When I preached in my church, I wore the pants suits and was criticized by my congregation. They think that a female minister has to wear skirt suits, not pants one. In order to fit into my congregations'

idea, I can only wear skirt suits to preach.

The pastor who ministers a church in a country side has to be multitasking. This is the concepts of elders and congregations in my church. They think a pastor has to be able to do all kinds of things which are like: administration, spiritual nurturing, visiting and caring about the congregations. The pastor also needs to watch over the property of the church and know where the things are when they need them. In addition, I also have to check everything of the church and make a list of them. If I want to do outreach ministries on different days other than special days which are like mother's day, father's day, thanksgiving, Christmas, I have to do it "no budget", almost without spending money. If the ministry which is asserted by me, the elders and deacons would say to me that if the expenses of this ministry run out of budget, they would pay the extra expenses from my salary. It is a dilemma to me since I have to do my ministry without spending too much money. Is this because of that the church does not have much money? No! Every year, the balance of my church's bank account is more than 30 thousand US dollars.

In my opinion, I think that the expectation of female pastors from my congregation is higher than male ones. This is because they think that it is fine to be masculine, aggressive and it is ok to have conflicts with others sometimes for a male pastor. However, the congregation's stereotype for female is that women need to be gentle and nice. They think that this also apply to female pastors. Therefore, they expect female pastors can do things in a sharp way, like male pastors, and be gentle and nice at the same time. I need to be careful about this, otherwise it will cause the tension between me and the congregations.

Another issue for female pastors is children. I got married during the years I ministered this countryside church. My husband works in Taipei which is in the north part of Taiwan and I ministered this church in the eastern side. He came over to help me whenever he got a chance. It is no problem when we did not have children. However, the situation is different after we got our first son. Who is going to take care of the baby? My husband works almost every day so he cannot take good care of the baby. Although my time is more flexible, it is also difficult for me to ministering a church and taking care of the baby alone. What if my baby is hungry when I am preaching? What if my baby got sick on Sunday? How to take care of my baby when someone of my congregation died and I need to take care of the whole process until the funeral? Some people's houses are not easy to reach. It has to go through some narrow winding trails. How can I take my son there by riding a

motorcycle, especially when there is a service at their houses in a raining evening? These questions keep coming back to my mind. After concerning all the situations and praying, I decided to stop my ministry of this church and moved back to Taipei to live with my husband. It is an impact for our finances without my income, especially living in Taipei where the living expenses are higher than any other places in Taiwan. However, I want to cherish the time to stay with my son because I think that I will have lots of chances to be involved into the ministries but I will not have the second chance to get involved to my son's growing process. In addition, I could rest and review what had happened in my ministry so I could get ready for my next ministry.

For me, it looks like it is a disadvantage to have a parental leave. However, the loss is only in material aspect, I received more spiritually and mentally. I think that this is God's great gift to me.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: It is hard for me to talk about "which part" of the theological education has benefitted me the most. I think that I am influenced in all ways by theological education.

I am from Presbyterian background, and I am also influenced by the spiritual movements. The pastors who are deeply involved into spiritual movements taught me that I do not say the passive or negative words which are like: I am sick, I am so poor, I am so bad luck and so on. These pastors also taught me many things like: do not "accuse others" when praying, lift up our hands to show our obedience when we sing praises to God, when pastors lay their hands on you and pray for you, you have to lie down to show that you are fulfilled by holy spirit, do not go to seminary because there is the spirit of religion in the seminary, clap to welcome holy spirit and glorify God when worship, do not watch the programs other than news, do not listen to popular music but only listen to the hymns, it is very important to have spiritual gifts so we need to pursue them really hard which are like see the visions, prophecy over people and so on...

After I studied in the seminary for seven years (four years for my B.A. and three years for my M. Div.), I realized that what I learned before had made me not be free. I cannot even express the true self to God in my prayers because I can only say things positively and bless those I do not like or piss me off in order not to be cursed. The professors in the seminary taught me that even King David express his true self in front to God so he said so many curses in his prayers. I realized that I have to come to God with my true self but not hiding anything. I do not have to numb myself with those

positive words. I can be honest to God and be myself in front of Him. I got released since then.

I used to think that the calling from God is to serve Him as a full time minister. I learned that everyone has his/her own calling in seminary. John Calvin said that the calling for everyone is to glorify God so we have to glorify God at school, in family and at work. This is the most important calling for us from God. To glorify God is not only in the moments of clapping when worshipping, sickness got healed, life be changed and casted away the demons. To glorify God is to do it with every single moment of our lives.

To Christians, we cannot only concern about our religious behaviors. We also need to care about the social issues and put it into actions. We cannot only concerns about the life “above.” When there is something unjust happened in our society, some people are treated unfairly, it is Christians’ obligation to rebuke the injustice and speak for the weakness and poor. If Christians cannot do it, how can we expect: “may Your will be down on earth as it is in heaven?”

When I looked back to my learning from the spiritual movements, the pastors told us to pursue the spiritual gifts. However, what I realized in theological education (including both the courses in the seminary and field education), I found that the most important thing for Christians to pursue is not spiritual gifts but love. I saw the professors in the seminary raised their hands when they were singing and so involving into the hymns. They did not pray emotionally and with loud voice. Their behaviors express their love and cares to students. I saw “Jesus” in their humble attitudes. In the churches of my field education, many elders do not have so called “spiritual experiences” and cannot speak in tongue, either. However, I saw “Jesus” in their loving and modest characters.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: For me, it could be the knowledge and skills of consoling. This does not mean the shallow knowledge but it is to a level of be able to teach other. It is very important to have the ability of consoling in church settings. The congregations might not be willing to talk to the professional counselors but they are open to talk to the pastors in their churches. If the pastors are lack of this kind of training, it would cause some serious results which are like to make the congregation into the dilemma or cannot trust the pastors because they are lacking of the concepts of empathy. Therefore, I think that it is very important to have the professional knowledge/training of consoling for

pastors.

5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: According to my experiences, it is still men-center regarding to the theological education. The views of reading the Scriptures and historical events are also from male points of view. I think it would be helpful to have the views of women and look at things from female perspectives.

In addition, the context and difficulties for women are different from men's. In addition to male pastors, it can also invite female pastors to share the experiences to the seminarians in the seminary. Besides share their experiences in the ministries, the female pastors can also share how they find balance between their ministry and family. They can also share if their spouse is lay people, not a full-time clergy. It would be great help for the future female pastors.

Group 3: Single female pastor

Interviewee: Yolanda

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: 1. Deeply attracted by God: I am the first person got baptized in my family. Grown up from a family filled conflicts, I always expect that I can be loved and accepted and living in a secure life. I realized that there is nothing can bring the harmony to the whole human beings after I had searched for a long time. I tried to kill myself in order to be released from the pain because I lost the meaning and the hope of life due to serious things had happened in my life. In my senior year of the university, God amazingly used my classmates and advisor and let me have the chance to know God, the creator of the world. I finally found that the love and hope I have been looking for in my whole life are in Jesus Christ. This is the starting point of my reborn. It is also because of this inner strength I received from God which encourages me to face the challenges in my life and prepare myself to get involved into the society and try to find a job and the value of my life. I finally learned that I am God's loved creature. I will find disappointment from the value of human beings, but I am precious in God's eyes and deeply loved by Him.

2. Received the calling from God clearly: After I graduated from the university and got baptized, I was about starting to get a job and start my carrier. My mother church was looking for an assistant to help the administration of the church. The pastor came to me and invited me to apply what I have learned into the ministry. This is a very serious invitation. The pastor and his wife prayed with me and remind me to get the permission of my parents. Because my families are from folk religious background, it was hard for them to imagine that I work in a church. They expected me to find a job in government or financial related so I can be financial worry free in the future. However, God's will is higher than mine. After I had a discussion with my mother, I decided to take this offer and work in the church. It was an amazing experience to work in a church by attending the youth fellowship, young adult fellowship, choir, worship team and teaching in Sunday school. In these three years, I got to know what a pastor's life looks like is. I am also prepared as a disciple. I also received the vision of home on the earth and the mission from God through involving the ministry in the church. There was a conference host by my church and the speaker invited all congregations to search the mission and task of serving God at the home of the earth. The speaker encouraged us that God will teach us by Himself. In my prayers, I heard a voice said "feed my sheep" for three times. At the end, the speaker asked us to tell what we received in our prayers to a pastor who we can trust. I shared what I experienced to my pastor. The pastor told me that God is going to use me, but we need to pray more in order to know that how God is going to use me in the future. Because of this experience, I started to search God's calling for me. After seven years search and lots of confirmation, I knew God had called me to serve Him as a full time minister because God had prepared me in many ways and trained me through the difficulties in order to "feed His sheep."
2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)
- A: I am the first Christian and single female minister in my family, and the accusation I have to myself is I am not from Christian background. This is because, whenever I went to the meetings or events, I used to be asked questions like: which church are you from? Who is your father? What activities or events are you ever involved in presbyteries and general assembly of Presbyterian Church. The questions like, "which church are you from?" or "Who baptized you?" is easy for me to answer. When people heard that I am the first Christian in my family, their replies are "Oh!" or "Good for you!" In the meantime, if there are other friends or

ministers talked about their Christian background, I felt like I am involved the ministry alone. I also felt left out and lonely because I see other ministers have more support from people praying for them since they come from multi-generation Christian families. They can find proper people to ask for help when they have problems in their ministries, but I do not have anyone to ask from.

The most challenging part for me is that I have no idea who I could ask for help when I have problems in my ministry. The professors in the seminary told us, before we get involved into ministries; we have to have support group that all the group members could pray with each other and be spiritual support for one another. However, it is not easy for me because I do not want to bother others since everyone might have their own problems in their ministries. How can I share my problems in the ministries to others when everyone has their own ones? In addition, many experienced ministers also advise us that not to share our problems within others because “bad news go fast.” Some rumors might be spread out through intercessors and the worst thing is the rumors go around and heard by the elders and deacons in our own churches. This makes the situation even worse and cause more problems. One more thing from the experienced ministers’ advice is “do not make friends with the elders and deacons in your church”. They asserted that ministers need to teach the elders and deacons and these elders and deacons all look up to the ministers and think that the ministers are the leaders. Therefore, we cannot discuss our problems in the ministries with the elders and deacons in our own churches. After I received all the advice, I felt so alone. My classmates in the seminary got involved into their ministries after graduated and they all have their own contexts in their ministries. I did not find anyone among the ministers in the presbyteries could be my spiritual supporters and, based on the advice from the experienced ministers, I cannot make friends with the elders and deacons in my church, either. When I worked in the church as an assistant, I can ask everyone in the youth fellowship, worship team, Sunday school teachers or choir members to pray for me and my life. It is so different from being a minister and an assistant. When I got involved into my ministry as a female minister, I felt so lonely because I am high up here by myself. In particular, because I am a single female minister, I have to watch out my outfit. I cannot wear the clothes that make me look young and fashion because it might become a sexual hint for the male congregations. I also need to be careful about the temptations and problems in the romantic relationships. By facing all these situations, I started to doubt my calling and think that I might misunderstand about God’s calling

for me. How come my heart become so narrow and I am not as free as before, as joyful as before after I become a full time clergy?

I have ministered two churches and encountered different difficulties in these two ministries. When I really do not know how to face the hardship, I finally found that God is always waiting for me to ask for help and receive the strength from Him. In the first church I ministered, I have no clue how to deal with the elders and deacons in the church. In the second church in my ministries, I did not know how to work with a team. When I was in great disappointment and did not know how to keep serving God, He showed me these scriptures to encourage me:

“Who will bring any charge against God’s elect? It is God who justifies. (Romans 8: 33, NIV)

I am the Lord, I have called you in righteousness, I have taken you by the hand and kept you; I have given you as a covenant to the people, a light to the nations. (Isaiah 42:6, NIV)

He was oppressed, and he was afflicted, yet he did not open his mouth; like a lamb that is led to the slaughter, and like a sheep that before its shearers is silent, so he did not open his mouth. (Isaiah 53:7, NIV)”

After experiencing all the disappointments and helpless in my ministries, I finally found that what I can do is to call on God and cry out loud to Him.

In these painful experiences, I just realized that what I am facing is to build up my value in God’s eyes. I have God in my background and He is my strength and my value. I do not need to look for people’s affirmations or the value of my ministry. God is my spiritual supporter and Jesus Christ is my spiritual director. I found great disappointment when I try to earn people’s affirmations. However, when I turn my eyes upon God and Jesus who love me so much, I found the great blessings in Jesus, my only hope. “But those who look into the perfect law, the law of liberty, and persevere, being not hearers who forget but doers who act—they will be blessed in their doing.” (James 1:25, NIV) God’s affirmation is far beyond human beings’. When I look up to God, and believe that God is faithful and will guide me through the wild. This is a very important journey of faith to me. My painful experiences that made me capture a glimpse of Disciple Paul’s difficulties in his ministry. “More than that, I regard everything as loss because of the surpassing value of knowing Christ Jesus my Lord.

For his sake I have suffered the loss of all things, and I regard them as rubbish, in order that I may gain Christ and be found in him, not having a righteousness of my own that comes from the law, but one that comes through faith in Christ,[e] the righteousness from God based on faith. I want to know Christ[f] and the power of his resurrection and the sharing of his sufferings by becoming like him in his death, if somehow I may attain the resurrection from the dead.” (Philippians 3:8-11, NIV) I can boldly declare the true life in Jesus Christ now!

This year (2014) is the fifth year I have involved into ministry. I am starting to realize that God “must increase, but I must decrease” and learn how to let my “old me” die and rely on the Lord who is the victor. I finally learned the pain that I have experienced is to testify Jesus who sacrifices His life for us. Jesus will point out God’s path and make us live in Him in order to let God’s will be done. To feed the sheep according to their characters, have them to be able to receive the great commission of Lord Jesus and “go into all the world and proclaim the good news” of God salvation.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: 1. The aspect of spirituality: Theological education is the foundation of spiritual life.

We could learn God, Jesus and Holy Spirit through gaining the knowledge of the thoughts of the theologians from the five dimensions: The theology of history, old testaments, and new testaments, Systematic Theology and practical theology. The mystery experiences described by these theologians provide us more scopes of knowing God. We are able build up our understandings to God through philosophical thinking, observing the society and knowing our true selves. We are also able to go beyond our rationality and emotion and step into the area of spirituality. We could value our real relationship with God and allow God work on us so we could have His image inside of us. We could have God’s words speak to us and nurture our spiritual life through daily Bible reading and devotional time. Therefore, we could have the habits that to make decisions and value everything in our life with God’s guidance and standard. This is just like what Paul said: “Not that I have already obtained all this, or have already arrived at my goal, but I press on to take hold of that for which Christ Jesus took hold of me. Brothers and sisters, I do not consider myself yet to have taken hold of it. But one thing I do: Forgetting what is behind and straining toward what is ahead, I press on toward the goal to win the prize for which God has called me heavenward in Christ Jesus.” (Philippians 3:12-14 NIV)

2. The aspect of ministry: To serve in the church is to serve with our (ministers') own lives. The ministers need to nurture and assist the congregations to live out the lives with being thankful for everything, not ceasing praying and staying joyful always in a systematic way. The first and most important thing, in my opinion, would be teaching the Bible through sermon, Bible study and apply these into daily life. Theological education provides theological training so the ministers are able to help the congregations learning the truth in the Bible, describe the needs of the congregations and provide what they need.
3. The aspect of theology: One of the important gifts of Holy Spirit is to describe all spirits. A minister who is nurtured and knows abundantly in theology understands that theology is the knowledge of God. To be able to know the trinity God is to be able to provide the right way to interpret the Bible and teach the congregations how to apply it. Theology is the important foundation of knowing the truth. In order to present the value of the truth, assist the congregations think about their own problems and provide the thoughts of how to face the hardship in the life with God's words, ministers need to work hard in the fields of theology.
4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?
A: There are lots of impacts happening in the daily life. Many incidents happened recently in Taiwan which were the followings: The Sunflower movement, serial killer in Taipei MRT, Taiwanese business men threatened in Vietnam and so on. I am expecting that theological education provides the training of having the ministers be able to help the congregations think more about God's wills in these social incidents and also assist the congregations to have theological reflections by facing all kinds of different situations of the country, society and in their careers.
5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?
A: There are more and more females would like to have theological training. I hope that theological education can provide more female opinions and opportunities of having theological conversations between genders. I also look forward that theological education can provide the resources of female opinions to the male clergies for them to learn, recognize and have empathy to female clergies.

Interviewee: Yvonne

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: I used to work in advertisement industry. In the busy working schedule, although this job is really interesting to me, I also feel this job is lacking of being meaningful. For instance, I need to work day and night for encouraging people to buy more junk food? In those busy days, I asked myself one question: if I got killed by overwork, will I regret? The answer for this question is definitely “yes!” Therefore, I started to search: “what is the thing worthy me to spend the rest of my life to get involved?” Because a special opportunity, I attended the mission trip to Sumatera, Indonesia hosted by Taiwan Theological Seminary. In this nine-day mission trip, I followed the local missionaries and serve the people there with the pastors and seminarians from Taiwan. One day, in the afternoon, we went to visit an old person in the village and this elder cried because he was touched by our cares and services. I was so touched by seeing this and speechless. Even I grew up in a church setting, I realized that I had taken my Christian belief granted and even become the decoration of my life. I found that there are so many people do not get a chance to hear the gospels and know about God’s love. Since that day, I pray to God: “Dear Lord, please forgive me for being selfish for a long time and use the gifts You gave me to satisfy myself. Lord, please use me to pass out the gospels and prepare me to serve You.” Hence, I quit my job after this mission trip and enrolled the seminary to be trained for serving Him.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: After I graduated from seminary, I worked in a Christian non-profit organization for one year and then I was sent to a church in the country side located in the west middle part of Taiwan. As a female grew up in a big city, I am exiting and also a challenge to ministering a church in the country side. The differences between living in the country side and big city are the life pace in the country side is not as fast as the big cities, the congregations in the country side are not used to have meetings or the curriculum with lecture style, they pay lots of attention on human’s relationship and the way they talk is straight to the point and so on. What makes me feel happy is their pure and simple faith; however, what made me feel tiring are the differences of my background and theirs. I always feel that I could not truly understand and experience what they feel including happiness, angers, sadness or joy.

I do not want to waste the energy I have put in my ministry so I decided to be ordained in this church after praying for half year. I want to continue following God and

dedicate myself in this church and this community to express the good news.

Regarding to the role of female minister, this church is open to have a female minister because one of the elders' daughter is also a minister in other church. However, the residents of this community are more curious about me due to I am a single female minister. I had experienced sexual harassments verbally in visiting the residents of the community and so on. Therefore, I think to be a single female pastor, I have to be careful and pay more attention on my security and set up the boundary with other people.

In summary, to me, the biggest challenge is to overcome the differences of the background rather than being a female single pastor in my experiences of the ministry. The advantages of my characters is careful, a good listener and company. My disadvantages are lacking of charisma and self-esteem. After got involved into my ministry for seven years, the relationship between me and congregations is more like families. I also feel the relationships are building through being company and learning, reconciling and staying with each other in God's love.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: The precious lesson I learned from seminary is "the attitude of life-long learning" or "a teachable heart." After two to three years fully involving the ministry, I felt that I do need to learn more in order to provide good services. However, thinking realistically, it is impossible for me to just leave my congregation and ministry and fully concentrate on learning for another two to three years. Therefore, the habit of self-learning I have had since in seminary has become great help for me in the ministry. These habits are like keep reading books, attending seminars or workshop and so on. In addition, the rigorous attitude in paying attention on the Scriptures, the words of God, I learned from theological education also helped me laying good foundation in preparing the sermons and the Bible study.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: If I could start over and study again in the seminary, I expect that the seminary could be more like "monastery." The reason is because I realized that the ministers do need to have a healthy life after I got involved into ministry for years. The healthy life I meant here is including a regular schedule and healthy relationship with self, others and God. Taiwanese churches are all involved in a society that pursues efficiency and bustle. Without our consciousness, the churches has become to be more like

another place to pursue good grades or numbers instead of being a place to accept people's weakness and have people encounter God's love. Furthermore, the ministers become more like a CEO in a company arranging different kinds of ministry plans and sacrifice their health to have good results instead of being a spiritual directors and spending time to keep self and others company for walking through the journey of life-complement.

I expect that the life in the seminary could have seminarians to experience "the monastic life." This does not mean to have a special kind of monastic life with some special rules. The monastic life I meant here is to have balance between work and rest, a simple life style, a life to have time and space to stay with self and a life to spend time to walk and live with God. It would help the ministers to serve the Lord longer and walk further if they could have a life style of "Action in contemplation, contemplation in action" when they studied in the seminary.

(The reason why I have these thoughts is because I almost burned out in the past years by involving ministries and I realized that I do not know how to treat myself well. After a spiritual retreat, I finally started to walk on the journey of reconciling with myself and my life and ministries got restored and my life walked toward to the complement and become thriving.)

5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: In Taiwan, the church is an epitome of the society. How the society respect women also reflect in the attitude of respecting female clergies in the church setting. After work in the society and serving in the ministry, I found that the attitude of female employees (includes clergies) in Presbyterian Church of Taiwan is really behind compare to the Taiwanese society. For instance, the female clergy ministering in the same church with her husband, the committees in the church treat them as "buy one get one free." Even more, the minister couple in the same church can only get one pay in the mega size churches which attitude is proud of it.

Therefore, instead of talking about the improvement of theological education for assisting the theological training of female clergies, I would suggest that the seminary needs to become "a leading sheep for the churches" and working on the ideological education of gender-equality and treat the female employees and clergies with fair and respect attitudes.

If the churches are able to establish a healthy relationship between genders and

respect each other, this behavior could lead the society toward to the respect of both genders. Then, we will not need to have a special training program for “female” clergies.

Interviewee: Faith

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?
A: a. In the hard time of my life, I encountered God. I changed my value and dedicate myself to God because of knowing God’s salvation.
b. I grew up in a Christian family and have attended and served in all kinds of services and meetings in the church. I feel joyful and passionate. The fellowships which are my spiritual families in Christ have helped me a lot.
c. I long to know God more and enthusiastic in getting involved in anything about “God.” I realized the needs through serving God in the ministries. Therefore, I enrolled seminary and prepare myself for serving Him more in the future.
2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)
A: 2003.09-2006.06 M. Div. in Taiwan Theological College and Seminary
2006.07-2010.04 Ministered along at Shih-Shin Presbyterian Church,
Chia-Yi Presbyteries, PCT
Church size: about 25 people of congregation
This is a church in the country side.
2010.05-2014.12 Joined the minister team (one senior pastor and one youth pastor)
at Gon-Guan Presbyterian Church, Taipei Chih-Shin Presbyteries, PCT
Minister this church as a youth pastor (ministering children, teenagers, youth and young adults)
Church size: about 200 people of congregation
This is a church in the capital of Taiwan.
(1) The advantage and disadvantage of female pastors:
 - a. Advantage: Based on my experiences in both churches, there is no big difference for female pastors in the ministries. Female pastors are able to care deeper needs of female congregations. However, for the needs of male congregations, female pastors need the assistances of other male colleagues. It is easier for female pastors to be the peace makers.
 - b. Disadvantages: Because of my personality, I felt the lack of assertiveness and

the ability of perform well under the pressure. I think that I need to learn how to speak the truth in love and not afraid to say words offense people.

(2) Personal reflection according to my experiences in different churches

	The church in the country side	The church in a city
Congregations	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. They have pure hearts, straight forward, but do not have self-confidence 2. Lower education 3. Lack of leadership and manage ability but willing to cooperate 4. Poor financial ability 5. Focus on relationship 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Individualism, holding own opinions, high self-esteem 2. Higher education 3. Strong ability to lead and design projects, be able to search more resources, but lack of actions because of too many opinions 4. Good financial ability 5. Value ministries with its efficiency and benefits 6. Focus on ability
Church Organization	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Minister-centered. The pastors have to assist the congregations to have autonomy 2. The ministries of the church are hard to be set up without the pastors. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Works for details. If there is lacking of communication, it is easy to work on them but not connect to the goal that it was set. 2. The ministries will keep going without a pastor.
Challenges	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Lack of people who can work with pastors. 2. It is not easy to spread out the 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Working in a team with other pastors, I need to learn how to

	<p>gospel due to the folk religions are majority. It takes time to build up the long term relationships in order to convert people to Christians.</p> <p>3. Lacking of the motivation of being willing to be changed.</p>	<p>communicate and face the issues with the clergy colleagues when I have different opinions.</p> <p>2. How to help my congregation to become mature in their spiritual life but not just nurture them with the “knowledge” and not being changed in their lives.</p> <p>3. I also need to adjust my attitude as an assistant pastor and learn how to be obedient to the authority from the church.</p> <p>4. I need to learn how to seek or ask for help if my work loading is over what I could stand.</p>
What I learned	<p>1. The importance of working as a team: Christ is the head of the church. Everyone in the church is part of the body of Christ and connected to Him so all of us could grow up in love.</p> <p>2. People is the one we are serving, not ministries: It is just like Jesus who notices the needs of people and cares people’s hearts. It is only through our own actions of care to make people could experience the love from God.</p>	

	<p>3. How to find the balance in the relationship between God and people.</p> <p>4. Learning from Jesus: Jesus spends time with God and he also live with his disciples.</p> <p>5. Spend time with God: this is the foundation and assurance of ministry. To practice the belief into life and make it becomes real. Love is not just through words but actions.</p> <p>6. The health of the pastors influences the growth of the church.</p> <p>I learned how to manage my time with personal life and ministries. I set up a time of Sabbath every week and a period for personal retreat every year so I could be restored by God.</p>
--	---

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: (1) To face the ministries and teachings with a wide vision

(2) In many contemporary issues, theological education helped me to think through with a whole view, not just follow what most people's opinions but look at the Bible what is the truth of God has taught us.

(3) The Biblical and homiletic courses helped me the most.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: *Restore personal life and knowing self (inner healing courses)

*The teaching of practical theology: how to face and respond the contemporary issues

*The relationships between pastors: how to face the conflicts, how to set up a healthy and prosper boundary among the pastors

*To enhance pastors' leadership

*To know the Trinity God more: such as the practices and experiences of spirituality

5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: I am still considering about this question....

Honest speaking, I did not encounter the issue of the gender differences in my ministries. I think that this is because that I did not emphasize that I am a “female” pastor. However, it is more challenging for me to minister a church as a single than a female clergy. Thank God that because of my major is science related; I am trained to be independent and rational. It is also I am nurtured to have feminine characters so I have emotional and soft views when I think and make commands. These are what in my mind right now.

Interviewee: Lily

Questions :

1. Why did you decide to go to seminary? What made you to go to seminary?

A: *I love Jesus. I long to dedicate my life to be a pastor and learn how to practice my Christian belief into life and be a disciple of Lord Jesus. I am the first person converted to a Christian in my family so I hope to bring the good news into my family and have my families and relatives to be Christians. I am so willing to represent my family and dedicate myself to God. In addition, when the timing is right, Holy Spirit just pushed me in my heart. I am also longing to be prepared with theological education.

*After I got baptized, I used to work in social welfare agency working in special education for ten years. During these years, I realized that God creates lives amazingly and human beings’ understandings of lives are so limited. In all kinds of work that helps people, I found the most joyful in leading people to know Lord Jesus and have they become the disciples of Him. I learned the theories and skills of special education to help children learn how to take care of themselves and being company with the children and youth in needs in my work. Through these experiences, I got to learn the needs of each family. Their needs are not only getting the help and support from the staffs and social workers in the organizations but also getting from the government and society where they can get the medical cares and the supports of social benefits and special education. In my ten-year working experiences, I found that this kind of “loving and caring” jobs request the love from Jesus Christ in order to provide the strength to “love” continually. Where does love come from? Love comes from God. When I shared the good news, talking about the Bible and pray for these families which have the children in special needs, I also shared my testimonies to my boss, supervisors and colleagues. I realized that what I knew about the Bible is not enough. I want to spend more time to worship God,

pray and for personal devotions so I could focus on caring the souls that Jesus cares, listening to the guidance of Holy Spirit and understanding the work of God. After working for ten years in this organization, it is clearer to me that I want to work for caring people. After I talked and consulted to the clergy in my church, I decided to quit my job in this organization and enrolled the seminary.

2. Could you share your experiences as a woman in your contexts and a female clergy in the church settings? (Benefits? Difficulties? Advantages and disadvantages?)

A: I am a single female pastor and ministering a church alone. I was sent by Presbyterian Church of Taiwan in August, 2006 to one local church, Chian-Jin Presbyterian church in Kaohsiung, which is located in a big city with a size of 350 congregations. I worked as an assistant minister and with a senior pastor which is 67 years old in this church. My job in this church is to preach on Sundays, take care of outreach ministries and lead the meetings in weekdays and care about the congregations. The senior pastor I was working with was about retiring (he had ministered this church over 20 years). Therefore, there was a committee for searching a pastor and one of the committee members, also an elder, told me that I have to retire with the senior pastor since we are working as a team. This happened after six month I had served in this church. The next September, the committee hired a male pastor to join the team and his job is to preach on Sundays and work as an educational minister. I was qualified to be a pastor in January, 2009 and got ordained in October, 2009 as a pastor who in taking cares of the outreach ministries in the community. Because of the retirement of the senior pastor, my ministry in this church was also ended in August, 2010. I was sent to another local church, Hui-Ming Presbyterian Church which belongs to So-shan presbyteries, and become the first pastor in this church. I have ministered this church since then. To compare with the differences in my both ministries:

- ◎ To work as a team in the ministry, I found that the colleagues are all received theological education and trained and prepared for following Jesus Christ and working for God's kingdom. We were benefitted each other by the messages we had delivered. In this team work, we respected each other and worked together to testify and glorify God's name. I just focused on the vision that the senior pastor received and leaded the elders and deacons and the core workers of every fellowships and small groups. Three of us work as a team and delivered the messages to each fellowship group, in different services including wedding and funeral, and the three services on Sundays. In addition, I also had to take care of

the old people, women and children in the community. I was able to apply my female characters and built up the relationships with everyone, especial the old people liked me a lot. In my busy working schedule, the most fun and stressful challenge is to have personal devotional time and prepare a fantastic sermon.

© When I went to the next church and minister it by myself, I found that each elder and deacon has different level of spirituality and hold different concepts of managements or leadership. I received the vision and set up a goal and built up the new management and leadership. I started from praying and having devotional time with the elders and deacons and built up their spiritualities. I set up the small groups and have them connect with each other. I lead the elders and deacons to build up the core worker team of the church. I preach the Bible systematically and with well-planned schedule so I can help the church be like a school of spirituality. These are what I never thought about and did not get a chance to do when I worked in the first church.

© The most difficulty or challenge for a single female pastor to minister a church along is: the elders and deacons are all holding the thoughts that they are leaded by male pastor. To transform this concepts to “be leaded by female pastor” takes time to be inspired by Holy Spirit and learn the lesson of being obedience. Another challenge is that the dormitory and the bathroom that provided by the church to ministers are lacking of privacy and independent space, especially lacking of the sensitivity and attention on the security and privacy for female ministers. The elders and deacons are holding the key of the church so they can come in whenever they want. This is also seriously affected the family and personal life of the ministers.

3. How does theological education have an impact for you, regarding your spirituality, ministry or theology? Which part would you think it has benefitted you the most?

A: Theological education made me understand more that to do theology is to learn how to be like Jesus Christ, God’s only and beloved son. “Since all have sinned and fall short of the glory of God,” we cannot save ourselves and also others. It is only through Jesus Christ, the scapegoat, I could come to God and value my live. I learned that to serve God is more than to rely on my ability and knowledge and provide what I have. It is to reflect my deed and see if it pleases God. Before I received theological education, I never think about what are the differences in between. I used to teach in Sunday school and be the supervisor of youth fellowship with my passion of loving the Lord and shallow acknowledge of management. My thought was I am

good as long as I serve God at the church. However, I found that what I could do is limited and the more I serve God at the church, the weaker I realize for myself so I need God to help me to see how He can make wonderful things happen.

The most helpful part for me personally in theological education is that learning how to mentor and counsel those people hurt spiritually and mentally with comforting, encouraging and contributing words. It is not only to clarify the problems that they are having but to look at and face the problems in their life. Sins make us cannot represent the beautiful images that God has put inside of us so we get hurt and hurt people easily. I found that the only fundamental solution for this issue is to bring people to know Jesus Christ. I am the testimony who experienced the healing first so I could share my experience to others.

4. What kind of assistants do you expect to receive from theological education according to your experiences?

A: To provide a very active and flexible theological education. I am expecting that theological education can free people from many different frames and have everyone learn to know Jesus, the Bible and trinity God correctly with a joyful heart.

To provide the teaching skills on how to do theological education to people in different ages and different contexts, such as constructors, labors, cleaning persons, and the disciple training for children, youth and young adult who are students.

5. What would you advise theological educators in seminary to improve in order to have theological education provide the needs for female clergies after they involved in the ministry?

A: To teach and practice what is the proper outfit for female clergies
How to plan and arrange our finances based on Biblical value/views.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- American Institute in Taiwan. "Taiwan 2013 International Religious Freedom." American Institute in Taiwan. Last modified July 29, 2014. Accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509180423/http://www.ait.org.tw/en/officialtext-ot1407.html>.
- Bank, Robert. *Reenvisioning Theological Education: Exploring a Missional Alternative to Current Models*. Grand Rapids, MI: W. B. Eerdmans Publishing, 1999.
- Bear, Mark, Barry W. Connors, and Michael A. Paradiso. *Neuroscience: Exploring the Brain*. 3rd ed. Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott Williams & Wilkins, 2007.
- Belenky, Mary Field, Blythe McVicker Clinchy, Nancy Rule Goldberger, and Jill Mattuck Tarule. *Women's Ways of Knowing: The Development of Self, Voice, and Mind*. 10th Anniversary ed. New York: Basic Books, 1997.
- Bluhm, Robyn, Anne Jaap Jacobson and Heidi Lene Maibom, eds. *Neurofeminism: Issues at the Intersection of Feminist Theory and Cognitive Science*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
- Brown, Lyn Mikel, and Carol Gilligan. *Meeting at the Crossroads: Women's Psychology and Girls' Development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1992.
- Chen Wen Shan. 台灣本土婦女神學初探[Primary Research of Taiwanese Local Feminist Theology]. Taipei, Taiwan: 永望文化事業有限公司, 2002.
- Cameron, Julia. *The Artist's Way: A Spiritual Path to Higher Creativity*. New York: J.P. Tarcher/ Putnam, 1996.
- Chodorow, Nancy. *The Reproduction of Mothering: Psychoanalysis and the Sociology of Gender*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979.
- Chopp, Rebecca S. *Saving Work: Feminist Practices of Theological Education*. Louisville, KY: Westminster John Knox Press, 1995.
- Cohen, Lisa J. *The Handy Psychology Answer Book*. Canton, MI: Visible Ink Press, 2011.
- Conn, Joann Wolski, ed. *Women's Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development*. 1st. ed. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1986.
- _____. *Women's Spirituality: Resources for Christian Development*. 2nd. ed. Mahwah, NJ: Paulist Press, 1996.
- _____. *Spirituality and Personal Maturity*. New York: Paulist Press, 1989.
- Corbin, Barry. *Unleashing the Potential of the Teenage Brain: 10 Powerful Ideas*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press, 2008.

- Creswell, John W. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Traditions*. 1st. ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 1998.
- Davison, Gary Marvin and Barbara E. Reed. *Culture and Customs of Taiwan*. Westport, CN.: Greenwood Press, 1998.
- Denzin, Norman K. *Interpretive Biography*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, 1989.
- _____. *Interpretive Interactionism*. 2nd. ed. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 2001.
- Edel, Leon. *Writing Lives: Principia Biographica*. New York: Norton, 1984.
- Evangelism Committee of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. "Continuing Education and Training for Evangelists." 台灣基督長老教會傳道委員會[Evangelism Committee of The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan]. Accessed May 9, 2016, https://web.archive.org/web/20160509182012/http://www.pct.org.tw/ab_eva.aspx.
- Fine, Cordelia. *Delusions of Gender: How Our Minds, Society, and Neurosexism Create Difference*. New York: W. W. Norton, 2010.
- Fowler, James W. *Stages of Faith: The Psychology of Human Development and the Quest for Meaning*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1981.
- Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Translated by Myra Bergman Ramos. 1970. Reprint. New York: Seabury Press, 1974.
- Freire, Paulo & Ira Shor. *A Pedagogy for Liberation: Dialogues on Transforming Education*. South Hadley, MA: Bergin, 1987.
- Garcia, Jo, and Sara Maitland. *Walking on the Water: Women Talk about Spirituality*. London: Virago, 1983.
- Gilligan, Carol. *In A Different Voice: Psychological Theory and Women's Development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1993.
- _____. *Joining the Resistance*. Cambridge, UK: Polity Press, 2011.
- Goldberger, Nancy, Jill Tarule, Blythe Clinchy, and Mary Belenky, eds. *Knowledge, Difference, and Power: Essays Inspired by Women's Ways of Knowing*. New York: Basic Books, 1996.
- Greer, Germaine. *The Obstacle Race: The Fortunes of Women Painters and Their Work*. New York: Farrar, Straus, Giroux, 1979.
- Harris, Maria. *Teaching and Religious Imagination: An Essay in The Theology of Teaching*. San Francisco: Harper & Row, 1987.
- _____. *Women and Teaching: Themes for a Spirituality of Pedagogy*. New York: Paulist Press, 1988.
- _____. *Dance of the Spirit: Seven Steps of Women's Spirituality*. New York: Bantam Books, 1991.

- Hayes, Elisabeth, and Daniele D. Flannery; with Ann K. Brooks, Elizabeth J. Tisdell, and Jane M. Hugo. *Women as Learners: The Significance of Gender in Adult Learning*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers, 2000.
- Herman, William E. "Values Acquisition and Moral Development: An integration of Freudian, Eriksonian, Kohlbergian and Gilliganian Viewpoints." Education Resources Information Center. Last modified July 24, 2005. Accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509173243/http://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/ED490607.pdf>.
- Hines, Melissa. *Brain Gender*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2004.
- Jordan, Judith V., Alexandra G. Kaplan, Jean Baker Miller, Irene P. Stiver, and Janet L. Surrey. *Women's Growth in Connection: Writings from the Stone Center*. New York: Guilford Press, 1991.
- _____. *Women's Growth in Diversity: More Writings from the Stone Center*. New York: Guilford Press, 1997.
- Kegan, Robert. *In Over Our Heads: The Mental Demands of Modern Life*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1994.
- _____. *The Evolving Self: Problem and Process in Human Development*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press London, 1982.
- Kegan, Robert, and Lisa Laskow Lahey. *How the Way We Talk Can Change the Way We Work: Seven Languages for Transformation*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 2001.
- Kwok Pui-Lian. *Chinese Women and Christianity, 1860-1927*. Atlanta, GA.: Scholars Press, 1992.
- _____. *Introducing Asian Feminist Theology*. Cleveland, OH: The Pilgrim Press, 2000.
- Livsey, Rachel C., in collaboration with Parker J. Palmer. *The Courage to Teach: A Guide for Reflection and Renewal*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass, 1999.
- Miller, Jean Baker. *Toward a New Psychology of Women*. 2nd. ed. Boston, MA: Beacon Press, 1986.
- Mildner, Vesna. *The Cognitive Neuroscience of Human Communication*. New York: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2008.
- Ministry of Interior, Taiwan Government. "Monthly Bulletin of Interior Statistics." 台灣內政部統計處 [Department of Statistic in Ministry of Interior, Taiwan Government]. Last modified January 10, 2015. Accessed May 9, 2016, <https://web.archive.org/web/20160509180255/http://sowf.moi.gov.tw/stat/month/list.htm>.

- Moessner, Jeanne Stevenson, ed. *In Her Own Time: Women and Developmental Issues in Pastoral Care*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2000.
- Moore, Mary Elizabeth Mullino. *Teaching from the Heart: Theology and Educational Method*. Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 1991.
- Moustakas, Clark. *Phenomenological Research Methods*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 1994.
- Nelson, Charles A., Michelle de Haan and Kathleen M. Thomas. *Neuroscience of Cognitive Development: The Role of Experience and the Developing Brain*. Hoboken, NJ: John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 2006.
- Oduyoye, Mercy Amba. *Introducing African Women's Theology*. Sheffield, England: Sheffield Academic Press, 2001.
- Polkinghorne, Donald E. "Phenomenological Research Methods." In *Existential-Phenomenological Perspectives in Psychology*, edited by Ronald S. Valle and Steen Halling. New York: Plenum, 1989.
- Purves, Dale, George J. Augustine, David Fitzpatrick, William C. Hall, Anthony-Samuel LaMantia, and Leonard E. White, eds. *Neuroscience*. 5th ed. Sunderland, MA: Sinauer Associates, 2012.
- Restak, Richard M. *The Secret Life of the Brain*. Washington, DC: Co-publication of the Dana Press and Joseph Henry Press, 2001.
- Richards, Lyn. *Handling Qualitative Data: A Practical Guide*. London: Sage Publications, 2006.
- Sattler, Cheryl L. *Teaching to Transcend: Educating Women against Violence*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2000.
- Siegel, Daniel J.. *The Mindful Brain: Reflection and Attunement in the Cultivation of Well-being*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 2007.
- Smith, Laura Mazzoli. "Biographical Method." In *Handbook of Qualitative Research*, edited by N.K. Denzin and Y. S. Lincoln, 286-305. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications, 1994.
- Slee, Nicola. *Women's Faith Development: Patterns and Processes*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate Publishing, 2004.
- Swingewood, Alan. *A Short History of Sociological Thought*. 3rd ed. New York: St. Martin's Press, 2000.
- Sylwester, Robert. *The Adolescent Brain: Reaching for Autonomy*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press, 2007.
- Taiwanese Feminist Scholars Association. "Introduction." 台灣女性學學會[Taiwanese

- Feminist Scholars Association]. Accessed May 9, 2016,
<https://web.archive.org/web/20160509181130/http://twfeminist.org/modules/tadnews/index.php?nsn=5>.
- Taiwan Theological College and Seminary. "Faculty." 台灣神學院[Taiwan Theological College and Seminary]. Accessed May 9, 2016,
https://web.archive.org/web/20160509172506/http://www.taitheo.org/about_us/faculty.html.
- Taiwan Theological College and Seminary. "Welcome to a Passion for Theological Excellence." 台灣神學院[Taiwan Theological College and Seminary]. Accessed May 9, 2016,
<https://web.archive.org/web/20160509181254/http://www.taitheo.org/>.
- Taylor, Jill McLean, Carol Gilligan, and Amy M. Sullivan. *Between Voice and Silence: Women and Girls, Race and Relationship*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995.
- The Cornwall Collective. *Your Daughters Shall Prophecy: Feminist Alternatives in Theological Education*. New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1980.
- The Mud Flower Collective. *God's Fierce Whimsy: Christian Feminism and Theological Education*. New York: The Pilgrim Press, 1985.
- The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan. "Rule of Law for Ordination." 台灣基督長老教會 [The Presbyterian Church in Taiwan]. Accessed May 9, 2016,
<https://web.archive.org/web/20160509181418/http://www.pct.org.tw/ByLaws.aspx?LID=1011>.